

#### External Intervention and the Politics of State Formation

China, Indonesia, and Thailand, 1893-1952

This book explores ways in which foreign intervention and external rivalries can affect the institutionalisation of governance in weak states. When sufficiently competitive, foreign rivalries in a weak state can actually foster the political centralisation, territoriality, and autonomy associated with state sovereignty. This counterintuitive finding comes from studying the collective effects of foreign contestation over weak states as informed by changes in the expected opportunity cost of intervention for outside actors. When interveners associate high opportunity costs with intervention, they bolster sovereign statehood as a next best alternative to their worst fear – domination of that polity by adversaries. Sovereign statehood develops if foreign actors concurrently and consistently behave this way toward a weak state. This book evaluates that argument against three "least-likely" cases – China, Indonesia, and Thailand between the late nineteenth and mid twentieth centuries.

Ja Ian Chong is Assistant Professor of Political Science at the National University of Singapore. He received his PhD in politics from Princeton University in 2008 and was a 2008–2009 Research Associate with the Princeton-Harvard China and the World Program. His research has received support from the Chiang Ching-kuo International Foundation for Scholarly Exchange, the Woodrow Wilson Society of Fellows, the Bradley Foundation, the Social Science Research Council, the Princeton Institute of International and Regional Studies, and the Princeton East Asian Studies Program. He has worked in the International Security Program at the Center for Strategic and International Studies in Washington, DC, as well as the Institute of Defence and Strategic Studies and the East Asian Institute in Singapore. He has previously taught at the Hong Kong University of Science and Technology. His work has appeared in *Twentieth-Century China* and *Security Studies*.



To my parents, Chong Tjee Teng and Yuan Chien, and my wife, Grace.



# External Intervention and the Politics of State Formation

China, Indonesia, and Thailand, 1893-1952

JA IAN CHONG

National University of Singapore





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107013759

© Ja Ian Chong 2012

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2012

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data Chong, Ja Ian.

External intervention and the politics of state formation: China, Indonesia, and Thailand, 1893–1952 / Ja Ian Chong.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-01375-9

State, The – Case studies.
 Political development – Case studies.
 China – Politics and government – 20th century.
 Indonesia – Politics and government – 20th century.
 Thailand – Politics and government – 20th century.
 Title.
 JC273.C585
 2012
 320.95–dc23

2012001014

ISBN 978-1-107-01375-9 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



### Contents

List of Abbreviations Acknowledgements		page vii
		ix
I	Moulding the Institutions of Governance: Theories of State Formation and the Contingency of Sovereignty in Fragile Polities	I
2	Imposing States: Foreign Rivalries, Local Collaboration, and State Form in Peripheral Polities	27
3	Feudalising the Chinese Polity, 1893–1922: Assessing the Adequacy of Alternative Takes on State Reorganisation	46
4	External Influence and China's Feudalisation, 1893–1922: Opportunity Costs and Patterns of Foreign Intervention	75
5	The Evolution of Foreign Involvement in China, 1923–1952: Rising Opportunity Costs and Convergent Approaches to Intervention	112
6	How Intervention Remade the Chinese State, 1923–1952: Foreign Sponsorship and the Building of Sovereign China	151
7	Creating Indonesia, 1893–1952: Major Power Rivalry and the Making of Sovereign Statehood	173
8	Siam Stands Apart, 1893–1952: External Intervention and Rise of a Sovereign Thai State	200
9	Domesticating International Relations, Externalising Comparative Politics: Foreign Intervention and the State in World Politics	224
	iii world rollities	224
Appendix: Questions for Focused, Structured Comparisons		237
References Index		239 279
		-//

V





## **Abbreviations**

AH Academia Historica, Taipei

AS Institute of Modern History Archives, Academia Sinica, Taipei

CCP Chinese Communist Party

FHAC First Historical Archives of China, Beijing

KMT Kuomintang (Guomindang); Chinese Nationalist Party

KMTPA Party Archives, Kuomintang Party History Committee, Taipei
 PKI Partai Komunis Indonesia; Indonesian Communist Party
 PNI Partai Nasional Indonesia; Indonesian National Party

PRCFMA PRC Foreign Ministry Archives, Beijing SHAC Second Historical Archives of China, Nanjing

Note: I use Hanyu Pinyin transliteration for Chinese except for names and terms where other transliteration methods are more popular. Examples include Chiang Kai-shek, Chiang Ching-kuo, H.H. Kung, Hong Kong, Kaohsiung, Kuomintang, Sun Yat-sen, T.V. Soong, and Taipei.





## Acknowledgements

A project of this scale incurs many debts of gratitude that are impossible to repay. I am grateful to my teachers, Thomas J. Christensen, G. John Ikenberry, Lynn T. White III, and William C. Wohlforth, for their patient mentorship, encouragement, support, and much-needed criticism. This was especially important in my graduate school environment. My intellectual development and this book owe much to their generosity and assistance. I am grateful to Chou Chih-P'ing, Steven Chung, Martin Collcutt, Benjamin Elman, Sheldon Garon, David Leheny, Susan Naquin, and Willard Peterson for welcoming me into East Asian Studies at Princeton University. As a political scientist who draws heavily from history and the humanities, the advice and experience of cross fertilisation I received at the EAS Department was especially inspiring. Special thanks must go out to Yü Ying-Shih, who took the time to guide me over particularly trying historical material. I am also grateful to the anonymous reviewers of this book and the more preliminary articles from which this volume draws.

I appreciate the invaluable help I received from so many. They include Lewis Bateman, Mark Beissinger, Janice Bially Mattern, Timothy Brook, Joshua Busby, Allen Carlson, Miguel Centeno, Chen Jian, Chen Qianping, Pei-yi Chu, Ping-Tzu Chu, Bridget Coggins, Cui Zhiqing, Wolfgang Danspeckgruber, Christopher N. Darnton, Patrick Deneen, Nicola DiCosmo, Ding Decheng, Thomas Dolan, Prasenjit Duara, Andrew S. Erickson, M. Taylor Fravel, Robert Gilpin, Scott Gregory, Todd H. Hall, Wenkai He, Yinan He, Peter Holquist, Huang Zhenping, Victoria Tin-bor Hui, Serene Hung, Alastair Iain Johnston, David Kang, Scott Kastner, Stanley Katz, Andrew B. Kennedy, Robert Keohane, Jonathan Kirshner, Koh Khee Heong, Charles Kupchan, Lai Yuyun, James Z. Lee, Seung-joon Lee, Wah Guan Lim, Liu Xiaofeng, Xiaobo Lu, Lorenz Luthi, Stephen Macedo, Michael Mastanduno, Levi McLaughlin, Kathleen McNamara, James Millward, Erik Mobrand, Andrew Moravscik, Terry Nardin, Daniel Nexon, Ong Chang Woei, John Owen, Philip Pettit, Peter Purdue, Qi Xuemin, Eri Saikawa, Wayne Soon, Hendrik Spruyt, Brent Strathman, Robert Sutter, Stephen Teiser, Peter Trubowitz, Nancy Bernkopf Tucker, Wang Gungwu, Wang Xiaoyun, Yuan-Kang Wang, Brantly Womack,



X

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-01375-9 - External Intervention and the Politics of State Formation: China, Indonesia, and Thailand, 1893–1952 Ja Ian Chong Frontmatter More information

Acknowledgements

Thomas Wright, Wu Liwei, Xiao Wu, Xin Xu, Dali Yang, David Yang, Yang Lijun, Rur-bin Yang, Min Ye, Feng Zhang, and Zheng Yongnian. They graciously provided important comments, advice, and other forms of professional assistance – sometimes on several occasions. I am grateful to the late Charles Tilly for sharing his thoughts on this project at its inception. All mistakes and inadequacies in the work are solely my own.

My graduate student colleagues played a critical role in aiding me along the process in countless ways. These comrades include Asli Bali, Pamela Bromley, Barbara Buckinx, Arudra Burra, Ian Chapman, Eric Dinmore, Chunmei Du, Paul Eason, Maren Ehlers, Yulia Frumer, Katie Gallagher, Matteo Giglioli, Hu Jun, April Hughes, Esther P. Klein, Li Yaqin, Jennifer Lieb, Hsueh-Yi Lin, John Lombardini, Bryan Lowe, Mao Sheng, Quinton Mayne, Christopher Mayo, Mark Meulenbeld, Rachel Beatty Reidl, Prerna Singh, Brigid Vance, Ian Ward, James Wilson, Lanjun Xu, Ye Minlei, Evan Young, Ya Zuo, and so many others. I was fortunate to have so many fellow travellers to run ideas against and help bring good cheer to what otherwise could be an isolating process. Fellows at the Princeton-Harvard China and the World Program as well as participants of the China and the World Workshop, East Asian Studies Colloquium, Cracked Pot, Woodrow Wilson Fellows Seminar, and the international relations seminar at Princeton were also key resources for me.

This project would not have been possible without the generosity of the Bradley Foundation, Chiang Ching-kuo Foundation for International Scholarly Exchange, Hong Kong Research Grants Council, Institute for Qualitative Research Methods, Princeton East Asian Studies Programme, Princeton-Harvard China and the World Program, Princeton Institute for International and Regional Studies, Princeton University Graduate School, Social Science Research Council, and Woodrow Wilson Circle of Fellows. I am also grateful for library support from Martin Heijdra at the Gest East Asian Library at Princeton University; Geographic Information System assistance from Tsering Wangyal Shawa and Isaac Low; and administrative aid from Rita Alpaugh, Richard Chafey, Hue Kim Su, Danette Rivera, and Timothy Waldron. Archivists at the Academia Historica, Academia Sinica Institute of Modern History, First Historical Archives of China, Kuomintang Party History Committee, and Second Historical Archives of China provided valuable advice on the use of their materials. Thanks also go to Security Studies, Ohio State University Press, the Taylor and Francis Group, and Twentieth-Century China for giving me permission to use material from articles I published with them.

I owe my family special appreciation for their unwavering support during this very extended process. To my parents, Chong Tjee Teng and Yuan Chien, my wife, Grace, as well as Nathan and Ethan, thank you all for being there and bearing with me. I am also grateful to my uncle, Chong Chi Tat, for all his help and guidance. It is indeed my good fortune to have such understanding people around me. To anyone I inadvertently missed – thank you.