

Welfare and Party Politics in Latin America

Systems of social protection can provide crucial assistance to the poorest and most vulnerable groups in society, but not all systems are created equally. In Latin America, social policies have historically exhibited large gaps in coverage and high levels of inequality in benefit size. Since the late 1990s, countries in this region have begun to grapple with these challenges, enacting a series of reforms to health care, social assistance, and education policy. While some of these initiatives have moved in a universal direction, others have maintained existing segmentation or moved in a regressive direction. Welfare and Party Politics in Latin America explores this variation in Argentina, Chile, Uruguay, and Venezuela, finding that the design of previous policies, the intensity of electoral competition, and the character of political parties all influence the nature of contemporary social policy reform in Latin America.

Jennifer Pribble is Assistant Professor of Political Science at the University of Richmond. She has had articles published in *American Sociological Review*, *Comparative Politics*, *Latin American Research Review*, and *Studies in Comparative International Development*. She was awarded the Lynda Dykstra Award for the best dissertation in the social sciences by the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill in 2009.





Welfare and Party Politics in Latin America

JENNIFER PRIBBLE

University of Richmond





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107030220

© Jennifer Pribble 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2013

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Pribble, Jennifer E.

Welfare and party politics in Latin America / Jennifer Pribble, University of Richmond, Virginia. – First Edition.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-03022-0 (hbk. : alk. paper)

1. Latin America – Social conditions – 21st century. 2. Latin America – Social policy – 21st century. 3. Political parties – Latin America – History – 21st century. 4. Latin America – Politics and government – 21st century. I. Title.

HNIIO.5.A8P7295 2013 361.8-dc23 2012051625

ISBN 978-1-107-03022-0 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

Figures and Tables		<i>page</i> vii
Ac	knowledgments	ix
Ac	ronyms	xiii
I	From Special Privilege to Social Rights: Universalism in Social Policy	I
2	Creating Universalistic Social Policy: The Role of Policy Legacies, Electoral Competition, and Party Character	2.5
		25
3	Health Care Reform in Chile and Uruguay	39
4	Social Assistance Reform in Chile and Uruguay	70
5	Education Reform in Chile and Uruguay	89
6	Party Character in Chile and Uruguay	120
7	Slow Progress toward Universalism: Argentina and Venezuela in Comparative Perspective	133
8	Latin America's Left Parties and the Politics of Poverty and Inequality	172
Bibliography		185
Interviews		203
Index		209

V





Figures and Tables

Figures

1.1	Difference between Top and Bottom Income Quintiles' Pension	
	Coverage (Economically Active Population)	page 5
1.2	Difference between Top and Bottom Income Quintiles' Pension	
	Coverage (Elderly Population)	5
1.3	Categories of Social Protection	5 6
3.1	Chile's Health Expenditure (Percent of GDP)	41
3.2	Uruguay's Health Expenditure (Percent of GDP)	45
5.1	Chile's Education Expenditure (Percent of GDP)	92
5.2	Uruguay's Education Expenditure (Percent of GDP)	95
7.1	Argentina's Social Expenditure (Percent of GDP)	140
7.2	Venezuela's Social Expenditure (Percent of GDP)	159
Tal	ples	
1.1	Categories and Scoring of Universalism	ΙI
2.1	Party Types	32
	Classification of Party Character	33
3.I	Health Policy Legacies in Chile	44
3.2	Health Policy Legacies in Uruguay	47
3.3	Summary of Health Care Reform in Chile	57
3.4	Summary of Health Care Reform in Uruguay	68
	Social Assistance Policy Legacies in Chile	74
	Social Assistance Policy Legacies in Uruguay	75
	Summary of Noncontributory Family Assistance Reform in	, 3
. ,	Chile	76
4.4	Summary of Noncontributory Pension Reform in Chile	82
• •	•	

vii



viii	1	Figures and Tables
4.5	Summary of Noncontributory Family Assistance Reform	n in
	Uruguay	87
5.1	Education Policy Legacies in Chile	94
5.2	Education Policy Legacies in Uruguay	97
5.3	Summary of Education Reform in Chile (1990–2010)	106
5.4	Summary of Education Reform in Uruguay (1995)	116
5.5	Summary of Education Reform in Uruguay (2004–2009)) 117
7 . I	Coding of Argentina's Social Policy Reforms (1991–200	09) 142
7.2	Coding of Venezuela's Social Policy Reforms (1998–20	08) 161



Acknowledgments

To some, writing a book may appear to be the most solitary of endeavors, involving interaction between the author, data, and a computer. In reality, however, a finished book reflects the energy of countless individuals. Indeed, writing a book requires academic, financial, and emotional support and I have been fortunate to have received abundant assistance from colleagues, friends, family, and institutions, for whom I am immensely grateful.

First and foremost, I am thankful for the guidance and example provided by Evelyne Huber and John Stephens, whose research and teaching were an important source of intellectual inspiration for this project. Their enthusiasm and knowledge about the politics of welfare policy are extraordinary and their rigorous and dedicated approach to research has profoundly shaped my professional and intellectual development. I am thankful to have been their student and for their unwavering commitment to this project.

I am also fortunate to have phenomenal colleagues and friends, who continue to teach me a great deal about Latin American politics and political science more broadly. In particular, I am grateful to Mireya Dávila for her camaraderie and enthusiasm in discussing Chilean politics. I am also deeply indebted to Juan Pablo Luna and Juan Bogliaccini for their friendship and willingness to field my unending questions about details of the Chilean and Uruguayan cases. I have learned a great deal from Agustina Giraudy, whose sharp mind and companionship provided me with important support while writing the various iterations of this manuscript. Merike Blofield was an outstanding field research partner and I am thankful for her helpful suggestions on multiple drafts of the manuscript. Sara Niedzwiecki was always willing to teach me about the Argentine case and I am grateful for her insight.

This project benefited immensely from the thoughtful feedback of colleagues, who generously read and commented upon significant portions of the book. In particular, I am thankful for comments provided by Sarah Brooks,

ix



Acknowledgments

X

Matthew Carnes, Michelle Dion, Christina Ewig, Tasha Fairfield, Maurizio Ferrera, Fernando Filgueira, Jonathan Hartlyn, Jorge Lanzaro, Sandra Ley-Gutierrez, Rubén LoVuolo, Juliana Martínez-Franzoni, James McGuire, Jana Morgan, Ken Roberts, Lars Schoultz, Andres Schipani, Joe Wong, participants of the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill's Comparative Politics Working Group, and the three anonymous referees who reviewed this book. I am also grateful for the advice and guidance provided by my colleagues at the University of Richmond and for the suggestions offered by Santiago Anria, Javier Corrales, Wendy Hunter, Vicky Murillo, and Kurt Weyland. In addition, I am appreciative of the excellent research assistance offered by Kate Simma.

I was extremely fortunate to have received a warm and helpful welcome from academics, practitioners, and friends during my field research in Chile and Uruguay. In particular, I would like to thank Claudio Fuentes and Flacso Chile for providing me with institutional and academic support in Santiago; and Fernando Filgueira and Ruben Katzman for hosting me at IPES and CIESU in Montevideo. Claudio, Fernando, and Ruben, as well as other academics affiliated with their research institutes, provided crucial guidance and feedback during the field research process. Several individuals in Chile and Uruguay helped ensure that my field research was successful. In particular, I would like to thank David Altman, David Alvarez, Rossana Castiglioni, Mireva Dávila, Claudia Fuentes, Eugenio Lahera, Maria Pía Martin, Andrés Palma, Andrés Villar, and the librarians in the Chilean Congressional Press Archive Office for offering insight into Chilean politics and for helping me to obtain interviews and archival data. I am grateful to another Chilean, José Antonio de Pablo, for generously allowing me to use one of his photos for the cover of this book. In Uruguay, I would like to thank Gustavo De Armas, José Fernandez, Adolfo Garcé, Diego Hernandez, Jorge Lanzaro, Juan Andrés Moraes, Luis Senatore, Cristina Zurbriggen, and Senator Couriel's aides – Alejandra and Alicia – for helping to organize interviews and for teaching me a great deal about Uruguay. I am eternally grateful to the Chilean and Uruguayan politicians and social organizers, particularly former Presidents Patricio Aylwin, Ricardo Lagos, Luis Alberto Lacalle, and Jorge Batlle, who took time out of their busy schedules to meet with me and explain the political processes surrounding policy reform incidents. On more than one occasion these individuals spent an hour or more explaining the politics of policy making, providing me with insight that would have otherwise been impossible to obtain. I learned tremendously from these interviews and I admire the participants for their frankness and transparency.

The field research for this project was financed by the UNC-Duke Consortium for Latin American Studies, the Organization of American States, the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill, and the University of Richmond. I am grateful for the support of these institutions and I applaud their willingness to finance original field research.



Acknowledgments

хi

I am also grateful to Cambridge University Press and to Eric Crahan for his interest and commitment to this project.

Finally, I would like to thank my family for their patience and understanding during the many years that it took to complete this book. My mother and father, Jaimie and Don Pribble, have supported me in all of my life adventures and I could never have completed the book without their help. In particular, my mom put in hours of unpaid labor to help care for my son, which allowed my husband and me to juggle conference travel and difficult work schedules. I am also grateful for Martha Williams, my son's babysitter and my dear friend. Any working parent knows that it is much easier to excel professionally when we know that our children are in good hands and I am thankful for her commitment and care. My brother Dan was born asking questions and his natural curiosity provided continual intellectual inspiration during the course of this project. My sister-in-law Titti and my friend Michiel graciously accepted me into their home in Montevideo and helped to make my field research a particularly special experience.

My son, Antonio, was born midway through this project and has made the past three years the happiest of my life. His giggle is always a welcome reminder of the importance of seeing beyond the book and I am grateful for all of the joy that he has brought to my life. Last, but certainly not least, I owe an enormous debt of gratitude to my husband, Paolo, who has moved across hemispheres and put up with long commutes so that I could pursue my professional goals. His commitment to this project was, on occasion, much stronger than my own and he helped keep me focused and strong during the tiring and trying moments of the research and writing. He has known when to pry me away from my desk and when to overlook my negligence, but most of all he has always valued my goals and ambitions as though they were his own. With deep gratitude for their unyielding love and support, I dedicate this book to Antonio and Paolo.





Acronyms

AFJP: Administradora de Fondos de Jubilaciones y Pensiones, Pen-

sion and Retirement Fund Administrator (Argentina)

AFP: Administradora de Fondos de Pensión, Pension Fund Admin-

istrator (Chile)

ANEP. Administración Nacional de Educación Pública, National

Administration of Public Education (Uruguay)

ANSES: Administración Nacional de la Seguridad Social, National

Social Security Administration (Argentina)

Administración de los Servicios de Salud del Estado, State ASSE:

Health Services' Administration (Uruguay)

AUGE: Acceso Universal de Garantías Explícitas, Guaranteed Univer-

sal Access to Explicit Rights (Chile)

BPC: Base de Prestación y Contribución, Transfer and Contribution

Index (Uruguay)

BPS: Banco de Previsión Social, Social Insurance Bank (Uruguay) CASMU: Centro de Asistencia del Sindicato Médico de Uruguay,

Uruguayan Doctors' Union Assistance Center

CGT: Confederación General del Trabajo, General Labor Confed-

eration (Argentina)

CIEPLAN: Corporación de Estudios Para Latinoamérica, the Corporation

for Latin American Studies (Chile)

Colegio Médico, Doctors' Union (Chile) CM:

CODICEN: Consejo Directivo Central, Central Directive Council

(Uruguay)

CONFUSAM: Confederación Nacional de Funcionarios de Salud Municipal-

izada, Municipal Healthcare Workers' Confederation (Chile)

CONGRESS: Consejo de Gremios de la Salud, Council of Healthcare Unions

(Chile)

xiii



xiv Acronyms

CPC: Confederación de la Producción y del Comercio, Production

and Commerce Confederation (Chile)

DISSE: Dirección de Seguros Sociales por Enfermedad, Office of Social

Insurance for Healthcare (Uruguay)

United Nations' Economic Commission for Latin America and ECLAC:

the Caribbean

Frente Amplio, Broad Front (Uruguay) FA:

FEMI: Federación Médica del Interior, Interior Medical Federation

FNR: Fondo Nacional de Recursos, National Resource Fund

(Uruguay)

FONASA: Fondo Nacional de Salud, National Health Fund (Chile) FONASA: Fondo Nacional de Salud, National Health Fund (Uruguay) FOSIS: Fondo de Solidaridad y Inversión Social, Social Investment

and Solidarity Fund (Chile)

FREPASO: Frente Pais Solidario, Front for a Solidaristic Country

(Argentina)

Funcionarios Uruguayos de Salud, Uruguayan Health Work-FUS:

ers' Union

IFI:

IADB: Inter-American Development Bank

IAMC: Institución de Asistencia Médica Colectiva, Collective Medical

Assistance Institution (Uruguay) International Financial Institution

IL: Instituto Libertad, Liberty Institute (Chile)

IMF: International Monetary Fund

Instituciones de Salud Previsional, Health Insurance Institu-ISAPRE:

tions (Chile)

Import Substitution Industrialization ISI:

LOCE: Ley Orgánica Constitucional de Enseñanza, Education Con-

stitutional Law (Chile)

Libertad y Desarrollo, Liberty and Development (Chile) LYD: MAS: Movimiento al Socialismo, Movement for Socialism (Bolivia) Movimiento Bolivariano Revolucionario 200, Bolivarian Rev-MBR 200:

olutionary Movement 200 (Venezuela)

Mejoramiento de la Calidad y Equidad de la Educación, MECE:

Improvement to Educational Quality and Equity (Chile)

MIDEPLAN: Ministerio de Planificación y Cooperación, National Planning

and Cooperation Ministry (later became Social Development

Ministry) (Chile)

Movimiento Quinta República, Fifth Republic Movement MVR:

(Venezuela)

PANES: Plan de Atención Nacional a la Emergencia Social, National

Attention Plan for Social Emergency (Uruguay)

PASIS: Pensión Asistencial, Social Assistance Pension (Chile)



> Acronyms χv

> Partido Demócrata Cristiano, Christian Democratic Party PDC:

> > (Chile)

PDVSA: Petróleos de Venezuela, Sociedad Anónima, Venezuelan

Petroleum Corporation

PIT-CNT: Plenario Intersindical de Trabajadores - Convención Nacional

de Trabajadores, Inter-labor Union Plenary - National Labor

Convention (Uruguay)

PJ: Partido Justicialista, Justicialist (Peronist) Party (Argentina)

PLENARIO: Plenario de Instituciones de Asistencia Médica Colectiva, Ple-

nary of Collective Medical Assistance Institutions (Uruguay)

PPD: Partido Por la Democracia, Party for Democracy (Chile) PRSD: Partido Radical Socialdemócrata, Radical Social Democratic

Party (Chile)

PS: Partido Socialista, Socialist Party (Chile)

PSUV: Partido Socialista Unido de Venezuela, United Socialist Party

of Venezuela

PT: Partido dos Trabalhadores, Workers' Party (Brazil) Renovación Nacional, National Renovation (Chile) RN: SAP: Subsidio de Agua Potable, Drinking Water Subsidy (Chile)

National Student Achievement Test (Chile) SIMCE:

SMU: Sindicato Médico Uruguayo, Uruguayan Doctors' Union Sistema Nacional Integrado de Salud, National Integrated SNIS:

Health System (Uruguay)

SNS: Servicio Nacional de Salud, National Health Service (Chile) Subsidio Único Familiar, Unique Family Subsidy (Chile) SUF: Unión Cívica Radical, Radical Civic Union (Argentina) UCR:

UDI: Unión Demócrata Independiente, Independent Democratic

Union (Chile)

VAT: Value Added Tax WB: World Bank