

Political Consumerism

Political Consumerism captures the creative ways in which citizens, consumers, and political activists use the market as their arena for politics. This book theorizes, describes, analyzes, compares, and evaluates the phenomenon of political consumerism and how it attempts to use market choice to solve complex globalized problems. It investigates theoretically and empirically how and why consumers practice citizenship and have become important political actors. Dietlind Stolle and Michele Micheletti describe consumers' engagement as an example of individualized responsibility-taking, examining how political consumerism nudges and pressures corporations to change their production practices, and how consumers emerge as a force in global affairs. Unlike other studies, it also evaluates whether and how consumer actions become effective mechanisms of global change. Stolle and Micheletti offer a candid discussion of the limitations of political consumerism as a form of participation and as a problem-solving mechanism.

Dietlind Stolle is a recognized expert on political participation, youth engagement, social capital, and diversity. She currently is the Director of the Quebec Inter-University Centre for the Study of Democratic Citizenship. Stolle is the principal investigator of the Canadian Youth Survey and serves as the principal investigator, co-investigator, or collaborator on eight other national and international funded projects, including the 2011 and 2015 Canadian Election Studies. She is also the principal investigator of the Student Issues and Protest Survey in Quebec. Stolle is a past co-winner of the American Political Science Association's Award for the best paper on European politics. Her scholarly achievements have been recognized in recent invitations to serve as a senior research partner at the Max Planck Institute for the Study of Ethnic and Religious Diversity in Göttingen, Germany and on the advisory board of the Institute for the Study of Democracy in Aarau, Switzerland. At the Wissenschaftszentrum Berlin she has received the prestigious Karl W. Deutsch Professorship.

Michele Micheletti holds the Lars Hierta Chair of Political Science at Stockholm University. She was a member of the SNS Democratic Audit, the scientific boards of the Swedish Consumer Agency and the Swedish Society for Nature Conservation and the Ministry of Finance's Expert Group for Environmental Studies. At present, she is co-coordinator of the European Consortium for Political Research (ECPR) Standing Group on Participation and Mobilization. She has contributed to several parliamentary investigations in Sweden and conducted research for and advised Swedish civic associations and political parties. Her scientific networkbuilding activities have been instrumental in putting political consumerism on the scholarly research agenda. Her publications include The Swedish Farmers' Movement and Government Agricultural Policy (1990), Civil Society and State Relations in Sweden (1995), Political Virtue and Shopping: Individuals, Consumerism, and Collective Action (2003, 2010) and co-edited books on political participation and political consumerism (Creative Participation: Responsibilitytaking in the Political World (2010) and Politics, Products, and Markets: Exploring Political Consumerism Past and Present (2004)).





Political Consumerism

Global Responsibility in Action

DIETLIND STOLLE

McGill University

MICHELE MICHELETTI

Stockholm University





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107010093

© Dietlind Stolle and Michele Micheletti 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2013

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Stolle, Dietlind, 1967-

Political consumerism: global responsibility in action / Dietlind Stolle, Michele Micheletti.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-01009-3 (hardback)

1. Politics, Practical. 2. Political participation. 3. Political ethics. 4. Consumption (Economics) – Political aspects. I. Micheletti, Michele. II. Title.

JF799.8687 2013

172'.1-dc23 2012044104

ISBN 978-1-107-01009-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

List of Figures	page ix
List of Tables	xi
Acknowledgments	xiii
Reconfiguring Political Responsibility	I
Introduction	I
Limits of and Challenges to the Traditional Model of Pol	
Responsibility	2
Reconfiguring Political Responsibility	II
Corporations as Targets for Political Responsibility-Taki The Role of the Choice Mechanism in Solving Political	ng 13
Problems	19
The Reconfiguration of Citizenship Practice	2.1
Character and Outline of the Book	26
2 Reconfiguring Political Participation	31
The Rise of Individualized Political Responsibility-Takin,	g 31
Political Participation in the Globalized World	33
Individual Citizens and Political Responsibility-Taking	36
From Citizen to Citizen-Consumer	39
Skepticism about Political Consumerism as Political	
Participation	43
Rise of Market-Based Political Action	46
Political Action Transformed?	57
3 Who Are Political Consumers?	59
Introduction	59
Addressing Important Debates in the Empirical Study of	
Political Consumerism	60



Political Attitudes, Values, and Practices of Political Consumers 64 Sociodemographic Profile of Political Consumers 68 Engendered Shopping 76 Women and Shopping: A Historical Look 70day's Women and Shopping Political Consumers' Political Attitudes, Norms, and Behaviors 1) Political Attitudes and Behaviors of Political Consumers 2) Considerations Behind Shopping Choices 3) Citizenship Norms and Efficacy Conclusion 91 4 Mapping Political Consumerism in Western Democracies With Jean-François Crépault Introduction 95 National Variations in Political Consumerism 96 Explaining Weak and Strong Political Consumerism 102 1) Socioeconomic Resources and Postmodernization 104 2) Economic Openness 106 3) Price Premiums 4) Political Consumer Infrastructure 111 5) Political and Institutional Factors	vi		Contents
Political Attitudes, Values, and Practices of Political Consumers 64 Sociodemographic Profile of Political Consumers 68 Engendered Shopping 76 Women and Shopping: A Historical Look 70day's Women and Shopping Political Consumers' Political Attitudes, Norms, and Behaviors 1) Political Attitudes and Behaviors of Political Consumers 2) Considerations Behind Shopping Choices 3) Citizenship Norms and Efficacy Conclusion 91 4 Mapping Political Consumerism in Western Democracies With Jean-François Crépault Introduction 95 National Variations in Political Consumerism 96 Explaining Weak and Strong Political Consumerism 102 1) Socioeconomic Resources and Postmodernization 2) Economic Openness 3) Price Premiums 4) Political Consumer Infrastructure 5) Political and Institutional Factors		Socioeconomic Predictors and Inequality of Political	
Consumers Sociodemographic Profile of Political Consumers Engendered Shopping Women and Shopping: A Historical Look Today's Women and Shopping Political Consumers' Political Attitudes, Norms, and Behaviors 1) Political Attitudes and Behaviors of Political Consumers 2) Considerations Behind Shopping Choices 3) Citizenship Norms and Efficacy Conclusion 4 Mapping Political Consumerism in Western Democracies With Jean-François Crépault Introduction 95 National Variations in Political Consumerism 96 Explaining Weak and Strong Political Consumerism 102 1) Socioeconomic Resources and Postmodernization 104 2) Economic Openness 106 3) Price Premiums 4) Political Consumer Infrastructure 5) Political and Institutional Factors		Consumerism	60
Sociodemographic Profile of Political Consumers Engendered Shopping Women and Shopping: A Historical Look Today's Women and Shopping Political Consumers' Political Attitudes, Norms, and Behaviors 1) Political Attitudes and Behaviors of Political Consumers 2) Considerations Behind Shopping Choices 3) Citizenship Norms and Efficacy Conclusion 4 Mapping Political Consumerism in Western Democracies With Jean-François Crépault Introduction 95 National Variations in Political Consumerism 96 Explaining Weak and Strong Political Consumerism 1) Socioeconomic Resources and Postmodernization 2) Economic Openness 3) Price Premiums 4) Political Consumer Infrastructure 5) Political and Institutional Factors		Political Attitudes, Values, and Practices of Political	
Engendered Shopping 76 Women and Shopping: A Historical Look 80 Today's Women and Shopping 81 Political Consumers' Political Attitudes, Norms, and Behaviors 83 1) Political Attitudes and Behaviors of Political Consumers 84 2) Considerations Behind Shopping Choices 87 3) Citizenship Norms and Efficacy 89 Conclusion 91 4 Mapping Political Consumerism in Western Democracies 95 With Jean-François Crépault Introduction 95 National Variations in Political Consumerism 96 Explaining Weak and Strong Political Consumerism 102 1) Socioeconomic Resources and Postmodernization 104 2) Economic Openness 106 3) Price Premiums 108 4) Political Consumer Infrastructure 111 5) Political and Institutional Factors			64
Women and Shopping: A Historical Look Today's Women and Shopping Political Consumers' Political Attitudes, Norms, and Behaviors 1) Political Attitudes and Behaviors of Political Consumers 2) Considerations Behind Shopping Choices 3) Citizenship Norms and Efficacy Conclusion 91 4 Mapping Political Consumerism in Western Democracies With Jean-François Crépault Introduction 95 National Variations in Political Consumerism 96 Explaining Weak and Strong Political Consumerism 102 1) Socioeconomic Resources and Postmodernization 2) Economic Openness 3) Price Premiums 4) Political Consumer Infrastructure 5) Political and Institutional Factors			68
Today's Women and Shopping Political Consumers' Political Attitudes, Norms, and Behaviors 1) Political Attitudes and Behaviors of Political Consumers 2) Considerations Behind Shopping Choices 3) Citizenship Norms and Efficacy Conclusion 91 4 Mapping Political Consumerism in Western Democracies With Jean-François Crépault Introduction 95 National Variations in Political Consumerism 96 Explaining Weak and Strong Political Consumerism 102 1) Socioeconomic Resources and Postmodernization 104 2) Economic Openness 106 3) Price Premiums 4) Political Consumer Infrastructure 5) Political and Institutional Factors			76
Political Consumers' Political Attitudes, Norms, and Behaviors 1) Political Attitudes and Behaviors of Political Consumers 2) Considerations Behind Shopping Choices 3) Citizenship Norms and Efficacy Conclusion 4 Mapping Political Consumerism in Western Democracies With Jean-François Crépault Introduction 95 National Variations in Political Consumerism 96 Explaining Weak and Strong Political Consumerism 102 1) Socioeconomic Resources and Postmodernization 104 2) Economic Openness 106 3) Price Premiums 4) Political Consumer Infrastructure 5) Political and Institutional Factors		•	80
1) Political Attitudes and Behaviors of Political Consumers 2) Considerations Behind Shopping Choices 3) Citizenship Norms and Efficacy 89 Conclusion 91 4 Mapping Political Consumerism in Western Democracies With Jean-François Crépault Introduction 95 National Variations in Political Consumerism 96 Explaining Weak and Strong Political Consumerism 102 1) Socioeconomic Resources and Postmodernization 104 2) Economic Openness 106 3) Price Premiums 4) Political Consumer Infrastructure 5) Political and Institutional Factors			81
2) Considerations Behind Shopping Choices 3) Citizenship Norms and Efficacy Conclusion 4 Mapping Political Consumerism in Western Democracies With Jean-François Crépault Introduction 95 National Variations in Political Consumerism Explaining Weak and Strong Political Consumerism 102 1) Socioeconomic Resources and Postmodernization 104 2) Economic Openness 3) Price Premiums 4) Political Consumer Infrastructure 5) Political and Institutional Factors			_
3) Citizenship Norms and Efficacy Conclusion 4 Mapping Political Consumerism in Western Democracies With Jean-François Crépault Introduction 95 National Variations in Political Consumerism 96 Explaining Weak and Strong Political Consumerism 102 1) Socioeconomic Resources and Postmodernization 104 2) Economic Openness 106 3) Price Premiums 4) Political Consumer Infrastructure 5) Political and Institutional Factors		,	84
Conclusion 91 4 Mapping Political Consumerism in Western Democracies 95 With Jean-François Crépault Introduction 95 National Variations in Political Consumerism 96 Explaining Weak and Strong Political Consumerism 102 1) Socioeconomic Resources and Postmodernization 104 2) Economic Openness 106 3) Price Premiums 108 4) Political Consumer Infrastructure 111 5) Political and Institutional Factors 117			,
4 Mapping Political Consumerism in Western Democracies With Jean-François Crépault Introduction 95 National Variations in Political Consumerism 96 Explaining Weak and Strong Political Consumerism 102 1) Socioeconomic Resources and Postmodernization 2) Economic Openness 106 3) Price Premiums 108 4) Political Consumer Infrastructure 5) Political and Institutional Factors			89
With Jean-François Crépault Introduction 95 National Variations in Political Consumerism 96 Explaining Weak and Strong Political Consumerism 102 1) Socioeconomic Resources and Postmodernization 104 2) Economic Openness 106 3) Price Premiums 108 4) Political Consumer Infrastructure 111 5) Political and Institutional Factors 117		Conclusion	91
Introduction 95 National Variations in Political Consumerism 96 Explaining Weak and Strong Political Consumerism 102 1) Socioeconomic Resources and Postmodernization 104 2) Economic Openness 106 3) Price Premiums 108 4) Political Consumer Infrastructure 111 5) Political and Institutional Factors 117	4		95
National Variations in Political Consumerism 96 Explaining Weak and Strong Political Consumerism 102 1) Socioeconomic Resources and Postmodernization 2) Economic Openness 106 3) Price Premiums 108 4) Political Consumer Infrastructure 5) Political and Institutional Factors		· ·	0.5
Explaining Weak and Strong Political Consumerism 1) Socioeconomic Resources and Postmodernization 2) Economic Openness 3) Price Premiums 4) Political Consumer Infrastructure 5) Political and Institutional Factors			
1) Socioeconomic Resources and Postmodernization 104 2) Economic Openness 106 3) Price Premiums 108 4) Political Consumer Infrastructure 111 5) Political and Institutional Factors 117			
2) Economic Openness 108 3) Price Premiums 108 4) Political Consumer Infrastructure 111 5) Political and Institutional Factors 117			
3) Price Premiums 108 4) Political Consumer Infrastructure 111 5) Political and Institutional Factors 117		,	•
4) Political Consumer Infrastructure 1115 5) Political and Institutional Factors 117		,	108
5) Political and Institutional Factors		37	
· ·		· ·	
6) Social Capital 121		6) Social Capital	121
		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	123
		,	126
Appendix 127		Appendix	127
	-		135
)		135
			137
Organic Food Activism and Labeling Schemes for Agricultural			-3/
		0 , 0	137
			143
			146
Labeling Schemes for Forest and Marine Stewardship		9,	140
		· ·	149
		,	153
Socially Responsible Investing to Push for Corporate Social		•	- 3 3
The state of the s			159
			160
			163
			165



Co	Contents	
6	Discursive Political Consumerism	170
	Introduction	170
	Discursive Turn in Political Consumerism	171
	Antibranding as Discursive Political Consumer Activism	172
	Popular Brands and Political Consumerism	175
	The Case of the Nike E-mail Exchange	179
	Investigating Culture Jamming as Individualized	
	Responsibility-Taking	181
	Who Took Part in the Continued NEE Culture Jam?	182
	The NEE's Political Messages	184
	The NEE's Mobilizing Potential	187
	Long-Term Impact of the NEE	190
	The Effectiveness of Targeting the Nike Iconic Brand	193
	Concluding Remarks	202
7	Does Political Consumerism Matter? Effectiveness and	
/	Limits of Political Consumer Action Repertoires	204
	With Jean-François Crépault	
	Introduction	204
	Doubting Effectiveness	205
	Consumers Are More Self-Interested than Other-Regarding	205
	Political Consumerism Goes Against Core Market Principles	206
	Political Consumerism Is Neoliberalism-Friendly	207
	Political Consumerism Is a Northern Project with a	,
	Northern Agenda	209
	Political Consumerism Has Limited Reach	209
	Determining Effectiveness	210
	How Effective Is Political Consumerism to Date?	211
	Political Consumer Activist Effects on Consumers	212
	Political Consumer Activist Effects on Corporations	214
	1) Is There a Rise in CSR?	216
	2) Rise in Corporate Partnerships with NGOs	218
	3) The Effects of Consumer Boycotts	219
	4) Rise of Ethical Business	222
	5) The Adoption of Ethical Lines by Major Retailers	223
	The Case of Procter & Gamble	227
	The Case of Clas Ohlson	228
	Pushing Government into Political Consumerism	229
	Political Consumerism – Real-Life Problem Solver?	233
	Effects on Wages	233
	Child Labor	234
	Benefits of Fairtrade for the Farmers in Southern	
	Cooperatives	236
	Challenges of Fairtrade Production	239



viii		Contents
	Fairtrade Markets in the North Are Stagnant	239
	Problems with FLO Governance and Monitoring	240
	The Fairtrade Model Does Not Address Structural Problems	
	Faced by the South	241
	Assessing Effectiveness on Balance	242
8	Political Consumerism's Scope and Challenges	244
	Introduction	244
	Difficulties in the Practice of Political Consumerism	245
	Access/Visibility of the Product or Firm in the Supply	
	Commodity Chain	245
	Substitution/Availability of Alternatives	247
	Complexity of Production	248
	Complexity and Scale of Political Consumer Causes	248
	The Maturing of Political Consumerism in the 2000s	255
	Labeling Schemes of the 2000s	255
	Buycotts in the 2000s	257
	Discursive Political Consumerism in the 2000s	258
	Lifestyle Politics in the 2000s	260
	Role of Multi-Stakeholders and Government	261
	Theoretical Implications of Studying Political Consumerism	262
	The Discussion about Defining Political Participation	263
	The Effectiveness of Political Participation	265
	Future Research in Political Consumerism	267
	Rarely Studied Cases of Political Consumerism	267
	Political Consumerism in Developing Countries	270
	Role of the Internet and Social Media for Political	
	Consumerism	272
	New Methodological Approaches in Political Consumerism	273
	The Future of Political Consumerism in a Nutshell	275
Bib	liography	279
Ind	lex	345



List of Figures

2.I	Buycotting	page 52
2.2	Rise in Fair Trade Coffee Sales	54
2.3	Rise in Global Organic Food Sales	55
3.1	Gender Gap in Boycotting	77
3.2	Gender Gaps Over Time	78
3.3	Gender Gap in Buycotting	79
3.4	Frequency of Shopping	82
3.5	Values and Orientations of Political Consumers	87
6.1	Rise and Effect of Anti-Sweatshop Activism against Nike	194





List of Tables

2.I	Longitudinal Data on Boycotting, 1974–2010	page 50
3.I	Bivariate Results for Political Consumerism in Percentages	69
3.2	Individual-Level Model – Baseline	74
3.3	Individual-Level Model – Trust and Participation	86
3.4	The Socioeconomic and Attitudinal Correlates of Political	
	Consumerism in Sweden	90
4.I	The Cross-National Spread of Political Consumerism	97
4.2	Consumption and Market Share of Labeled Products	99
4.3	The Role of Socioeconomic Resources and	
	Postmodernization for Political Consumerism	104
4.4	Does Economic Openness Foster Political Consumerism?	107
4.5	Do Price Premiums Discourage Political Consumerism?	III
4.6	The International Spread of Market-Based Political	
	Consumer Labeling Schemes	113
4.7	Conducive Political Consumer Infrastructure?	115
4.8	Political and Institutional Factors that Promote Political	
	Consumerism	120
4.9	Social Capital as a Resource for Political Consumerism	122
4.10	Religiosity and Political Consumerism	124
4.11	Religion and Political Consumerism	125
6.1	Who Are the Discursive Political Consumers?	183
6.2	Themes Addressed in E-mail Responses to the Nike E-mail	
	Exchange (percentages)	186
6.3	The NEE's Political Mobilization Effects	188
6.4	Direct Effects of the NEE	191

xi





Acknowledgments

This book has been in the making for about ten years. It grew out of the common interests of both authors in the role of collective action and civil society and the recognition that citizens do not only vote at election time to express their political opinions or influence politics. This common scientific curiosity grew into two research projects, "Political Consumption: Politics in a New Era and Arena" and "Sustainable Citizenship: Opportunities and Barriers for Citizen Involvement in Sustainable Development," both funded by the Swedish Research Council (Vetenskapsrådet). Over the years, parts of this book were presented at conferences organized by the European Consortium of Political Research (ECPR), the American Political Science Association, the Swedish Political Science Association, and the Karlstad Seminar on Studying Political Action. We have also presented our research in many different settings, including the 2001 and 2005 International Seminars on Political Consumerism; the workshop on Gender and Social Capital at the University of Manitoba; and various talks in Canada, England, Finland, Germany, the Netherlands, Norway, and Switzerland. We have also been asked to participate in the U.K. research program Cultures of Consumption's workshop "Citizenship and Consumption: Agency, Norms, Mediations, and Spaces" and to give keynote speeches for the Sciences Po Paris conference "Towards Sustainable Consumption"; the Fourth National Brazilian Consumer Studies Meeting "New Directions for Consumer Society"; the Third German Environmental Sociological Summit; the Milano International Conference "Ethical Fashion"; two University of Madison-Wisconsin-organized events on the politics of consumption and the consumption of politics; the European Society for Agricultural and Food Ethics; and the symposium "Shopping for Human Rights" organized at Bergamo University, Italy, by fellow political consumerism researcher Francesca Forno. Our home universities, and particularly the Statistics Speaker series at

xiii



xiv Acknowledgments

McGill University and the Higher Research Seminar series at Stockholm University, have graciously hosted us.

Several people have been very helpful over the last years in this long-term endeavor. We want particularly to thank Asa Nilsson, research administrator at SOM Institute at the University of Gothenburg, Sweden, for generously offering her time and giving good constructive comments on our surveys. Daniel Berlin from the University of Gothenburg was in charge of the 2009 national survey "Consumption and Societal Issues." Jonas Peretti gave us exclusive access to the 3,600 e-mails he received in the context of the Nike e-mail exchange; the e-mails became original research material for Chapter 6. Barbara Hobson at Stockholm University shared her ideas and feedback on this particular dataset. Matthew Wright, a McGill student at the time, spent uncountable hours coding the entire e-mail exchange. Laura Nishikawa, who was also a student at McGill, was in charge of the thoughtful discourse analysis in the Nike e-mail exchange. Cesi Cruz (McGill) designed the online survey of the participants of the Nike e-mail exchange. The design of the cross-national comparison of the political and economic factors behind political consumerism at the individual level was triggered by a paper authored by Mariona Ferrer-Fons (University of Pompeu Fabra, Barcelona) for an ECPR workshop in 2004.

Jen Brea contributed with outstanding fieldwork on the garment industry in Lesotho. Most of all we would like to thank Jean-François Crépault, who was also a student at McGill University, for his excellent work on collecting the cross-national data presented in Chapter 4, as well as ideas for developing the analyses in Chapters 4 and 7. His research assistance went far beyond the task at hand, which explains why he is included as a co-author in these two chapters.

Seventeen additional research assistants have helped over the years with research on various aspects of political consumerism. We are particularly grateful for the work by current or former McGill students Yale Hertzman, Olga Redko, Maria Surilas, Michael Kideckel, Joël Roy, Mike Robichaud, Kaitlyn Shannon, Rossana Tudo, Joe Heywood, Sheelagh Gough, Marc Trussler, and Arnav Manchanda. In some cases, the contributions of the research assistants are included in special footnotes in this book.

Many colleagues at home and abroad have offered valuable comments on our keynote speeches, work-in-progress conference papers, and chapter drafts as well as on drafts of the survey questions. Among the scholars offering their thoughts and collegial support are Lance W. Bennett, André Blais, Mario Diani, Andreas Follesdal, Aina Gallegho Dobón, Corinne Gendron, Elisabeth Gidengil, Edgar Grande, James L. Guth, Boris Holzer, Marc Hooghe, Kay Lehman Scholzman, Anders Lidström, Andrew S. McFarland, Therese O'Toole, Roberta Sassatelli, Alexandra Segerberg, Dhavan Shah, Kate Soper, Jan Teorell, Mette Kirkegaard (nee Tobiasen), Frank Trentmann, Jan W. van Deth, Ariadne Vromen, and Alan Warde.