



Ching-Wen Hsueh

Direct Effect
of WTO Agreements:
Practices and Arguments



PETER LANG

Table of Contents

Preface	5
Abbreviations.....	13
Introduction	15
0.1. Origin and Purposes of the Research.....	15
0.2. Definition of Direct Effect	17
0.3. Legal Background	18
0.4. Starting Point for the Analysis: The Effect of International Agreements in Domestic Legal Systems	23
0.5. Direct effect of the EU Treaty.....	25
0.6. The Challenging Procedure and the Direct Effect of WTO Agreements ...	28
0.7. Structure of the Research	30
Part I: Empirical Analysis-Practices of the Member States	33
Chapter 1: Positions of the United States and the European Union.....	35
1.1. The Laws and Practices in the United States.....	35
1.1.1. The Domestic Legal Status of International Agreements in General	35
1.1.1.1. Treaty and Executive Agreements	36
1.1.1.2. Self-executing and the Hierarchy of the Norms.....	37
1.1.1.3. International Agreements as Guidance for Interpreting Domestic Law	39
1.1.1.4. Summary.....	41
1.1.2. The Legal Status of the GATT 1947 in Domestic Law	42
1.1.2.1. Provisions of the GATT 1947 as International Obligations under Domestic Law.....	43
a) The GATT 1947	43
b) Tokyo Round Agreements.....	44
1.1.2.2. The Effect of the GATT.....	45
a) The GATT 1947	45

i.	GATT as A Non-self-executing Agreement	45
ii.	Relationship to Federal and State Law	49
b)	Tokyo Round Agreements.....	51
1.1.3.	The Legal Status of the WTO Agreements in Domestic Law	52
1.1.3.1.	Uruguay Round Implementing Legislation.....	53
a)	The Uruguay Round Agreements Act and the Statement of Administrative Action	54
i.	Relationship to Federal Law	55
ii.	Relationship to State Law	55
iii.	Implementation of DSB Rulings.....	57
b)	Sovereignty Concerns in the Legislation	59
i.	Excessive Constraints on Domestic Decision Making Power.....	60
ii.	Derogation of Federalism and Democracy	63
1.1.3.2.	The Indirect Effect of the WTO Agreements.....	65
a)	Admissibility of the Cases.....	66
b)	Administrative Agencies' Discretion on Interpreting Ambiguous Statutes	67
1.1.4.	Conclusion.....	72
1.2.	The Laws and Practices in the European Union	73
1.2.1.	The Legal Status of International Agreements in General.....	74
1.2.1.1.	The Relationship to the Community Law	75
1.2.1.2.	The Relationship to the Domestic Law of Members.....	77
1.2.1.3.	Grounds for Direct Effect of International Agreements: Uniform Application and Protection for Individual Rights.....	80
1.2.2.	The Legal Status of the GATT 1947 and the WTO Agreements.....	83
1.2.2.1.	Participation of the Community in the GATT and the WTO	83
1.2.2.2.	The Assessments of the ECJ on the Effect of the GATT/WTO Agreements	86
a)	Denial of Direct Effect of the GATT 1947.....	86
b)	Rules of the GATT 1947 as Guidelines for Interpreting and Applying Community Law	88
c)	Reconfirming the Rulings Concerning the GATT 1947.....	92
d)	Further Developments on the Issue of Direct Effect – Legal Status of Dispute Settlement Body Decision and Indirect Effect of the WTO Agreements.....	94

1.2.2.3. ECJ's Rationale Against Direct Effect of the WTO Agreements	98
a) Flexibility of the GATT/WTO Agreements	99
b) Principle of Reciprocity.....	102
c) Rationale behind the Scene: Discretion of Community's Political Organs	106
1.2.3. Conclusion.....	109
1.3. Conclusion: Implementation of the WTO Rules as Policy Issue.....	109
Chapter 2: Positions of China and Taiwan.....	111
2.1. Laws and Practices in China	111
2.1.1. Domestic Legal Status of International Agreements in General....	112
2.1.1.1. International Agreements as Part of Domestic Law.....	112
a) Acceptance of Treaties and International Agreements.....	112
b) Laws and Regulations Addressing the Effect of International Agreements	113
i. Laws and Regulations Recognizing Direct Effect of International Agreements.....	114
ii. Laws and Regulations Implementing the Rules of International Agreements	116
c) Judicial Interpretations of the Effect of International Agreements in Domestic Legal System.....	117
i. Interpretations and Rulings Recognizing Direct Effect of International Agreements.....	118
ii. Interpretations and Rulings Implying Refusal of Direct Effect	121
d) Preliminary Observations on the Practice of China...	122
2.1.1.2. Relationship to Domestic Law	125
2.1.2. The Legal Status of the WTO Agreements.....	126
2.1.2.1. Accession Documents of China	127
2.1.2.2. Laws, Regulations, and Courts' Interpretations Relevant to the Effect of the WTO Agreements: Divergent Views on the Direct Effect.....	128
2.1.2.3. The Effect of WTO Agreements under the Current Legal Framework	131
a) Provisions Concerning the Relationship between Private Parties Tend to Be Directly Effective.....	132

b) Provisions Governing the Measures of Governments Appear Not to Be Directly Effective.....	134
2.1.2.4. Problems under the Current System and Possible Developments	136
2.1.3. Conclusion.....	140
2.2. Laws and Practices in Taiwan	141
2.2.1. The General Domestic Legal Status of International Agreements.....	142
2.2.1.1. International Agreements as Part of Domestic Law.....	142
a) The Rules of the Constitution.....	142
b) The Practices of the Legislative and Executive Branches	144
c) Cases Addressing the Effect of International Agreements.....	147
2.2.1.2. Relationship to Domestic Laws	151
2.2.2. The Legal Status of the WTO Agreements.....	153
2.2.2.1. Ratifying the WTO Agreements and Laws Pertinent to the Effect of the WTO Agreements	154
a) Accession Documents of the Separate Customs Territory of Taiwan, Penghu, Kinmen, and Matsu and the Ratification of the Protocol of Accession	154
b) Foreign Trade Act and Regulation Governing the Implementation of the Imposition of Countervailing and Anti-Dumping Duties	155
2.2.2.2. Cases Addressing the Effect of the WTO Agreements ...	158
a) The TRIPS Agreement	158
b) The Anti-Dumping Agreement and the Agreement on Government Procurement.....	161
2.2.2.3. The Grounds for the Direct Effect of the WTO Agreements	162
2.2.3. Conclusion.....	165
2.3. Conclusion: Considerations for the Status of the WTO Agreements in the Domestic Legal System	166
Part II: An Analysis of the Grounds For and Against.....	167
Chapter 1: Major Arguments For and Against the Direct Effect of the WTO Agreements.....	169
1.1. Arguments for the Direct Effect of the WTO Agreements.....	169
1.1.1. Constitutionalization of International Economic Law.....	170

1.1.1.1.	The Need for the Restraint on Discretion in Trade Policy	171
1.1.1.2.	The Liberal International Trade Rules As Constitutional Constraints on the Discretion in Trade Policy	172
a)	Liberal International Trade Rules Can Have Constitutional Features	172
b)	Integrating Liberal International Trade Rules into Domestic Constitutional Systems	173
1.1.2.	Arguments Based on the Political Economy and Ordnungs-politik (Economic Governance)	175
1.2.	Arguments Against The Direct Effect of The WTO Agreements	177
1.2.1.	Policy Analysis on the Direct Effect	177
1.2.2.	Democratic Deficit of the WTO Agreements	179
1.2.3.	The Inconsistencies with the Constitutional Principles	184
1.3.	An Intermediate Position for the Direct Effect of the WTO Agreements	185
1.3.1.	Intermediation through the Panel and Appellate Body Report	186
1.3.2.	The Theory of Justiciability	187
1.4.	Summary and Preliminary Observations	189
Chapter 2: Assessments on the Grounds For and Against		193
2.1.	Ground for the Direct Effect I: Rights of Individuals under the WTO agreements	195
2.1.1.	Human Rights Dimension of the WTO Agreements	195
2.1.2.	Assessment of the Relation between Human Rights and WTO Agreements	197
2.1.2.1.	Conflicts as a Result of Different Perceptions of the Relationship among States, Individuals, and the Market..	199
2.1.2.2.	WTO Provisions Embodying the Protection for Human Rights	202
2.2.	Ground for the Direct Effect II: the Effectiveness of the WTO Agree-ments	208
2.3.	Grounds Against Direct Effect I: Allocation of Competence Between the WTO and the Member States	209
2.3.1.	Transnational Nature of the Implementation of the WTO rules	210
2.3.2.	Inadequate Intervention on the Implementation of the WTO rules	211

2.4. Grounds Against Direct Effect II: Lack of Legitimacy in Terms of Democracy and Constitutional Principles	213
2.5. Grounds Against the Direct Effect III: Practical Problems of Direct Effect.....	214
2.6. Conclusion.....	215
Summary.....	219
References	225