

The Politics of Prostitution

Women's Movements, Democratic States and the Globalisation of Sex Commerce

The most effective way to deal with prostitution has always been hotly debated by governments and women's movements alike. Feminists want it abolished or regulated as sex work; governments have to safeguard public health and order. This book shows how women's movements in Western Europe, North America and Australia have affected policies on prostitution and trafficking of women since the 1970s, asking what made them successful in some countries but a failure in others. It also assesses whether government institutions to advance the status of women - so-called women's policy agencies - have played a key role in achieving policy outcomes favourable to movement demands. Written by an international team of experts and based on original sources, all chapters follow the same framework to ensure comparability. The final chapter offers an overall comparison identifying what makes women's movements successful and women's agencies effective, presenting the case for 'state feminism'.

JOYCE OUTSHOORN is Professor of Women's Studies at Leiden University. She has been active in the Dutch women's movement since its re-emergence in the late sixties, was co-editor of the Socialist Feminist Texts from 1977 until 1989, and has published extensively on the movement, women's public policy and abortion politics in both Dutch and English.



The Politics of Prostitution

Women's Movements, Democratic States and the Globalisation of Sex Commerce

Edited by

Joyce Outshoorn

Leiden University





> PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge, CB2 2RU, UK 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

http://www.cambridge.org

© Cambridge University Press 2004

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2004

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeface Plantin 10/12 pt System LATEX 2E [TB]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

The politics of prostitution: women's movements, democratic states, and the globalisation of sex commerce / edited by Joyce Outshoorn.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 0 521 83319 1 - ISBN 0 521 54069 0 (pbk.)

- 1. Prostitution Government policy. 2. Prostitution Political aspects.
- 3. Feminism. 4. Women's rights. 5. Prostitutes Legal status, laws, etc.
- 6. Prostitues Civil rights. I. Outshoorn, Joyce. HQ117.P65 2004

306.74-dc21

2003053196

ISBN 0 521 83319 1 hardback ISBN 0 521 54069 0 paperback

The publisher has used its best endeavors to ensure that URLs for external websites referred to in this book are correct and active at the time of going to press. However, the publisher has no responsibility for the websites and can make no guarantee that a site will remain live or that the content is or will remain appropriate.



Contents

	List of figures List of tables Notes on contributors Preface	page vii viii ix xiii
1	Introduction: prostitution, women's movements and democratic politics JOYCE OUTSHOORN	1
2	The women's movement and prostitution politics in Australia BARBARA SULLIVAN	21
3	Taxes, rights and regimentation: discourses on prostitution in Austria BIRGIT SAUER	41
4	Prostitution policies in Britain, 1982-2002 JOHANNA KANTOLA AND JUDITH SQUIRES	62
5	Prostitution as public nuisance: prostitution policy in Canada LESLIE ANN JEFFREY	83
6	Towards a new prohibitionism? State feminism, women's movements and prostitution policies in Finland ANNE MARIA HOLLI	103
7	Prostitute movements face elite apathy and gender-biased universalism in France AMY G. MAZUR	123

v



More information

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-54069-8 - The Politics of Prostitution: Women's Movements, Democratic States and the Globalisation of Sex Commerce Edited by Joyce Outshoorn Frontmatter

vi	Contents	
8	The politics of prostitution and trafficking of women in Israel DELILA AMIR AND MENACHEM AMIR	144
9	Italy: the never-ending debate DANIELA DANNA	165
10	Voluntary and forced prostitution: the 'realistic approach' of the Netherlands JOYCE OUTSHOORN	185
11	State feminism and central state debates on prostitution in post-authoritarian Spain CELIA VALIENTE	205
12	Criminalising the john – a Swedish gender model? YVONNE SVANSTRÖM	225
13	The invisible issue: prostitution and trafficking of women and girls in the United States DOROTHY MCBRIDE STETSON	245
14	Comparative prostitution politics and the case for state feminism JOYCE OUTSHOORN	265
	Appendix 1 Independent variable indicators Appendix 2 Worksheets References	293 296 299
	Index	322



Figures

1.1	RNGS model	page 13
1.2	Typology for women's movement impact and	
	state response	16
1.3	Typology for women's policy agencies	17

vii



Tables

14.1	Prostitution debates by country	page 268
14.2	Gendering and access to policy arena	271
14.3	Gendered debates and policy outcomes	273
14.4	Women's movement and state responses	
	in thirty-six policy debates	281
14.5	Women's policy agencies and movement impact	282
14.6	Characteristics of women's policy agencies	283
14.7	Women's movement characteristics and	
	women's policy agency activities	286
14.8	Policy environments and role of women's	
	policy agency	286
14.9	Women's movement characteristics and	
	movement impact	287
14.10	Policy environment and movement impact	287
14.11	Women's movement characteristics and policy	
	environments linked to women's movement	
	success/dual response	288
14.12	Effects of women's movement characteristics and	
	policy environment on women's movement	
	success, controlling for women's policy	
	agency activities	289

viii



Notes on contributors

DELILA AMIR is a sociologist at the Department of Sociology and Anthropology at Tel Aviv University. She received her Ph.D. from Pittsburgh University, USA. Her publications include *The Politics of Abortion* (Tel Aviv University, 1989); 'Defining Encounters: Who are the Women Entitled to Join the Israeli Collective', in *Women's Studies International Forum* (1997); *Abortion in Israel, from an International and a Feminist Perspective* (Hakibutz Hameuhad Publishers, forthcoming).

MENACHEM AMIR is Professor of Criminology at the Institute of Criminology, Hebrew University in Jerusalem. Among his major publications are *Patterns of Forcible Rape* (Chicago University Press, 1971); *Violence in School* (Hebrew University Press, 1987); and *Police Security and Democracy* (OICJ Press, 2001).

DANIELA DANNA is a research fellow in the Department of Political Science, University of Milan. She received her Ph.D. in Sociology and Social Research from the University of Trento, Italy, and the title of her dissertation was 'Policies about Prostitution in the European Union in the Nineties' (2000). She has worked as a journalist and has published Amiche, compagne, amanti. Storia dell'amore tra donne (Mondadori, 1994); Matrimonio omosessuale (Erre Emme Edizioni, 1997); and edited 'Io ho una bella figlia . . . Le madrilesbiche raccontano' (Zoe, 1998).

of Helsinki, Finland, where she received her Licentiate. Her recent publications include 'On Equality and Trojan Horses: the Challenges of the Finnish Experience to Feminist Theory', in European Journal of Women's Studies (1997); Equal Democracies? Gender and Politics in the Nordic Countries (co-edited with Bergqvist et al.) (Scandinavian University Press, 1999); and the chapter on Finland in State Feminism, Women's Movements and Job Training: Making Democracies Work in the Global Economy, edited by A. Mazur (Routledge, 2001).



x Notes on contributors

Brunswick in Saint John. She received her Ph.D. in Political Science from York University, Toronto. Recent publications include her book on prostitution policy in Thailand, Sex and Borders: Gender, National Identity and Prostitution Policy in Thailand (University of British Columbia Press, 2002); and "Because They Want Nice Things": Prostitution, Consumerism and Culture in Thailand', in Atlantis: a Women's Studies Journal 26, 2 (Spring 2002).

JOHANNA KANTOLA is a research student at the University of Bristol. She has a Politics degree from the University of Birmingham. She is currently working on her Ph.D. dissertation on feminist discourses of the state. Her publications include 'Gender and the Discursive Construction of the Access to the State: a Comparative Study on Britain and Finland', in *Gender Comparisons*, edited by W. Kolbe and I. Rittendorfer (forthcoming).

AMY G. MAZUR is Associate Professor at the Department of Political Science/Criminal Justice Program, Washington State University, Pullman, USA. She received a joint Ph.D. in Political Science and French Studies from New York University. Her publications include Comparative State Feminism (co-edited with Dorothy McBride Stetson) (Sage, 1995); Gender Bias and the State: Symbolic Reform at Work in Fifth Republic France (Pittsburgh University Press, 1995); State Feminism, Women's Movements and Job Training: Making Democracies Work in the Global Economy (as editor) (Routledge, 2001); and Theorizing Feminist Policy (Oxford University Press, 2002). She is co-director of the Research Network on Gender Politics and the State.

JOYCE OUTSHOORN is Professor of Women's Studies at the University of Leiden and head of the Joke Smit Research Centre in Women's Studies; she is also affiliated to the Department of Political Science. Among her recent publications are 'Prostitution as Sex Work: the Pioneer Case of the Netherlands', in Acta Politica (2001); the chapter on the Netherlands in Abortion Politics, Women's Movements and the Democratic State: a Comparative Study of State Feminism, edited by D. McBride Stetson (Oxford University Press, 2001); 'Debating Prostitution in Parliament: a Feminist Analysis', in European Journal of Women's Studies (2001). She is co-director of the Research Network on Gender Politics and the State.

BIRGIT SAUER is Associate Professor of Political Science at the University of Vienna since 1996; she has a Ph.D. in Political Science from the Free University of Berlin. Recent publications include 'Normalized



Notes on contributors

хi

Masculinities: Constructing Gender in Theories of Political Transition and Democratic Consolidation', in *Gender in Transition in Eastern and Central Europe*, edited by Gabriele Jähnert et al. (Trafo Verlag, 2000); 'Conceptualizing the German State: Putting Women's Politics in its Place', in *Handbook of Global Social Policy*, edited by S. S. Nagel and A. Robb (Marcel Dekker, 2000); and *Die Asche des Souveräns. Staat und Demokratie in der Geschlechterdebatte* (Campus Verlag, 2001).

JUDITH SQUIRES is Senior Lecturer in Politics at the University of Bristol; she has a Ph.D. from the University of London. Her publications include 'Women in Parliament: a Comparative Analysis' (co-authored with Mark Wickham-Jones) (Equal Opportunities Commission, 2001); Gender in Political Theory (Polity, 1999); and Feminisms (coedited with Sandra Kemp) (Oxford University Press, 1997). She is convenor of the European Consortium of Political Research Standing Group on Women and Politics.

DOROTHY MCBRIDE STETSON is Professor of Political Science at Florida Atlantic University where she is a member of the Women's Studies Faculty. She is author of numerous articles and three books: Women's Rights in France (Greenwood Press, 1987); Women's Rights in the USA (Garland, 1991, 1997); and A Women's Issue: Family Law Reform in England (Greenwood Press, 1982). She has edited Abortion Politics, Women's Movements and the Democratic State: a Comparative Study of State Feminism (Oxford University Press, 2001); (with Marianne Githens) Abortion Politics: Public Policy in Cross Cultural Perspective (Routledge, 1996) and; (with Amy G. Mazur) Comparative State Feminism (Sage, 1995). She is co-director of the Research Network on Gender Politics and the State.

BARBARA SULLIVAN is Senior Lecturer in the School of Political Science and International Relations, University of Queensland, Australia. She has written extensively on the sex industry in Australia including a monograph *The Politics of Sex: Prostitution and Pornography in Australia since 1945* (Cambridge University Press, 1997). Other recent publications have addressed feminist approaches to prostitution, notions of consent, contract, Australian feminism and women's mental health.

YVONNE SVANSTRÖM is Assistant Professor at the Department for Economic History, University of Stockholm, where she obtained her Ph.D. in Economic History. Her dissertation was published as *Policing Public Women: the Regulation of Prostitution in Stockholm 1812–1880* (Arena/Akademi, 2000). Recent publications in English include "The Main Source of Syphilis is Prostitution". Fallen Women and Prostitutes



xii Notes on contributors

in Medical Discourse 1812–1875: the Case of Stockholm', in Sex, State and Society: Comparative Perspectives on the History of Sexuality, edited by Lars-Göran Tedebrandt (Almqvist & Wiksell International, 2000).

celia valuente is Visiting Professor at the Department of Political Science and Sociology of the Universidad Carlos III de Madrid Spain. She has a Ph.D. in Sociology from the Universidad Autónoma de Madrid. Her publications include 'Implementing Women's Rights in Spain', in Globalization, Gender and Religion: the Politics of Women's Rights in Catholic and Muslim Contexts, edited by Jane H. Bayes and Nayereh Tohidi (Palgrave, 2001); 'The Value of an Educational Emphasis: Child Care and Restructuring in Spain since 1975', in Child Care Policy at the Crossroads: Gender and Welfare State Restructuring, edited by Sonya Michel and Rianne Mahon (Routledge, 2002); and the chapters on Spain in Abortion Politics, Women's Movements and the Democratic State: a Comparative Study of State Feminism, edited by Dorothy McBride Stetson (Oxford University Press, 2001) and in State Feminism, Women's Movements and Job Training: Making Democracies Work in the Global Economy, edited by Amy G. Mazur (Routledge, 2001).



Preface

This study of the politics of prostitution has emerged from the cooperation of scholars within the Research Network on Gender Politics and the State (RNGS) which set out to answer the perennial questions of feminist politics and social movements: do feminist politics make a difference, and can democratic states, still dominated by men and often denoted as patriarchal, actually be feminist? Do women's policy offices work? And how do women's movements actually contribute to the improvement of women's status? To look into prostitution as a political issue to research these questions seemed both an obvious and an unlikely choice. On the one hand, prostitution is mostly about women selling sexual services to men, a long-time concern for feminism as it mainly occurs within unequal relationships of power. On the other hand, prostitution is usually neglected by the mainstream of political science and policy studies that tend to regard the matter as a social or public health problem. Both aspects made it a challenging topic for analysing the question about the impact of women's movements in democratic states and the role of women's policy agencies within government in improving women's status.

The Research Network on Gender Politics and the State was founded in 1995 at Leiden University, the Netherlands, by a group of political scientists, sociologists and women's studies experts from both sides of the North Atlantic. Previously many of them had collaborated on the book Comparative State Feminism, edited by Dorothy McBride Stetson and Amy Mazur (Thousand Oaks: Sage, 1995), which had explored the role of women's policy agencies in equal opportunity policies in a number of advanced industrial democracies. Its outcome called for more extensive, in-depth research into the policies designed since the 1970s in democratic states to meet the challenge and demands of the fast-growing women's movement. In Leiden the first steps were taken towards developing a common design to analyse the impact of the women's movement and 'state feminism' systematically. An analytical framework was set up, and the decision was taken to study the major research questions in several

xiii



xiv Preface

issue areas, in order to prevent generalisation on the basis of just one or two issues. Prostitution was one of the issues selected.

From then on the common research design was developed and adjusted in a truly collaborative spirit. Conferences were held at the Annual Meeting of the American Political Science Association (APSA) in San Francisco in 1996 in a two-day Short Course/Workshop session, a two-day meeting at CREDEP, Université de Paris IX in 1998, an APSA panel on Comparative Politics in Boston that same year, a three-day conference at the University of Southampton/Chilworth Centre in 1999, a five-day workshop on The Politics of Prostitution during the annual Joint Sessions of Workshops of the European Consortium for Political Research (ECPR) in Copenhagen in 2000, a Short Course/Workshop on Comparative Politics at APSA in San Francisco in 2001, and a final two-day meeting at Queen's University, Belfast, in 2001.

At these meetings, all members contributed to refining the framework. In a continual dialogue, care was taken to ensure comparability between different nation-states, guarding against conceptual stretching and the denial of important cultural differences between states. Researchers, coming from sixteen different countries and deeply familiar with their native political system and women's movements, could continually check the appropriateness of the framework for their particular country. At each meeting, Dorothy Stetson and Amy Mazur, co-convenors of the RNGS, kept track of the debates and reworked the research design, which they then distributed to all members. In this way the project has become a truly cross-national study, providing well-grounded theory based on thorough and qualitative research in each country.

After its inception RNGS organised itself into country teams, with a country director recruiting scholars from her country for each issue area. Around each issue a network of researchers developed, studying the issue in a particular country; in due course the work was co-ordinated by an issue area director. Research on the prostitution issue started in 1999 at the Southampton/Chilworth meeting; draft papers were presented and discussed at the 2000 Copenhagen ECPR sessions, the 2001 San Francisco APSA meeting and the conference in Belfast of that same year. I was the network director for the prostitution issue, and took on the responsibility of planning the book, monitoring the progress of the study of each country, making sure the deadlines were met and authors observed the requirements of the framework of the project. I have also written the introduction to the book and the final chapter, in which I make the crosscase analysis and test the hypotheses of the project framework. Without the commitment, enthusiasm and hard work of all the authors, this book would not have materialised, and I want to thank all of our prostitution



Preface xv

network for their co-operation: Delila Amir, Menachem Amir, Daniella Danna, Anne Maria Holli, Leslie Ann Jeffrey, Johanna Kantola, Amy Mazur, Birgit Sauer, Judith Squires, Dorothy McBride Stetson, Barbara Sullivan, Yvonne Svanström and Celia Valiente.

This book is the third study completed in the RNGS project. The first issue studied, job training, resulted in a book, State Feminism, Women's Movements and Job Training: Making Democracies Work in a Global Economy, edited by Amy Mazur and published in 2001. That same year Abortion Politics, Women's Movements and the Democratic State: a Comparative Study of State Feminism, edited by Dorothy McBride Stetson, was published on the abortion issue. In the next two years the books on the remaining issues, political representation of women, edited by Joni Lovenduski, and the 'hot issue' (focusing on a major issue in each country), edited by Birgit Sauer and Melissa Haussman, will be published.

Many people have made this study possible. Thanks go to the various institutions that supported our work financially in the course of the vears - the US National Science Foundation grant for the 1995 Leiden meeting, the European Science Foundation grant for the 1999 Chilworth meeting and the American Political Science Association travel grants for European RNGS members to attend APSA meetings - and to the universities that hosted our meetings: Leiden University, the University of Paris-Dauphiné, the University of Southampton and Queen's University, Belfast. My personal thanks also go to Australian National University, Canberra, where I was a visiting fellow at the Research School for the Social Sciences in 2000, enabling me to plan the book and present some of the first findings; to Barbara Sullivan of the University of Queensland, Brisbane, for her comments at these presentations; to Jantine Oldersma, my fellow researcher in the RNGS project on the Netherlands and colleague at the Joke Smit Centre for Research in Women's Studies at Leiden University; to Willemijn Jansen and Kathleen Asjes, also of the Joke Smit Centre, for helping to prepare the manuscript. I am also very grateful for the critical but very helpful comments on the original manuscript made by the two anonymous reviewers of Cambridge University Press. Thanks, too, go to Sarah Caro and Alison Powell at Cambridge University Press for their work, and Carol Fellingham Webb for her copy-editing of the manuscript. Above all, I want to thank Amy Mazur and Dorothy McBride Stetson, not only for all the hard work they have put into the RNGS, but also for their support and friendship over the years.

> Joyce Outshoorn Leiden/Amsterdam