SEARCHING FOR A 'PRINCIPLE OF HUMANITY' IN INTERNATIONAL HUMANITARIAN LAW

The legal norms of international humanitarian law (IHL) are the product of a compromise between humanitarian considerations and the demands of military necessity. In Searching for a 'Principle of Humanity' in International Humanitarian Law, international legal scholars consider whether humanitarian considerations have an independent legal impact on IHL beyond the formation of these norms. They ask whether a 'principle of humanity' can be said to have legal force in its own right. Moreover, the book investigates whether regional or national differences are emerging regarding the import and emphasis placed on humanitarian considerations. For instance, do states which are not directly affected by armed conflict attach a greater weight to humanitarian considerations when interpreting and applying IHL than those states which are more directly involved in armed conflicts? Specifically, this book examines whether a particular 'Nordic perspective' can be identified, owing to those states' unique perspective on international conflicts since the Second World War.

KJETIL MUJEZINOVIĆ LARSEN is Associate Professor at the Norwegian Centre for Human Rights, University of Oslo. He is also author of *The Human Rights Treaty Obligations of Peacekeepers*.

CAMILLA GULDAHL COOPER is Legal Adviser and Lecturer at the Norwegian Defence Command and Staff College.

GRO NYSTUEN is Associate Professor at the Norwegian Defence University College and Senior Partner in the International Law and Policy Institute, Oslo. She is also co-editor of *Human Rights, Corporate Complicity and Disinvestment*.

SEARCHING FOR A 'PRINCIPLE OF HUMANITY' IN INTERNATIONAL HUMANITARIAN LAW

Editors

KJETIL MUJEZINOVIĆ LARSEN, CAMILLA GULDAHL COOPER AND GRO NYSTUEN



> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107021846

© Cambridge University Press 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2013

Printed and bound in Great Britain by MPG Books Group

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Searching for a 'principle of humanity' in international humanitarian law / editors Kjetil Mujezinović Larsen, Camilla Guldahl Cooper & Gro Nystuen. p. cm. Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 978-1-107-02184-6 (hardback) 1. Humanitarian law. I. Larsen, Kjetil Mujezinović, 1976– II. Cooper, Camilla Guldahl. III. Nystuen, Gro. KZ6471.S43 2012 341.6'7-dc23 2012018830

ISBN 978-1-107-02184-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

CONTENTS

List of tables	vii	
Notes on contributors		viii
List of abbreviations		xi

 Introduction by the editors: is there a 'principle of humanity' in international humanitarian law? 1
 KJETIL MUJEZINOVIĆ LARSEN, CAMILLA GULDAHL COOPER AND GRO NYSTUEN

PART I Theoretical perspectives 21

- The main epochs of modern international humanitarian law since 1864 and their related dominant legal constructions 23
 ROBERT KOLB
- 3 The principle of proportionality 72 YORAM DINSTEIN
- The Geneva Conventions and the dichotomy between international and non-international armed conflict: curse or blessing for the 'principle of humanity'?
 86 CECILIE HELLESTVEIT
- 5 A 'principle of humanity' or a 'principle of human-rightism'? 124
 KJETIL MUJEZINOVIĆ LARSEN
- 6 The principle of humanity in the development of 'special protection' for children in armed conflict: 60 years beyond the Geneva Conventions and 20 years beyond the Convention on the Rights of the Child 149 KATARINA MÅNSSON

Cambridge University Press	
978-1-107-02184-6 - Searching for a 'Principle of Humanity' in International Humanitarian La	N
Edited by Kjetil Mujezinović Larsen, Camilla Guldahl Cooper and Gro Nystuen	
Frontmatter	
More information	

vi CONTENTS PART II Nordic experiences 181 7 Military occupation of Eastern Karelia by Finland in 1941–1944: was international law pushed aside? 183 LAURI HANNIKAINEN 8 The occupied and the occupier: the case of Norway 206 SIGRID REDSE IOHANSEN 9 Multinational peace operations forces involved in armed conflict: who are the parties? 233 OLA ENGDAHL 10 Security detention in UN peace operations 272 PETER VEDEL KESSING 11 Humanity and the discourse of legality 304 RIKKE ISHØY 12 Implementation in practice: 60 years of dissemination and other implementation efforts from a Norwegian perspective 319 ARNE WILLY DAHL AND CAMILLA GULDAHL COOPER Conclusions 347 PART III 13 Conclusions: is there a 'principle of humanity' in international humanitarian law? 349 KJETIL MUJEZINOVIĆ LARSEN AND CAMILLA GULDAHL COOPER Index 358

LIST OF TABLES

10.1 Overview of targeting and detention standards in IHL (IAC) and IHRL 280
10.2 Overview of detention review standards in IHL and IHRL 296

NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

ARNE WILLY DAHL is Judge Advocate General for the Norwegian armed forces. He has previously worked for the State Pollution Control Authority in Oslo, and as a lecturer in public and military law at the Military Academy. In 1986 he became Judge Advocate and two years later became Judge Advocate General. Since 2006 he has been President of the International Society for Military Law and the Law of War.

YORAM DINSTEIN is Professor Emeritus at Tel-Aviv University. He is a former President of the University (1991–1998), as well as former Rector and former Dean of the Faculty of Law. He served twice as the Charles H. Stockton Professor of International Law at the US Naval War College in Newport, Rhode Island. He was also a Humboldt Fellow at the Max Planck Institute of International Law in Heidelberg, Germany, a Meltzer Visiting Professor of Law at New York University and a Visiting Professor of Law at the University of Toronto. He is a Member of the Institute of International Law.

OLA ENGDAHL is Associate Professor at the Swedish National Defence College. His main research areas are international humanitarian law and human rights law, including international law aspects on peace operations. He has served as Legal Adviser in the SFOR operation in Bosnia-Herzegovina and as an adviser on international law at the Ministry of Foreign Affairs. He is also a Member of the Delegation for International Humanitarian Law Monitoring of Arms Projects, and Legal Adviser on the Army Tactical Staff. His previous publications include *Protection of Personnel in Peace Operations*.

CAMILLA GULDAHL COOPER is Legal Adviser and Lecturer at the Norwegian Defence Command and Staff College, where she works on the development of a Norwegian Manual of the Law of Armed Conflict. She teaches operational law at all levels in the Armed Forces, including soldiers, at the Army War College and at the Command and Staff College.

viii

NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

ix

Camilla has also taught several specialised courses, such as the US Navy ILOMO course in Newport, Rhode Island, in 2010, and the Vienna Course on International Law for Military Legal Advisers in 2011 and 2012. In 2011, she deployed as a military legal adviser to ISAF.

LAURI HANNIKAINEN is Professor Emeritus of International Law at the University of Turku, Finland. He is a member of the European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI) at the Council of Europe. He has written extensively on human rights and humanitarian law, and previous publications include *Peremptory Norms (Jus Cogens) in International Law: History, Criteria, Present Status.*

CECILIE HELLESTVEIT is a special adviser with the International Law and Policy Institute (ILPI), Oslo. She is also affiliated with the University of Oslo, where she is finalising a dissertation on humanitarian law in non-international armed conflict. In 2009, Cecilie served as international rapporteur to the International Society for Military Law and the Law of War, co-editing the XVIII Recueil. She has previously worked at the Norwegian Centre for Human Rights, and the Peace Research Institute, Oslo (PRIO).

RIKKE ISHØY works as a legal adviser, coordinator of protection activities and deputy head of delegation for the International Committee of the Red Cross with whom she has worked in Israel and the Occupied Territories, Afghanistan, Lebanon, Ethiopia and Liberia. Whilst writing her chapter, Rikke worked for a period for the Copenhagen Police as a prosecutor.

ROBERT KOLB is Professor of Public International Law at the University of Geneva. He has worked as legal adviser at the International Committee of the Red Cross from 1998 to 1999 and occasionally for the International Law Directorate of the Swiss Federal Department of Foreign Affairs.

KJETIL MUJEZINOVIĆ LARSEN is Associate Professor at the Norwegian Centre for Human Rights, University of Oslo, where he teaches human rights law and international humanitarian law. His research experience includes human rights law, international humanitarian law, and general international law (particularly the responsibility of international organisations). Kjetil's previous publications include *The Human Rights Treaty Obligations of Peacekeepers*. He is a former member of the Council of Europe's Working Group on Missing Persons, and of the Advisory Committee on International Humanitarian Law in the Norwegian Red Cross.

х

NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

KATARINA MÅNSSON is Associate Officer at the Executive Office of the Secretary-General. From 2008 to 2012 she worked for the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights, based in Uganda and Geneva. She has published widely on human rights, peace and security and conflict resolution. Katarina has previously worked at the Raoul Wallenberg Institute for Human Rights and Humanitarian Law in Sweden, at diplomatic missions to the United Nations in Geneva and New York, and as a journalist. The views expressed in her chapter are those of the author and do not necessarily reflect the views of the United Nations.

GRO NYSTUEN is Associate Professor of International Humanitarian Law at the University of Oslo, and Associate Professor at the Norwegian Defence University College. Between 1991 and 2005, she worked for the Norwegian Ministry for Foreign Affairs. She has written extensively on international humanitarian law, peace agreements, human rights, international terrorism, corporate social responsibility and *jus ad bellum* issues. Gro is also Chair of the Council on Ethics for the Norwegian Government Pension Fund and founding partner of the International Law and Policy Institute in Oslo.

SIGRID REDSE JOHANSEN is a lecturer in international and military law at the Norwegian Defence University College.

PETER VEDEL KESSING is a senior researcher at the Danish Institute for Human Rights and a lecturer at the Faculty of Law at Copenhagen where he specialises in armed conflict, security, counter-terrorism and human rights. He has worked in the field of international human rights law for many years, and has previously been head of the International Law Department at the Danish Red Cross. Additionally, he has been a judge in a Danish district court and worked with the Danish Ministry of the Interior and the UNHCR on international refugee law.

ABBREVIATIONS

AP	Additional Protocol
CCW	Convention on Prohibitions or Restrictions on the Use of Certain
	Conventional Weapons
CRC	Convention on the Rights of the Child
CRC-OPAC	Optional Protocol to the CRC on the Involvement of Children in
	Armed Conflict
CWC	Convention on the Prohibitions of the Development, Production,
	Stockpiling and Use of Chemical Weapons
DPH	direct participation in hostilities
DRC	Democratic Republic of the Congo
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
GC	Geneva Convention
HRC	Human Rights Committee
HRL	human rights law
IAC	international armed conflict
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICERD	International Covenant on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial
	Discrimination
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICRC	International Committee of the Red Cross
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia
IHL	international humanitarian law
IHRL	international human rights law
ILC	International Law Commission
ISAF	International Security Assistance Force
LOAC	law of armed conflict
MRM	monitoring and reporting mechanism
NIAC	non-international armed conflict
OHCHR	Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights

xii

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

OUP	Operation Unified Protector
PCIJ	Permanent Court of International Justice
POW	prisoner of war
RCA	riot control agent
ROE	Rules of Engagement
TCN	troop contributing nation
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UN	United Nations
UNSC	UN Security Council