

Latin American State Building in Comparative Perspective Social Foundations of Institutional Order

Latin American State Building in Comparative Perspective provides an account of long-run institutional development in Latin America, which emphasizes the social and political foundations of state-building processes. The study argues that societal dynamics have path-dependent consequences at two critical points: at the initial consolidation of national institutions in the wake of independence and at the time when the "social question" of mass political incorporation forced its way into the national political agenda across the region during the Great Depression. Dynamics set into motion at these points in time have produced widely varying and stable distributions of state capacity in the region. Marcus J. Kurtz tests this argument using structured comparisons of the postindependence political development of Chile, Peru, Argentina, and Uruguay.

Marcus J. Kurtz is an Associate Professor in the Department of Political Science at Ohio State University. He is the author of Free Market Democracy and the Chilean and Mexican Countryside (Cambridge, 2004). He has had articles published in the American Journal of Political Science, World Politics, Comparative Politics, Comparative Political Studies, International Organization, Journal of Politics, Politics & Society, Comparative Studies in Society and History, and Theory and Society.





Latin American State Building in Comparative Perspective

Social Foundations of Institutional Order

MARCUS J. KURTZ

Ohio State University





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521747318

© Marcus J. Kurtz 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2013

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Kurtz, Marcus J.

Latin American state building in comparative perspective: social foundations of institutional order / Marcus J. Kurtz.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-76644-9 (hardback) – ISBN 978-0-521-74731-8 (paperback)

- 1. Latin America Politics and government. 2. Nation-building Latin America History.
- 3. Latin America Social conditions. I. Title.

JL966.K87 2012

320.98-dc23 2012028450

ISBN 978-0-521-76644-9 Hardback ISBN 978-0-521-74731-8 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For Sarah, Chloë, and Anneliese





Contents

Acknowledgments		page ix
I	The Difficulties of Studying State Building	I
2	The Social Foundations of State Building in the Contemporary Era	18
3	State Formation in Chile and Peru: Institution Building and Atrophy in Unlikely Settings	66
4	State Formation in Argentina and Uruguay: Agrarian Capitalism, Elite Conflict, and the Construction of Cooperation	95
5	Divergence Reinforced: The Timing of Political Inclusion and State Strength in Chile and Peru	131
6	The Social Question and the State: Mass Mobilization, Suffrage, and Institutional Development in Argentina and Uruguay	176
7	Conclusions, Implications, and Extensions: Social Foundations, Germany–Prussia, and the Limits of Contemporary State	
	Building	227
References		251
Index		271

vii





Acknowledgments

Some portions of Chapters 2 and 3 have been adapted from "The Social Foundations of Institutional Order: Reconsidering War and the 'Resource Curse' in Third World State Building." The final, definitive version of this paper has been published in *Politics & Society*, Vol. 37:4 (2009):479–520. Copyright © SAGE Publications Inc. All rights reserved.

I begin these acknowledgments where my entry into the social sciences began – working with David and Ruth Collier decades ago at Berkeley. From them I learned the importance of history, an openness to the possibility of long-term path dependencies, and the centrality of research design to any successful social-scientific scholarly endeavor. Whereas this book, unlike my last, was not conceived under their guidance, I hope that their influence shows across its breadth.

Of course, in the writing of any book there are always myriad debts - intellectual, personal, and professional – that are accrued. This book is no exception. Many of the ideas that ultimately worked their way into this manuscript emerged in conversations, often in unrelated contexts over unrelated matters, over the course of several years. Ken Dubin, Sebastián Etchemendy, Ken Greene, Victoria Hui, Pauline Jones Luong, Vicky Murillo, Michael Ross, and Aaron Schneider all provoked insights or changes in my thinking during the development of this book. They may not see their influence in the pages, but the book is stronger for the intellectual conversations that I have had with them. Kurt Weyland and the Comparative Politics Workshop at the University of Texas, Austin, gave me very important advice on the argument and framing of the first half of this book, as did the editorial collective at *Politics & Society*, which was generous enough to publish a preliminary version of the book's argument with respect to Chile and Peru. Scholarly works are always made stronger through the mechanism of debate and constructive disagreement. I am delighted to have been able to trade ideas back and forth with both Ryan

ix



x Acknowledgments

Saylor and Hillel Soifer over the past few years – and I very much look forward to continuing these conversations both in print and in person in the coming years. Deborah Boucoyannis was kind enough to help me with some of the vagaries of Prussian history, and hopefully kept me from venturing too far off the path as I explored this decidedly unfamiliar terrain.

Two individuals deserve special mention. Ken Shadlen has had the kindness to read drafts of every chapter of every book manuscript I have worked on, and his comments have always been both penetrating and productive. They are not always easy to address (nor necessarily successfully addressed, alas!), but they always shine a light on the goal of what the book should be rather than what it is. Andrew Schrank has probably heard more about this book than any human being should and has always been willing to read, respond, and engage in ways that have surely made me a far better scholar over the years than I have any right to be. The general and specific intellectual debt I owe to him is beyond measure.

I am lucky enough to have Sarah Brooks as a partner and spouse, for she at once has been my strongest supporter, most trenchant critic, and source for inspiration. At the same time, she has very successfully reminded me that there is more to life than simply the book that one is working on. And that one's book will often be made better for recognizing that fact. Finally, I believe it was James Scott who pointed out in an acknowledgment that his family was no help at all in completing a book, and that for this he was extremely thankful. My daughters, Chloë and Anneliese, have taken on this role with aplomb. They, with no infrequency, remind me that it is more important and a lot more fun to go to the park than to work at the office. And for that I am grateful.

Marcus J. Kurtz Columbus, Ohio