

Cambridge University Press

0521835666 - Boundaries and Belonging: States and Societies in the Struggle to Shape Identities and Local Practices

Edited by Joel S. Migdal

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Boundaries and Belonging

States and Societies in the Struggle to Shape Identities and Local Practices

This interdisciplinary volume maintains the importance of a spatial understanding of society and history, but it suggests a way of conceiving of borders and space that goes beyond a school map of states. Its subject is the struggle among differing spatial logics, or mental maps. It is concerned with the meaning that state borders hold for people but recognizes that such meaning varies and is contested by other social formations. The authors here ask, To what degree do state borders encase the mechanisms that make the decisive rules governing people's lives and to what extent do they give way to other rulemakers? To what extent do states circumscribe the communities to which people feel attached and to what extent do they intersect with other communities of belonging? The essays in this book home in on the struggles and conflicting demands on people, given that state borders are not automatically preeminent and that other spatial logics demand attention.

Joel S. Migdal is author of many works of comparative state-society relations and the politics of Israel and the Palestinians. His books include *The Palestinian People: A History* (with Baruch Kimmerling, 2003), *Through the Lens of Israel: Explorations in State and Society* (2001), *State-in-Society: Studying How States and Societies Transform and Constitute One Another* (2001), *State Power and Social Forces: Domination and Transformation in the Third World* (with co-editors Atul Kohli and Vivienne Shue, 1994), *Palestinians: The Making of a People* (with Baruch Kimmerling, 1993), and *Strong Societies and Weak States: State-Society Relations and State Capabilities in the Third World* (1988). He has taught at Tel Aviv University and Harvard University and has been a visiting professor at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem, the Institut d'Etudes Politiques de Paris, and the School of Oriental and African Studies in London. He has been a Fulbright-Hayes Fellow and a Lady Davis Fellow. For most of the 1990s he was chair of the Social Science Research Council's Committee on the Near and Middle East. He is currently president of the Association for Israel Studies. He was the founding chair of the International Studies Program at the University of Washington.

Cambridge University Press

0521835666 - Boundaries and Belonging: States and Societies in the Struggle to Shape Identities and Local Practices

Edited by Joel S. Migdal

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Boundaries and Belonging

*States and Societies in the Struggle to Shape Identities
and Local Practices*

Edited by

JOEL S. MIGDAL

University of Washington, Seattle



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
 0521835666 - Boundaries and Belonging: States and Societies in the Struggle to Shape
 Identities and Local Practices
 Edited by Joel S. Migdal
 Frontmatter
[More information](#)

PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE
 The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
 The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK
 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain
 Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa
<http://www.cambridge.org>

© Joel S. Migdal 2004

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
 and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
 no reproduction of any part may take place without
 the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2004

Printed in the United States of America

Typeface Sabon 10/12 pt. *System* L^AT_EX 2_ε [TB]

A catalog record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Boundaries and belonging : states and societies in the struggle to shape identities and local
 practices / edited by Joel S. Migdal.

p. cm.

ISBN 0-521-83566-6

1. Boundaries. 2. Allegiance. 3. Group identity. I. Migdal, Joel S.

JC323.B677 2004

320.1'2 - dc22 2003061210

ISBN 0 521 83566 6 hardback

Cambridge University Press
0521835666 - Boundaries and Belonging: States and Societies in the Struggle to Shape
Identities and Local Practices
Edited by Joel S. Migdal
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Contents

<i>List of Contributors</i>	page vii
<i>Preface and Acknowledgments</i>	ix
PART I. INTRODUCTION	
1 Mental Maps and Virtual Checkpoints: Struggles to Construct and Maintain State and Social Boundaries <i>Joel S. Migdal</i>	3
PART II. ON THE EVE OF THE NATION-STATE: THE OTTOMAN EMPIRE	
2 Do States Always Favor Stasis? The Changing Status of Tribes in the Ottoman Empire <i>Reşat Kasaba</i>	27
3 The Permeable Boundaries of Ottoman Jewry <i>Sarah Abrevaya Stein</i>	49
PART III. THE STATE AND “DANGEROUS POPULATIONS”	
4 “Dangerous Populations”: State Territoriality and the Constitution of National Minorities <i>Adriana Kemp</i>	73
5 Making Myanmars: Language, Territory, and Belonging in Post-Socialist Burma <i>Mary P. Callahan</i>	99
6 Institutionalizing Virtual Kurdistan West: Transnational Networks and Ethnic Contention in International Affairs <i>Nicole F. Watts</i>	121

Cambridge University Press
0521835666 - Boundaries and Belonging: States and Societies in the Struggle to Shape
Identities and Local Practices
Edited by Joel S. Migdal
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

vi	<i>Contents</i>
PART IV. INSCRIBING MEMBERSHIP AND CONTESTING MEMBERSHIP IN THE NATION	
7	Challenging Boundaries and Belongings: “Mixed Blood” Allotment Disputes at the Turn of the Twentieth Century <i>Lauren Basson</i> 151
8	Belonging and Not: Rossland, British Columbia, during the Great War <i>Kenneth G. Lawson</i> 177
9	Boundaries and Belonging in Conditions of Extreme Politicization: The Chinese State in Private and Public Spaces, 1949–1968 <i>Neil J. Diamant</i> 205
10	Gender and the Reproduction and Maintenance of Group Boundaries: Why the “Secular” State Matters to Religious Authorities in Israel <i>Patricia J. Woods</i> 226
PART V. BEYOND THE STATE: TRANSNATIONAL FORCES AND THE CHALLENGE TO THE STATE	
11	Passports into Credit Cards: On the Borders and Spaces of Neoliberal Citizenship <i>Matthew Sparke</i> 251
12	Contested Boundaries: Citizens, States, and Supranational Belonging in the European Union <i>Lisa Conant</i> 284
13	Boundaries of the Nation-State and the Lure of the Islamic Community in Turkey <i>Yeşim Arat</i> 318
PART VI. CONCLUSION	
14	Conclusion <i>Béatrice Hibou</i> 339
	<i>Index</i> 359

Cambridge University Press

0521835666 - Boundaries and Belonging: States and Societies in the Struggle to Shape Identities and Local Practices

Edited by Joel S. Migdal

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Contributors

Yeşim Arat is a professor in the Department of Political Science and International Relations, Boğaziçi University, Istanbul. She has worked on women's political participation, and her latest research is on Islamist women activists in Turkish politics.

Lauren Basson is a Kreitman Post-Doctoral Fellow in the Department of Politics and Government at Ben Gurion University in Beer Sheva, Israel. Her research focuses on citizenship, national membership, and ethnicity in comparative perspective.

Mary P. Callahan is an assistant professor in the Jackson School of International Studies at the University of Washington. She teaches classes on human rights, civil-military relations, and international studies. She is the author of *Making Enemies: War and State Building in Burma* (2003).

Lisa Conant is an assistant professor of Political Science at the University of Denver and author of *Justice Contained: Law and Politics in the European Union*. She wrote "Contested Boundaries" as a Jean Monnet Fellow at the European University Institute.

Neil J. Diamant is Associate Professor of Asian Law and Culture at Dickinson College in Carlisle, Pennsylvania. He is the author of *Revolutionizing the Family: Politics, Love and Divorce in Urban and Rural China, 1949–1968* (2000).

Béatrice Hibou is a researcher at the CNRS-CERI and has been a member of the editorial board of *Critique Internationale* (1998 to 2003). She is now studying the transformation of economic regulation in North Africa and in Southern Europe. Her recent publications include *The Criminalization of the State in Africa* (with J. F. Bayart and S. Ellis, 1998), and she has edited *Privatizing the State* (2003).

Reşat Kasaba is Professor of International Studies at the University of Washington and an adjunct professor in the Departments of Sociology and

Cambridge University Press

0521835666 - Boundaries and Belonging: States and Societies in the Struggle to Shape Identities and Local Practices

Edited by Joel S. Migdal

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

viii

List of Contributors

Political Science. He is the author of *The Ottoman Empire and the World-Economy: The Nineteenth Century* (1988) and co-editor with Sibel Bozdoğan of *Rethinking Modernity and National Identity in Turkey* (1997).

Adriana Kemp is a lecturer in the Department of Sociology and Anthropology, Tel Aviv University. Her fields of research are labor migration, citizenship, identity and borders, boundaries, and nationalism. She has published numerous articles on these subjects in journals such as *Political Geography*, *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, *Gender and Society*, and *Identities*.

Kenneth G. Lawson is a professor of Political Science and International Studies at Shoreline Community College in Seattle, Washington. His research focuses on the issues of nationalism, civil society, globalization, and U.S. foreign policy. He is working on a study that compares the civic effects of the First World War in small communities in the United States and Ireland.

Joel S. Migdal is the Robert F. Philip Professor of International Studies at the University of Washington. He has written widely on state-society relations. His most recent book on that topic is *State in Society: Studying How States and Societies Transform and Constitute One Another* (2001). He also writes on Israelis and Palestinians in the Middle East. Recently, he published *The Palestinian People: A History* (2003) with co-author Baruch Kimmerling.

Matthew Sparke is an associate professor of Geography in the Jackson School of International Studies at the University of Washington. He is the author of *Hyphen-Nation-States: Critical Geographies of Displacement and Disjuncture* (2004), and is currently writing a textbook on globalization. His research on cross-border regions and the transnational development of civil society is sponsored by a National Science Foundation CAREER grant.

Sarah Abrevaya Stein is an assistant professor in the History Department and the Henry M. Jackson School of International Studies at the University of Washington and author of *Making Jews Modern: Yiddish and Ladino Press in the Russian and Ottoman Empire* (2003). Her articles have appeared in *Slavic Review*, *Jewish History*, *Jewish Social Studies*, *The Oxford Handbook of Jewish Studies*, and numerous edited volumes.

Nicole F. Watts is Assistant Professor of Political Science at San Francisco State University. She has published articles on Kurdish ethnic politics in the *International Journal of Middle East Studies* and *New Perspectives on Turkey*. She is currently working on a book manuscript, tentatively entitled *Routes to Ethnic Resistance: Kurdish Politics in the Turkish Republic*.

Patricia J. Woods is Assistant Professor of Political Science and Jewish Studies at the University of Florida and Visiting Scholar at the Center for Middle Eastern Studies at Harvard University. She is completing a book on the role of socio-professional ties linking high court justices and social movement lawyers in the religious-secular conflict in Israel.

Cambridge University Press

0521835666 - Boundaries and Belonging: States and Societies in the Struggle to Shape Identities and Local Practices

Edited by Joel S. Migdal

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Preface and Acknowledgments

This book began to take shape in two workshops that were held at the University of Washington in July 1999 and September 2000. For me and, I think, for the others who attended, those workshops were extremely exciting. They played with and integrated some of the most compelling current topics in the social sciences: issues of borders, multiple and changing identities, differing vectors and senses of belonging, states, the lines between public and private space, and more. Perhaps what made them so exciting to me was that they brought new voices to some of the old questions in comparative studies. In this volume, all the contributors except Yeşim Arat, Reşat Kasaba, and me received their Ph.D.s after 1995.

It is not simply that this volume introduces bright new minds. These scholars bring a new sensibility to the study of comparative politics and society. All are area experts with deep knowledge of one or more parts of the globe, but they have used their immersion in a place as a way of seeing how old boundaries have been transgressed, even obliterated. They have used their area knowledge to bypass old binaries, such as between migration and stasis, state and society, public and private, national and transnational. Their methodological orientation is to look beyond the lines dividing these supposed opposites to their ongoing interplay, leading to unexpected processes and results. All take culture very seriously but flesh it out in ways that go beyond the tired analysis of attitudes, values, norms, and beliefs. For them, culture is manifest in key practices and is shaped and reshaped in the critical survival choices people make day in and day out.

Part of their new sensibility that I think infuses this volume comes from their interdisciplinarity. Trained as political scientists, sociologists, geographers, and historians, they all have worked in interdisciplinary settings and have gone beyond the limits of their own disciplines. Working with others outside their regions has also contributed to the originality of their outlooks. Cases here come from North America, East Asia, Southeast Asia, the Middle East, and Europe, and Hibou's conclusion throws in a strong dose of Africa

Cambridge University Press

0521835666 - Boundaries and Belonging: States and Societies in the Struggle to Shape Identities and Local Practices

Edited by Joel S. Migdal

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

as well. I believe the breadth of cases attests to the wide applicability of the ideas here. The disproportionate number of chapters dealing with the Middle East probably reflects my own selection bias but also stems from the complex notions of boundaries and belonging that came out of the Ottoman Empire and its demise. The Middle East gives insight into worldwide contemporary struggles over identity in a way that primary reliance on European experience and thought would not.

The book starts with a chapter by me laying out the key issues and explicating an approach that grew out of the discussions at the two workshops. This is followed by four substantive sections. Part II, with chapters by Reşat Kasaba and Sarah Abrevaya Stein, examines issues of movement, stasis, and identity in the Ottoman Empire, before the construction of modern states in the territories it ruled. Next are two sections focusing on modern states and their often tense relationship with other boundary-creating entities and processes inside (and spilling over) their borders. Part III has chapters by Adriana Kemp on Israel, Mary Callahan on Burma, and Nicole Watts on Turkey and Virtual Kurdistan, which examine the states' difficult relations with groups that fall outside the accepted definition of the nation. In Part IV, chapters by Lauren Basson (on the United States), Kenneth Lawson (Canada), Neil Diamant (China), and Patricia Woods (Israel) explore the unexpected and dynamic results of states' attempting to inscribe social boundaries on their populations. The chapters by Matthew Sparke (on Cascadia), Lisa Conant (European Union), and Yeşim Arat (Turkey and the larger Islamic world) explore the tensions between states and transnational spatial configurations challenging conventional notions of state and citizens, nation and nationals. Finally, Béatrice Hibou draws from all of these to offer analytic and theoretical conclusions.

The ideas coming out of the workshops were immeasurably enriched by participants who have not contributed to this volume. I express my deep appreciation to Uri Ben-Eliezer, Madeleine Dong, Leila Fawaz, Kathie Friedman, Edward Gross, Steven Heydemann, Christine Ingebritsen, David Newman, and Jonathan Warren. Michael McCann was both an intellectual inspiration and, through his role as the head of the newly formed Comparative Law and Society Studies (CLASS) program at the University of Washington, a major provider of material support. Invaluable assistance for the workshops and volume was given by Chandni Gupta, Laura Korey, Jarod Krissman, Tamara Leonard, Jane Meyerding, Brian Peters, Kammerle Schneider, Zoë Stemm, Cathy Vuong, and Wanli Yuan. I also thank those who funded the project, including the University of Washington's Tools for Transformation Program; the CLASS program; the International Studies Center, administered by Reşat Kasaba; the Middle East Center, administered by Ellis Goldberg with the aid of Felicia Hecker; the Robert F. Philip Professorship in International Studies; and the Crossing-Borders Ford Foundation grant, administered by Gary Hamilton and, later, Laurie Sears.