

THE IMF AND GLOBAL FINANCIAL CRISES

The International Monetary Fund's response to the global crisis of 2008–9 marked a significant change from its past policies. The IMF provided relatively large amounts of credit quickly with limited conditions and accepted the use of capital controls. This book traces the evolution of the IMF's actions to promote international financial stability from the Bretton Woods era through the most recent crisis. The analysis includes an examination of the IMF's crisis management activities during the debt crisis of the 1980s, the upheavals in emerging markets in the 1990s and early 2000s, and the ongoing European crisis. The dominant influence of the United States and other advanced economies in the governance of the IMF is also described, as well as the replacement of the G7 nations by the members of the more inclusive G20, which have promised to give the IMF a role in their mutual assessment of policies while undertaking reforms of the IMF's governance.

Joseph P. Joyce is a professor of economics at Wellesley College and serves as the faculty director of the Madeleine Korbel Institute for Global Affairs. Professor Joyce's research deals with issues in financial globalization. He has published articles in many journals, including the *Journal of International Money and Finance*, *Open Economies Review*, *Review of International Economics*, *Journal of Development Economics*, and *Economics & Politics*, and he is a member of the Editorial Board of the *Review of International Organizations*. He received his Ph.D. in economics from Boston University.





The IMF and Global Financial Crises

Phoenix Rising?

JOSEPH P. JOYCE

Wellesley College
Department of Economics





> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521874175

© Joseph P. Joyce 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2013

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data Joyce, Joseph P.

The IMF and global financial crises: Phoenix rising? / by Joseph P. Joyce.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 978-0-521-87417-5 (hardback)

- 1. International Monetary Fund. 2. Financial crises. 3. International finance.
 - 4. Global Financial Crisis, 2008-2009. 5. International Monetary Fund -

Developing countries. I. Title. HG3881.5.I58J69 2013 332.1'52-dc23 2012023656

ISBN 978-0-521-87417-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



> The phoenix hope can wing her flight Thro' the vast deserts of the skies, And still defying fortune's spite, Revive, and from her ashes rise.

Miguel De Cervantes, *Don Quixote* (Motteux, trans.)





Contents

List	of Figures, Tables, and Boxes	page x
Prej	face	xiii
Ack	nowledgments	xvii
	of Abbreviations	xix
1.	Introduction	1
	1.1 IPGs and Financial Stability	4
	1.2 IGOs and the IMF	8
	1.3 Principals and Agents	10
	1.4 Overview	13
2.	Bretton Woods	19
	2.1 New Order	20
	2.2 Administrative Arrangements	24
	2.3 Adjustment versus Finance	26
	2.4 Collapse of Bretton Woods	31
	2.5 IMF and Bretton Woods: Appraisal	32
3.	Transitions	35
	3.1 New Responsibilities	36
	3.2 Euromarkets	40
	3.3 Recycling	42
	3.4 New Organizations	47
	3.5 IMF and the Nonsystem: Appraisal	49
4.	The Debt Crisis	52
	4.1 Crisis Emergence	53
	4.2 Crisis Manager	55
	4.3 Program Breakdowns	58

vii



viii	Contents	
	4.4 Crisis Resolution4.5 Basel I4.6 IMF and the Debt Crisis: Appraisal	62 67 69
5.	Global Finance Redux 5.1 Resurgence of Capital Flows 5.2 IMF Programs and Capital Decontrol 5.3 Catalysis 5.4 New Amendment 5.5 IMF and Financial Liberalization: Appraisal	72 73 76 81 83
6.	Currency Crises 6.1 ERM 6.2 IMF and the ERM Crisis: Appraisal 6.3 Mexico: Crisis 6.4 Mexico: Aftermath 6.5 IMF and Mexico: Appraisal	88 89 92 96 100 102
7.	The Widening Gyre 7.1 East Asia 7.2 IMF and East Asia: Appraisal	105 106 115
8.	Fiscal Follies 8.1 Russia 8.2 IMF and Russia: Appraisal 8.3 Brazil 8.4 Argentina 8.5 IMF and Argentina: Appraisal	120 121 124 125 127
9.	Lessons Learned 9.1 Reforms 9.2 International Lender of Last Resort 9.3 FSF and Basel II 9.4 Reserves and Regional Arrangements	134 135 139 143
10.	The Great Recession 10.1 Global Imbalances 10.2 Premonitions 10.3 Impasse 10.4 Implosion	153 154 161 164 167



	Contents	ix
11.	The World Turned Upside Down	181
	11.1 Debt Again	182
	11.2 Integration or Autonomy?	188
	11.3 What Is to Be Done?	191
App	endix: IMF Data	197
Refe	References	
Inde	ex	227



List of Figures, Tables, and Boxes

Figures

4.1.	Debtors and Lenders: Chicken Game	page 56
4.2.	Debt of Heavily Indebted Countries: 1982–1990	63
4.3.	Capital Flows to Developing Economies and Emerging	
	Markets: 1980s	64
5.1.	Capital Flows to Developing Economies and Emerging	
	Markets: 1990s	75
9.1.	Foreign Reserves of Emerging Markets: 1997–2009	149
10.1.	Real GDP Growth: 2000s	155
10.2.	Inflation: 2000s	156
10.3.	Capital Flows to Developing Economies and Emerging	
	Markets: 2000s	157
10.4.	Current Accounts of Advanced Economies: 2000-2009	158
10.5.	Current Accounts of Developing Economies and Emerging	
	Markets: 2000-2009	159
10.6.	Real GDP Growth Rates of Advanced Economies: 2008–2011	175
10.7.	Real GDP Growth Rates of Developing Economies and	
	Emerging Markets: 2008–2011	176
11.1.	Government Gross Debt of Selected Advanced Economies:	
	2007–2015	184
11.2.	Government Gross Debt of Advanced Economies and	
	Emerging Markets: 2007–2015	187
A.1.	Size of IMF Membership and U.S. Voting Share: 1950–2010	197
A.2.	Arrangements Approved: 1970–2011	198
A.3.	Amounts Committed under Lending Arrangements:	
	1970-2011	199



	Figures, Tables, and Boxes	xi
	Tables	
	Oil Exporters' Revenues	43
	Main Lender Banks to Developing Nations: 1970s	45
	Bank Loans to Developing Nations: 1977–1982	46
	Economic Conditions in Heavily Indebted Countries	65
	New Members Post–1973	77
6.1.	Mexico: 1991–1996	97
7.1.	Thailand: 1994–1999	108
	Indonesia: 1994–1999	109
7.3.	Philippines: 1994–1999	111
7.4.	South Korea: 1994–1999	112
7.5.	Malaysia: 1994–1999	113
8.1.	Russia: 1995–2000	122
8.2.	Brazil: 1995–2000	126
8.3.	Argentina: 1997–2002	128
8.4.	Turkey: 1997–2002	131
9.1.	Standards for Sound Financial Systems	145
10.1.	IMF Stand-By Arrangements Post–September 2008	170
A.1.	Managing Directors	199
A.2.	Quota Reviews	200
	Boxes	
2.1.	IMF Article of Agreement I	22
2.2.	Financial Programming	28
3.1.	IMF's Revised Article of Agreement IV	38
4.1.	First-Generation Model of Currency Crises	60
6.1	Second-Generation Model of Currency Crises	94





Preface

The year 1973 was a transitional one for the global economy. Attempts to revive the Bretton Woods system of fixed exchange rates were abandoned; increases in oil prices led to the occurrence of higher prices and falling output, which was labeled "stagflation"; and it was the last year that the U.S. government maintained restrictions on capital flows. There was one other event of somewhat lesser significance: my graduation from Georgetown University's School of Foreign Service, where I developed an interest in international economics. After two years of work in New York, I entered Boston University's graduate program in economics. I subsequently was fortunate to receive an appointment to the faculty at Wellesley College, where I have remained ever since.

I began my professional academic life, therefore, during the post–Bretton Woods era of currency regime and financial liberalization. The removal of capital controls by the United States was followed by financial deregulation in other developed economies in the 1970s, and by many Asian and Latin American countries during the following decades. Capital flows rapidly expanded, and by the end of the century it was possible to refer to the integration of financial markets across borders as the latest manifestation of globalization (Mishkin 2006). But it was also a period of economic volatility and upheaval, which included the debt crisis of the 1980s, the financial crises in the emerging markets of the 1990s, and, most recently, the global crisis of 2008–9.

At the center of all these events was the International Monetary Fund. I was drawn to the study of the IMF because it provided a focus on the twists and turns in the international economy. The IMF was often the subject of criticism: sometimes misinformed and unfair, sometimes well deserved. In my research I sought to substantiate the record of the IMF's activities and their impact. In one of my first postdissertation research papers, I



xiv Preface

investigated the economic characteristics of countries that sought the IMF's assistance. Subsequent works dealt with the repeated occurrence of IMF programs, the implementation of the policy conditions attached to them, the impact of Fund programs on poverty, the IMF's status as a provider of public goods, and the IMF's stance on capital account deregulation. In all of these studies I learned something about the IMF and about the economic conditions of its member countries.

Like others, I was caught off guard by the outbreak of the financial crisis in 2008 but greatly interested by the response of the IMF. The Fund, which had laid off staff members earlier in the decade because of a lack of lending programs, answered its members' requests for assistance by providing large amounts of credit with relatively limited and focused conditionality. The IMF was labeled a "phoenix" and seen as "back in the game," and its rapid and energetic reaction allowed its reputation to recover from the criticisms it had received for its previous crisis management activities, particularly those undertaken during the East Asian crisis of 1997–8. But the IMF was soon involved in the European debt crisis, while the emerging market nations pressed the IMF to investigate the role of capital controls in containing the impact of financial flows.

This book examines the IMF's attempts to promote the international public goods of economic and financial stability from the end of the Bretton Woods system in 1973 through the 2008–9 crisis and the subsequent events in Europe. This account demonstrates how the IMF changed its policy prescriptions in response to the financial turbulence of this era. The IMF learned to respond more quickly when necessary and to distinguish between crisis conditions that require major adjustments in domestic policies and those that are due to external shocks that should be financed. This shift matched a growing awareness of the instability that can arise in financial sectors and an evolution in the IMF's position on the advantages and disadvantages of unregulated capital accounts.

In telling this story, this book also surveys the IMF's relationship as an agent with its principals, the member governments. For many years the IMF's membership was divided among the advanced (or upper-income) economies, emerging market (or middle-income) nations, and developing (or lower-income) countries. This stratification was not rigid, and countries did rise and fall among the categories. But during the post–Bretton Woods era the advanced economies that dominated the IMF and other international agencies did not need to borrow from the Fund, while the emerging markets with much less clout were forced to turn to the IMF for credit whenever they experienced one of their recurrent financial crises.



Preface xv

The IMF's poorer members were cut off from private financial flows and depended upon the IMF and other multilateral agencies for assistance. Consequently there was friction between those nations that directed the IMF's governance and those that borrowed from it.

The financial shock that shook the world economy in 2008, however, originated in the United States, and the advanced economies were particularly hard hit by the ensuing crisis. Moreover, these nations could no longer claim any superiority in their regulatory systems once the activities of the "shadow" banking systems came to light. The emerging markets, on the other hand, suffered only mild slowdowns before their growth resumed its impressive pace. The change in the relative positions of the IMF's members was made clear when the G7 group of nations transferred its role as the chief forum for international economic policy making to the G20, which includes many emerging markets. This changeover was accompanied by promises to overhaul the governance of the IMF.

The IMF, which for thirty-five years sought to find its place in the era of financial globalization, must reinvent itself again. No one expects a return to a Bretton Woods–style system of universal exchange rate and capital account regimes. But the transition to a world where the advanced economies cope with mounting debt and the emerging markets and developing economies seek to continue their rapid growth without exposing themselves to financial volatility will require a reappraisal of the international monetary system by the IMF and its members as profound as that which occurred at the Bretton Woods conference in 1944. My hope is that this book contributes to that debate.





Acknowledgments

This work has benefited from conversations with many colleagues. Among those who have discussed these issues with me are Rawi Abdelal, Jeffrey Chwieroth, Onno de Beaufort Wijnholds, Domenico Lombardi, Kenneth A. Reinert, Lorenzo Bini Smaghi, Thomas Willett, and Ngaire Woods. Special thanks are due to my former coauthors Graham Bird, Ilan Noy, Raul Razo-Garcia, and Todd Sandler. Scott Parris of Cambridge University Press has shown great patience as this book has gone through multiple drafts, and an exceptional reader explained how to separate the wheat from the chaff. Several Wellesley College students, including Virginia Ritter, Leslie Shen, and SuiLin Yap, provided valuable research assistance.

The completion of this book owes much to the patience of my wife, Catherine Clark. She tolerated without reproach many hours of my absence while maintaining the household. My children, Caroline and Alison, also accepted as part of a normal childhood their father's many disappearances to work on the book. I am very fortunate in having a wonderful and supportive family.





Abbreviations

ASEAN Association of Southeast Asian Nations BCBS Basel Committee for Banking Supervision

BIS Bank for International Settlement

CCL Contingent Credit Line CMI Chiang Mai Initiative

CMIM Chiang Mai Initiative Multilateralization

CPSS Committee on Payments and Settlement Systems

EC European Community
ECB European Central Bank
EFF Extended Fund Facility

EFSF European Financial Stability Facility

EMS European Monetary System ERM Exchange Rate Mechanism

ESAF Enhanced Structural Adjustment Facility

ESF Exogenous Shocks Facility

EU European Union FCL Flexible Credit Line

FDI Foreign Direct Investment

FSAP Financial Sector Assessment Program

FSB Financial Stability Board FSF Financial Stability Forum

FSSA Financial System Stability Assessment

G5 Group of Five

G7/8 Group of Seven/Eight

G10 Group of Ten
G20 Group of Twenty
G24 Group of Twenty-Four
G77 Group of Seventy-Seven

xix



XX	Abbreviations
GAB	General Arrangements to Borrow
GFSR	Global Financial Stability Report
GNI	Gross National Income
HAPA	High Access Precautionary Arrangement
IAIS	International Association of Insurance Supervisors
IEO	Independent Evaluation Office
IFI	International Financial Institution
IFIAC	International Financial Institution Advisory Commission
IGO	Intergovernmental Organization
IMF	International Monetary Fund
IMFC	International Monetary and Financial Committee
IOSCO	International Organization of Securities Commissions
IPG	International Public Good
LIBOR	London Interbank Offer Rate
NAB	New Arrangements to Borrow
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
OPEC	Organization of Petroleum Exporting Countries
PRGF	Poverty Reduction and Growth Facility
SAF	Structural Adjustment Facility
SBA	Stand-By Arrangement
SDR	Special Drawing Rights
SDRM	Sovereign Debt Resolution Mechanism
SLF	Short-Term Liquidity Facility
SRF	Supplemental Reserve Facility
WEO	World Economic Outlook