

Tocqueville and the Frontiers of Democracy

Alexis de Tocqueville is widely cited as an authority on civil society, religion, and American political culture, yet his thoughts on democratization outside the West and the challenges of a globalizing age are less known and often misunderstood. This collection of essays by a distinguished group of international scholars explores Tocqueville's vision of democracy in Asia and the Middle East; the relationship between globalization and democracy; colonialism, Islam, and Hinduism; and the ethics of international relations. Rather than simply documenting Tocqueville's own thoughts, the volume applies the Frenchman's insights to enduring dilemmas of democratization and cross-cultural exchanges in the twenty-first century. This is one of the few books to shift the focus of Tocqueville studies away from America and Western Europe, expanding the frontiers of democracy and highlighting the international dimensions of Tocqueville's political thought.

Ewa Atanassow is a Junior Professor at ECLA of Bard, a liberal arts university in Berlin. Her research focuses on democracy and nation-hood in the liberal tradition of political thought, with emphasis on Tocqueville.

Richard Boyd is Associate Professor of Government at Georgetown University, where he teaches courses on liberalism, international ethics, and the history of political philosophy. He is the author of *Uncivil Society: The Perils of Pluralism and the Making of Modern Liberalism* (2004).





Tocqueville and the Frontiers of Democracy

Edited by

EWA ATANASSOW

ECLA of Bard University

RICHARD BOYD

Georgetown University





> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521263757

© Cambridge University Press 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2013

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Tocqueville and the frontiers of democracy / [edited by] Richard Boyd, Georgetown University, Ewa Atanassow, European College of Liberal Arts (Berlin) pages cm

ISBN 978-1-107-00963-9 - ISBN 978-0-521-26375-7 (pbk.)

1. Tocqueville, Alexis de, 1805–1859. – Political and social views. 2. Democracy.

3. Democratization. I. Boyd, Richard, 1970- II. Atanassow, Ewa.

JC229.T8T593 2013

321.8-dc23 2012042450

ISBN 978-1-107-00963-9 Hardback ISBN 978-0-521-26375-7 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

List of Contributors	page vii
Short Title Abbreviations of Tocqueville's Major Works Acknowledgments	xi xiii
Introduction: Tocqueville and the Frontiers of Democracy Ewa Atanassow and Richard Boyd	I
PART ONE. THE MEANING OF DEMOCRACY AND THE DEMOCRATIC REVOLUTION	
Democracy and Revolution in Tocqueville: The Frontiers of Democracy Nestor Capdevila	33
2 The Frontier Between Aristocracy and Democracy Ran Halévi	53
3 Tocqueville's Burke, or Story as History Ralph Lerner	74
PART TWO. DEMOCRATIZATION IN A NON-WESTERN CONTEXT	
4 Tocqueville and Religion: Beyond the Frontier of Christendom <i>Alan Kahan</i>	89
5 Deliberating Democratization with Tocqueville: The Case of East Asia Cheryl B. Welch	111

v



vi		Contents
6	Tocquevillean Thoughts on Higher Education in the Middle East <i>Joshua Mitchell</i>	133
PAI	RT THREE. CHALLENGES OF GLOBALIZATION: DEMOCRACY, MARKETS, AND NATIONHOOD	
7	Tocqueville and the Unsettled Global Village Susan McWilliams	153
8	Nationhood – Democracy's Final Frontier? Ewa Atanassow	178
9	Commerce, Glory, and Empire: Montesquieu's Legacy Céline Spector	202
PAI	RT FOUR. DEMOCRACY, IMPERIALISM, AND FOREIGN POLIC	Y
10	The Surprising M. Tocqueville: Necessity, Foreign Policy, and Civic Virtue David Clinton	223
ΙI	Democracy and Domination: Empire, Slavery, and Democratic Corruption in Tocqueville's Thought <i>Jennifer Pitts</i>	243
12	Tocqueville and the Napoleonic Legend Richard Boyd	264
PAI	RT FIVE. DEMOCRACY'S OLD AND NEW FRONTIERS	
13	Tocqueville, the Problem of Equality, and John Ford's Stagecoach Robert Pippin	291
14	The Poetry of Democracy Paul Berman	307
15	Tocqueville and the Local Frontiers of Democracy <i>Robert T. Gannett, Jr.</i>	317
Epi	ilogue: New Frontiers, Old Dilemmas Richard Boyd	332
Bił	bliography of Works Cited	341
Inc	dex	261



List of Contributors

Ewa Atanassow is a Junior Professor at ECLA of Bard, a liberal arts university in Berlin. Her research focuses on the question of nationhood and nationalism in Tocqueville and more broadly on the intersection of ethics and politics in the liberal tradition of political thought. Her articles and reviews have appeared in *Journal of Democracy, Kronos, Nations and Nationalism*, and *Perspectives on Political Science*. She is currently working on a book-length account of the vexed relationship between the modern nation-state, as defined by cultural particularity and aspirations to sovereignty, and the global universalism of the democratic creed.

Paul Berman writes about politics and literature for *The New Republic, The New York Times Book Review*, and other journals. He is the author of two books on the history of the generation of 1968 in different parts of the world – *A Tale of Two Utopias* and *Power and the Idealists* – and the author of two books on the Islamist movement and the challenges it presents – *Terror and Liberalism* and *The Flight of the Intellectuals*. He is the editor of several anthologies, including *Carl Sandburg: Selected Poems*, published by the American Poets Project of the Library of America.

Richard Boyd is Associate Professor of Government at Georgetown University. He is the author of *Uncivil Society: The Perils of Pluralism and the Making of Modern Liberalism* (Rowman & Littlefield, 2004) and numerous journal articles and book chapters on the intellectual history of classical liberalism, civil society, French literature, and contemporary political theory. He is currently completing a book manuscript on liberalism, capacities, and citizenship.

vii



viii Contributors

Nestor Capdevila is Professor of Political Philosophy at the Université de Paris Ouest Nanterre La Défense. He is the editor and translator of Bartholomé de Las Casas and the author of Las Casas, une politique de l'humanité: l'homme et l'empire de la foi (Editions du Cerf, 1998); Le concept d'idéologie (PUF, 2004); Tocqueville et les frontières de la démocratie (PUF, 2007); and Tocqueville ou Marx: Démocratie, capitalisme, révolution (PUF, 2012).

David Clinton is Professor of Political Science and Chair of the Department of Political Science at Baylor University. He is the author of, among others, *The Two Faces of National Interest* (LSU Press, 1994) and *Tocqueville*, *Lieber*, *and Bagehot: Liberalism Confronts the World* (Palgrave Macmillan, 2003) and the editor of *The Realist Tradition and Contemporary International Relations* (LSU Press, 2007).

Robert T. Gannett, Jr., is an independent scholar and community organizer, currently serving as the executive director of the Institute for Community Empowerment in Chicago. He is the author of *Tocqueville Unveiled: The Historian and His Sources for "The Old Regime and the Revolution"* (Chicago, 2003).

Ran Halévi is a political historian, Directeur de recherche at the Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique (France), and senior Fellow at the Centre de Recherches Politiques Raymond Aron in Paris. Most of his work focuses on the Old Regime and the French Revolution. He is the coeditor of the Pléiade volume on the Orators of the French Revolution, the author of books on the origins of democratic sociability in eighteenth-century France (1984), the first French revolutionary Constitution (1996), François Furet (2007), and numerous articles on Louis XIV's political thought, political moderation under the absolute monarchy, politics and modern honor, the genesis of constituent power, and, more recently, Israeli democracy.

Alan Kahan is Professor of British Civilization at the Université de Versailles/St. Quentin. His recent research focuses on the comparative history of liberalism in nineteenth-century Europe and on the relationship between intellectuals and capitalism. Kahan is the translator of Tocqueville's *The Old Regime and the Revolution* (1998, 2001) and coeditor of *The Tocqueville Reader* (2002). His most recent books are *Alexis de Tocqueville* (2010) and *Mind vs. Money: The War Between Intellectuals and Capitalism* (2010). He is currently working on a study of Tocqueville, Religion, and Democracy.



Contributors ix

Ralph Lerner is the Benjamin Franklin Professor Emeritus in the College and in the Committee on Social Thought at the University of Chicago. His many scholarly works include *The Thinking Revolutionary: Principle and Practice in the New Republic* (Cornell, 1987); *The Founders' Constitution* (coedited with Philip B. Kurland), 5 vols. (Chicago, 1987); *Revolutions Revisited: Two Faces of the Politics of Enlightenment* (North Carolina, 1994); *Maimonides' Empire of Light: Popular Enlightenment in an Age of Belief* (Chicago, 2000); and *Playing the Fool: Subversive Laughter in Troubled Times* (Chicago, 2009).

Susan McWilliams is Associate Professor in the Politics Department at Pomona College, where she teaches courses on liberal political theory and American political thought. She received her BA in Russian and political science from Amherst College and her MA and PhD in politics from Princeton University. She is coeditor (with Patrick Deneen) of Wilson Carey McWilliams's, *The Democratic Soul* (Kentucky, 2011) and *Redeeming Democracy in America* (Kansas, 2011). She is currently preparing a book manuscript on the theme of "travel" in political theory.

Joshua Mitchell is Professor of Government at Georgetown University. He is the author of *Not By Reason Alone* (Chicago, 1993), *The Fragility of Freedom* (Chicago, 1995), and *Plato's Fable* (Princeton, 2005). His book *Tocqueville in Arabia* is forthcoming. Professor Mitchell was Chair of the Government Department at Georgetown from 2002 to 2005, Associate Dean for Faculty Affairs at Georgetown's Qatar campus from 2005 to 2007, and Provost and Acting Chancellor of The American University of Iraq – Sulaimani from 2008 to 2010.

Robert Pippin is the Evelyn Stefansson Nef Distinguished Service Professor in the John U. Nef Committe on Social Thought, the Department Philosophy, and the College at the University of Chicago. He has published extensively on the modern German philosophical tradition, the problem of modernity, theories of self-consciousness, the nature of conceptual change, and the problem of freedom. His interdisciplinary interests involve the relation between philosophy and literature, modern art, and contemporary film. He has recently finished a book about political psychology and the American identity in the classic Hollywood westerns.

Jennifer Pitts is Associate Professor of Political Science at the University of Chicago. Her interests include the history of modern political and social thought, with a focus on Britain and France of the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. She is the author of *A Turn to Empire* (Princeton,



x Contributors

2005) and editor and translator of *Alexis de Tocqueville: Writings on Empire and Slavery* (Johns Hopkins, 2001). She is now writing a book on European debates about international law and legal relations with non-European societies in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries.

Céline Spector is currently Professor in the Philosophy Department of the University of Bordeaux 3 and Member of the Institut Universitaire de France. Her research interests include the history of political thought – particularly the eighteenth century and its legacy. She has published several books on Montesquieu and Rousseau, including Montesquieu: Pouvoirs, richesses et sociétés (PUF, 2004 [rééd. Paris, Hermann, 2011]); Montesquieu et l'émergence de l'économie politique (Paris, Champion, 2006 [awarded the Prix de l'Académie des Sciences morales et politiques]); Jean-Jacques Rousseau, Principes du droit de la guerre: Ecrits sur le Projet de Paix Perpétuelle de l'abbé de Saint-Pierre, coedited with B. Bachofen (Paris, Vrin, 2008); Montesquieu: Liberté, droit et histoire (Paris, Michalon, 2010 [awarded the Prix de l'Académie Montesquieu 2011]); and Au prisme de Rousseau: usages politiques contemporains (Oxford, Voltaire Foundation, 2011).

Cheryl B. Welch is Senior Lecturer on Government at Harvard University. She is the author of *Liberty and Utility: The French Idéologues and the Transformation of Liberalism* (Columbia, 1984) and *De Tocqueville* (Oxford, 2001). She is also the editor of *The Cambridge Companion to Tocqueville* (2006) and an editor of *The Tocqueville Review/la Revue Tocqueville*. The author of numerous articles on French and English political thought, liberalism, and democracy, she is currently working on two projects: a book on the moral dimensions of international political thought in the nineteenth century and a study of the fate of utilitarianism in nineteenth- and twentieth-century Francophone thought.



Short Title Abbreviations of Tocqueville's Major Works

English Editions

- DIA Democracy in America. Translated and edited by Harvey Mansfield and Delba Winthrop. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2000. Cited by volume, part, chapter, and page numbers: e.g., DIA I.2.iii, 174–175.
- DIA (G) Democracy in America. Translated by Arthur Goldhammer. Edited by Olivier Zunz. New York: Library of America, 2004.
- DIA (L) Democracy in America. Translated by George Lawrence. Edited by J. P. Mayer. New York: Harper Perennial, 1969. Cited by volume, part, chapter, and/or page numbers: e.g., DIA (L), xiii.
- DIA (N) Democracy in America. Critical bilingual edition. Translated by James T. Schleifer, in 4 volumes. Edited by Eduardo Nolla. Indianapolis: Liberty Fund Inc., 2009. Cited both by the conventional divisions of Tocqueville's work into volume, part, and chapter, as well as by page numbers to this edition; e.g., DIA (N) II.3.xviii, note v, 1110.
- JA Journey to America. Translated by George Lawrence. Edited by J. P. Mayer. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1959. Cited by page.
- JEI Journeys to England and Ireland. Translated by George Lawrence and K. P. Mayer. Edited by J. P. Mayer. New Brunswick, NJ: Transaction Books, 1988. Cited by page: e.g., JEI, 116.

хi



xii Short Title Abbreviations of Tocqueville's Major Works

OR I and OR II The Old Regime and the Revolution. Vol. 1: The

Complete Text. Vol. II: Notes on the French Revolution and Napoleon. Translated by Alan S. Kahan. Edited by François Furet and Françoise Mélonio. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1998 and 2001. Cited by volume and page: e.g., OR I, 157.

R Recollections: The French Revolution of 1848.

Translated by George Lawrence. New Brunswick, NJ:

Transaction Publishers, 1995.

SLPS Selected Letters on Politics and Society. Translated by

Roger Boesche and James Toupin. Berkeley:

University of California Press, 1985.

WES Writings on Empire and Slavery. Translated by

Jennifer Pitts. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University

Press, 2001.

French Editions

LCS Lettres Choisies, Souvenirs: 1814–1859. Edited by F.

Mélonio and L. Guellec. Paris: Gallimard, 2003.

OC Oeuvres Complètes. Edited by J. P. Mayer et al.

17 vols. in 28 parts to date. Paris: Gallimard, 1951–. Cited by volume, part, and page numbers: e.g., OC

3:1, 120

OP Oeuvres. Edited by André Jardin, Edition Pléiade. 3

vols. to date. Paris: Gallimard, 1991-. Cited by

volume and page numbers: e.g., OP1, 56.



Acknowledgments

One of the main inspirations for this volume was a conference on "Tocqueville and the Frontiers of Democracy" jointly held at the University of Chicago and Roosevelt University in the spring of 2009. We would again like to express our heartfelt thanks to Thomas Bartscherer, Anton Barba Kay, Dan Bertche, Pamela Edwards, Anne Gamboa, Brett Keyser, Margaret Litvin, Robert Pippin, Nathan Tarcov, and Stuart Warner for their inestimable help in staging that originating event, as well as to the Jack Miller Center, Harvard University's Program on Constitutional Government, Montesquieu Forum of Roosevelt University, and University of Chicago's Center for International Studies Norman Wait Harris Fund, Department of History, France Chicago Center, Franke Institute for the Humanities, and John U. Nef Committee on Social Thought, all of whose financial and logistical support were essential to its success.

This volume's major themes were strongly affirmed by moderators, discussants, and attendees at the Chicago event who did not contribute chapters, particularly Paul Cheney, Nathan Tarcov, and Stuart Warner. Along with the original conference participants, we are grateful to the majority of contributors who joined this discussion belatedly, in some cases on very short timelines, and whose participation amply enriched and deepened the conversation. It goes without saying that this volume would not have been possible without all of its contributors' hard work. We admire their diligence, open-mindedness, and equanimity, particularly when it came to revising their chapters in view of our seemingly endless barrage of editorial criticisms. This volume stands as a testament to their scholarly dedication and subtle understandings of Tocqueville's social and political thought.

xiii



xiv

Acknowledgments

We are especially grateful to our editor at Cambridge University Press, Robert Dreesen, for his sensible guidance and unflagging support for the original book proposal, as well as to Abby Zorbaugh, Jeri Litteral, and Susan Kauffman for ably shepherding the manuscript through the editorial process. David Golemboski offered exemplary research assistance in compiling the bibliography and tracking down scores of missing references. Marija Uzunova caught many errors and incongruities in her careful reading of the page proofs. We also want to acknowledge the two extensive sets of comments from anonymous reviewers and those from Thomas Bartscherer of Bard College, whose generous and insightful suggestions greatly improved the form and substance of our efforts.

While working on this book, both of us welcomed our first children to this world, thus each crossing for the first time the "frontier" of parenthood. To our daughters, Dara and Liliane, we would like to dedicate this volume.