

# PUBLIC PROCUREMENT REGULATION IN AFRICA

Public procurement regulation in Africa is not widely researched. To address the shortage of scholarship in this area and to promote future research, this book analyses the law governing public procurement in a number of African systems and looks at key themes relevant to all African states. Part I discusses the regulatory regimes of nine African systems using a common framework, providing both a focused view of these African systems and an accessible comparative perspective. In Part II, key regulatory issues in public procurement that are particularly relevant in the African context are assessed through a comparative approach. The chapters consider the influence of international regulatory regimes (particularly the UNCITRAL Model Law on procurement) on African systems and provide insights into the way public procurement regulation is approached in Africa.

GEO QUINOT is Professor of Law in the Department of Public Law at Stellenbosch University, where he is also Director of the African Public Procurement Regulation Research Unit (APPRRU) and Co-Director of the Socio-Economic Rights and Administrative Justice Research Project (SERAJ).

SUE ARROWSMITH is Achilles Professor of Public Procurement Law and Policy at the University of Nottingham, where she is also Director of the Public Procurement Research Group and of the postgraduate Executive Programme in Public Procurement Law and Policy.





# PUBLIC PROCUREMENT REGULATION IN AFRICA

Edited by GEO QUINOT AND SUE ARROWSMITH





> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107028326

© Cambridge University Press 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2013

Printed and bound in the United Kingdom by the MPG Books Group

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data
Public procurement regulation in Africa / edited by Geo Quinot
and Sue Arrowsmith.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 978-1-107-02832-6 (hardback)

Government purchasing – Law and legislation – Africa, Sub-Saharan.
 I. Quinot, Geo. II. Arrowsmith, Sue, 1962–

KQC234.3.P83 2013 352.5'30967 – dc23 2012027128

ISBN 978-1-107-02832-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



# **CONTENTS**

List of tables page vii
Notes on the contributors viii
Preface and acknowledgments xiii
List of abbreviations xvi

1 Introduction 1
GEO QUINOT AND SUE ARROWSMITH

# PART I Country studies 23

- The regulatory framework for public procurement in Botswana 25
   REKHA A. KUMAR AND ELINOR CABORN
- The regulatory framework for public procurement in Ethiopia 46

TECLE HAGOS BAHTA

- 4 The regulatory framework for public procurement in Ghana 77

  DOMINIC N. DAGBANIA
- 5 The regulatory framework for public procurement in Kenya 100
  KINGSLEY TOCHI UDEH
- 6 The regulatory framework for public procurement in Namibia 123
  SAMUEL KWESI AMOO AND SCOTT DICKEN
- The regulatory framework for public procurement in Nigeria 141
   KINGSLEY TOCHI UDEH AND M. L. AHMADU

v



vi CONTENTS

8 The regulatory framework for public procurement in Rwanda 162IVAN RUGEMA

- 9 The regulatory framework for public procurement in South Africa 178
  PHOEBE BOLTON
- The regulatory framework for public procurement in Zimbabwe 200
  JOEL ZOWA, NAISON MACHINGAUTA AND PHOEBE BOLTON

PART II Themes in public procurement regulation in Africa 217

- 11 Donors' influence on developing countries' procurement systems, rules and markets: a critical analysis 219

  ANNAMARIA LA CHIMIA
- 12 Procurement methods in the public procurement systems of Africa 261

  ELINOR CABORN AND SUE ARROWSMITH
- 13 A comparative perspective on supplier remedies in African public procurement systems 308

  GEO OUINOT
- 14 A perspective on corruption and public procurement in Africa 336
  SOPE WILLIAMS-ELEGBE
- 15 Promotion of social policy through public procurement in Africa 370

  GEO QUINOT

Materials on public procurement regulation in Africa 404 Index 414



# **TABLES**

5.1	Kenya, levels of usage of procurement methods	page 116
11.1	Aid to Africa by DAC donors, 2002–2009 (US\$ million)	227
11.2	Total ODA net disbursed to Africa, by DAC and non-DAC countries,	
	multilateral donors and private donors, 2002-2009	229
11.3	Aid procurement granted for the government sector which has been	
	spent using country systems, 2010 (US\$ million)	256
15.1	Legal mechanisms aimed at implementing horizontal policies through	
	procurement	375
15.2	Kenyan preferential procurement schemes	388
15.3	Preference points per B-BBEE status level	398

vii



# NOTES ON THE CONTRIBUTORS

#### **Editors**

PROFESSOR GEO QUINOT is Professor of Law in the Department of Public Law at Stellenbosch University, Director of the African Public Procurement Regulation Research Unit (APPRRU) and Co-Director of the Socio-Economic Rights and Administrative Justice Research Project (SERAJ). He mainly teaches administrative law and constitutional law. He also regularly instructs public administrators at Stellenbosch University's School of Public Leadership and in the University of Cape Town's Professional Development Project in both administrative law and public procurement regulation. His research focuses on general administrative law, including a particular focus on the regulation of state commercial activity. He is the author of various articles in academic journals and electronic publications such as Juta's Quarterly Review of South African Law to which he contributes quarterly updates on public procurement law, chapters in book publications such as the recent contribution 'Globalisation, State Commercial Activity and the Transformation of Administrative Law' in M. Faure and A. J. van der Walt (eds.), Globalization and Private Law (2010), two recent books, Administrative Law Cases and Materials (2008) and State Commercial Activity: A Legal Framework (2009), and an edited volume, Law and Poverty: Perspectives from South Africa and Beyond (2012), which he co-edited with Professor Sandra Liebenberg. He is currently the editor of the Stellenbosch Law Review.

PROFESSOR SUE ARROWSMITH is Achilles Professor of Public Procurement Law and Policy at the University of Nottingham, where she is also Director of the Public Procurement Research Group and of the postgraduate Executive Programme in Public Procurement Law and Policy (LLM/Diploma/Certificate). Her publications have been extensively cited by courts and legislators around the world. Authored books include *The Law of Public and Utilities Procurement* (2nd edn, 2005); (with J. Linarelli

viii



#### NOTES ON THE CONTRIBUTORS

ix

and D. Wallace Jr) Regulating Public Procurement: National and International Perspectives (2000); and Government Procurement in the WTO (2003). Recent collections of which she is editor include (with Peter Kunzlik) Social and Environmental Policies in EC Procurement Law: New Directive and New Directions (Cambridge University Press, 2009); (with R. D. Anderson), The WTO Regime on Government Procurement: Challenge and Reform (Cambridge University Press, 2011); and (with S.Treumer) Competitive Dialogue in EU Procurement (Cambridge University Press, 2012). In 1992, she launched the first international academic procurement journal, Public Procurement Law Review. In 2007, she was awarded the CIPS Swinbank Medal for thought innovation in purchasing and supply. She has taught university modules on procurement since 1995, and was Project Leader of the recent EU-funded project for developing a global academic network on procurement regulation (2008–11), which included setting up the global Procurement Law Academic Network (www.planpublicprocurement.org). She was principal investigator for the ongoing British Academy funded project on procurement in Africa in partnership with Stellenbosch University. She was a member for over twenty years of the European Commission's independent Advisory Committee on procurement; is a member of the UNCITRAL procurement Experts Group; and has been consultant on public procurement for, inter alia, the UK government, the UN, the WTO, the European Commission, the OECD, the EU, the European Central Bank and the ILO.

# Other contributors

PROFESSOR MOHAMMED L. AHMADU is Dean of Law and the Coordinator, Arts and Humanities Complex, at Usmanu Dan Fodiyo University, Sokoto, Nigeria. He has worked in the Republic of Fiji Islands as a government lawyer, and has served as a lawyer in the Community Legal Centre in the Republic of Vanuatu. He has been called to the Nigerian Bar and also admitted as a barrister and solicitor in the Republic of the Fiji Islands and the Bar in the Republic of Vanuatu, and is an Associate of the Chartered Institute of Secretaries. He is author and editor of many law textbooks and articles and editor of the *Usmanu Dan Fodiyo Law Journal*.

MR S. K. AMOO is an advocate of the Supreme Court of Zambia and attorney of the High Court of Namibia, and is Senior Lecturer and acting director of the Justice Training Centre, Faculty of Law, University of



#### NOTES ON THE CONTRIBUTORS

Namibia. He has written extensively on the Namibian legal system. He has served as a commissioner of the Namibia Law Reform and Development Commission, a member of the Board for Legal Education, on the National Council for Higher Education, on the Namibia Qualifications Authority Council and as a member of the Governing Board of and legal advisor to the Namibia Red Cross Society.

MR TECLE HAGOS BAHTA is Assistant Professor of Law at the University of Mekelle in Ethiopia. He has published articles in the areas of ADR and arbitration, construction and public procurement.

PROFESSOR PHOEBE BOLTON is Professor of Law at Stellenbosch University, South Africa. She is the author of a number of publications in the area of government contracts, supply chain management and government procurement, including *The Law of Government Procurement in South Africa* (2007).

MS ELINOR CABORN works for Crown Agents as a public procurement consultant and has spent the last ten years supporting national procurement reform programmes, predominantly in Africa. She has supported national governments in drafting procurement legislation, regulations, standard documents and guidance materials in Uganda, Zambia, Swaziland, Ethiopia and Malawi as well as Afghanistan, the Maldives and Barbados, and has done work on assessing and developing procurement capacity in Ghana, Botswana and Tanzania. She is a member of the Chartered Institute of Purchasing and Supply.

MR DOMINIC N. DAGBANJA is a lecturer in law at the Ghana Institute of Management and Public Administration in Accra, Ghana. He is the author of several articles and of the book, *The Law of Public Procurement in Ghana: Law, Policy and Practice* (2011). He has previously worked as, *inter alia*, Senior Legal Officer at the Public Procurement Authority of Ghana.

MR SCOTT DICKEN works for Crown Agents – USA as a Program and Procurement Manager and has over seven years of experience in private sector and international development and social programmes. He has provided procurement advisory and management support on large US government- and foundation-funded programmes and has worked



#### NOTES ON THE CONTRIBUTORS

xi

on international donor-funded projects, including the Millennium Challenge Corporation, USAID, DfID, the Global Fund and JICA. His experience includes work on ODA-funded projects based in Tanzania, Namibia, Liberia, Colombia, Vietnam, Nigeria and the Gambia.

DR REKHA A. KUMAR teaches law in the Department of Law at the University of Botswana. Her research interests lie in the areas of public procurement and of health issues in Africa. She is a member of, among others, the Bagodi baRona Association, an NGO working for the elderly in Botswana, the Botswana Network on Ethics, Law and HIV/AIDS (BONELA) and the Botswana Network of AIDS Service Organizations (BONASO).

DR ANNAMARIA LA CHIMIA is a lecturer in law at the School of Law, University of Nottingham, and head of the Humanitarian and Development Procurement Unit of the Public Procurement Research Group (PPRG). She also teaches at the Universita' degli Studi di Roma Tre. She has previously worked as a lawyer in Italy and has acted as a consultant for the NGO ActionAid, the Commonwealth Secretariat and SIGMA. Her main research interests lie within the area of international development, international trade law and European law (especially external relations, public procurement, and internal market), and she is also interested in regional integration, developing countries' procurement policies, aid harmonisation, and the development of the European Partnership Agreements (EPAs).

MR NAISON MACHINGAUTA is a practising lawyer in Zimbabwe. He is currently working as a legal officer with the Constitution Select Committee (COPAC), a committee of parliament charged with the responsibility to produce a new Constitution for the Republic of Zimbabwe. He was co-editor of, and contributor to, the book, *Local Government Law Reform in Zimbabwe – A Policy Dialogue* (2010), and has a particular interest in public procurement law.

MR IVAN RUGEMA is a lecturer in the Department of Criminal Justice and Procedure at the Faculty of Law, University of the Western Cape, where he teaches advocacy and criminal law.

MR KINGSLEY TOCHI UDEH is a solicitor and advocate of the Supreme Court of Nigeria, and the Principal Partner of T. K. Udeh & Associates, a law and consultancy firm. Since 2008, he has worked as a consultant for the



xii

#### NOTES ON THE CONTRIBUTORS

Nigerian government on building capacity in public procurement, including coordinating public enlightenment programmes on the provisions of Nigeria's Public Procurement Act 2007 on behalf of the Bureau of Public Procurement, Nigeria. He has also coordinated a procurement capacity building programme for accounts and procurement officers of Nigeria's National Assembly in 2009, and is currently engaged as a consultant to conduct a procurement assessment under a UNICEF–EU partnership on Public Expenditure Management and Financial Accountability Review (PEMFAR) of the six EU states in Nigeria. He is a member of the Nigerian Bar Association and the Chartered Institute of Purchasing and Supply Management of Nigeria.

DR SOPE WILLIAMS-ELEGBE is a research fellow at the University of Stellenbosch, South Africa, a visiting scholar at the University of Lagos, Nigeria, and the Head of Research at the Nigerian Economic Summit Group in Lagos, Nigeria. She is a qualified barrister and solicitor. She is the author of *Fighting Corruption in Public Procurement: A Comparative Analysis of Disqualification or Disbarment Measures* (2012), and has advised international financial institutions and government bodies on public procurement and corruption issues. She is also an editor of the *Journal of African Law*.

MR JOEL ZOWA is a legal practitioner of the High Court of Zimbabwe and Deputy Chairman of the Law Development Commission of Zimbabwe. He also lectures in the Department of Procedural Law in the Faculty of Law at the University of Zimbabwe.



# PREFACE AND ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This book developed out of a three-year research partnership between the University of Nottingham and the University of Stellenbosch under the British Academy's UK-Africa Academic Partnerships scheme. The main aim of the project was to examine the current state of public procurement regulation in Africa, with an initial focus on Southern Africa, in key areas. The project was developed because of the extremely limited academic engagement to date with African public procurement systems. While public procurement regulation has recently developed as a distinct field of legal academic study in other continents and is increasingly playing a key role in international legal regimes, such as that of the WTO, the level of academic engagement with this area in Africa has been negligible. There have been only two comprehensive national studies published and a handful of academic articles, as indicated in the bibliography included in this book.

The goal of the project and hence of this book is to assist African domestic development and to inform legal research and policy-making, both through its short-term outputs, primarily in the form of this book, and long-term impact. In the latter respect, this project aims, *inter alia*: (i) to provide foundations for future research on African procurement regulation; (ii) to provide the foundation for specific research and teaching programmes to secure long-term academic capacity in Africa; and (iii) to provide a platform for African scholars to develop research partnerships and gain access to broader international scholarship. The project also seeks to provide interested parties outside Africa with access to materials on African procurement, so that they may incorporate African perspectives into academic work and policy-making activities.

From its inception, we realised that the project was an ambitious one and thus initially limited the focus to Southern Africa. In developing the book, however, we decided that a broader focus drawing on systems from across the continent would better serve the project's purposes. However, pragmatic problems such as access to materials, language barriers and

xiii



xiv

#### PREFACE AND ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

finding research partners in different countries remained and played an important role in the final decision on which countries to include. Eventually, we included Botswana, Ethiopia, Ghana, Kenya, Namibia, Nigeria, Rwanda, South Africa and Zimbabwe, providing a good sample of sub-Saharan systems. Our aim is thus not to present either a full perspective – or even a representative view – of all African public procurement regulatory systems. In line with the objectives of the project, the book is only a starting point for further work to be done, and the systems included thus serve as examples of public procurement regulation in Africa.

The method used in the book is doctrinal legal analysis, covering both hard law (legislation and case law) and 'soft law' norms, since the latter play an important role in procurement in some countries. No new empirical work was done. As far as possible, the study of a particular system was done by local researchers working, in most cases, in collaboration with established researchers in the field of public procurement regulation.

Many persons contributed to the production of this book or otherwise provided necessary support. In the first place, we are grateful to the British Academy for the funding that made this project possible, as well as for the Academy's flexibility in allowing us to adapt the research programme as changing circumstances demanded. We are also grateful to the administrators at the University of Nottingham for providing excellent administrative support to the project and in particular to Anne Crump, Anne Snape, Jane Costa and Jill Gunn.

Early versions of some of the papers incorporated in the volume were presented at the Conference on 'Public Procurement – Global Revolution V' in Copenhagen in September 2010 and at the Conference on 'African Public Procurement Regulation' in Stellenbosch in October 2011. We are grateful to all those who made presentations at or assisted in the organisation of these events, or provided input on the material presented, and in particular to the sponsors of the latter event where the bulk of the research was presented: Achilles Information Ltd, the British Academy, Cambridge University Press, LexisNexis, the National Research Foundation (South Africa) and the Stellenbosch University Faculty of Law.

At the School of Law of the University of Nottingham and at the Stellenbosch Law Faculty thanks are due to all those who worked on technical aspects of the manuscript, in particular to Richard Craven, Megan Alberts, Gillian Armstrong, Michael Clark, Jan-Hugo Fyfer and Petrus Maree, for their very efficient contributions.

At Cambridge University Press we are grateful to Elizabeth Spicer and Kim Hughes, both for their enthusiasm for the project and patience in



#### PREFACE AND ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

XV

waiting for us to deliver on it, and to the many other staff at Cambridge for their able assistance in readying the manuscript for production.

We also record our very sincere thanks to the authors/co-authors of all the chapters of the book, who freely gave of their time and insights and whose contributions made the book possible, as well as to many administrators, practitioners and researchers in many African countries and beyond for providing us with relevant materials, answering questions and, where they could not help, putting us in contact with those who could.

Most of all, we express our appreciation to our spouses and children for their support and encouragement, without which this project could not have been completed. This book is for them.

> Geo Quinot and Sue Arrowsmith



# **ABBREVIATIONS**

AAA Accra Agenda for Action

ACC Anti-Corruption Commission (Namibia)

AfDB African Development Bank

B-BBEE Broad-Based Black Economic Empowerment (South Africa)

BEE black economic empowerment (South Africa)
BPP Bureau of Public Procurement (Nigeria)

COMESA Common Market for Eastern and Southern Africa

CPAR Country Procurement Assessment Report

CSO civil society organisation

CUTS Consumer Unity & Trust Society

DAC Development Assistance Committee (OECD)

EAC East African Community

ECOWAS Economic Community of West African States

EFCC Economic and Financial Crimes Commission (Nigeria)

FEC Federal Executive Council (Nigeria)

FIDIC Fédération Internationale des Ingénieurs-Conseils (International

Federation of Consulting Engineers)

FPPA Federal Public Procurement and Property Administration Agency

(Ethiopia)

GDP gross domestic product

GPA Agreement on Government Procurement (WTO)
HDI historically disadvantaged individual (South Africa)

HIPC highly indebted poor country

IBRD International Bank for Reconstruction and Development ICRC Independent Complaints Review Committee (Botswana)

IDA International Development Association

IMF International Monetary Fund

IRP Independent Review Panels (Rwanda)

KENAO Kenya National Audit Office LDC least developed country

MDA ministries, departments and agencies
MSE micro and small-scale enterprise

xvi



LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

xvii

NGO non-governmental organisation NTB National Tender Board (Rwanda) ODA official development assistance

OECD Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development

PEC Procurement Endorsing Committee (Ethiopia)

PPA Public Procurement Act (Nigeria)
PPA Public Procurement Agency (Ethiopia)

PPAD Act Public Procurement and Asset Disposal Act (Botswana)
PPADB Public Procurement and Asset Disposal Board (Botswana)

PPOA Public Procurement Oversight Authority (Kenya)

PPP public-private partnership

PPPFA Preferential Procurement Policy Framework Act (South Africa)

RFP request for proposal RFQ request for quotation

RPPA Rwanda Public Procurement Agency SACU Southern African Customs Union

SADC Southern African Development Community

SME small and medium-sized enterprise / small, medium and micro

enterprise

TIPEEG Targeted Intervention Programme for Employment and Economic

Growth (Namibia)

UNCITRAL United Nations Commission on International Trade Law UNCTAD United Nations Conference on Trade and Development

UNICEF United Nations Children's Fund

WAEMU West African Economic and Monetary Union

WTO World Trade Organization