

# MULTILINGUALISM IN THE GRAECO-ROMAN WORLDS

Through words and images employed by individuals and communities across the Graeco-Roman worlds, this book explores linguistic interactions and multilingual representations of identity. It encompasses not only Greek and Roman culture and power, but also the transformation of the Graeco-Roman world under Islam and within the medieval mind. By treating a range of materials, contexts, languages, and temporal and political boundaries, the contributors consider points of cross-cultural similarity and difference and the changing linguistic landscape of East and West from antiquity into the medieval period. Contemporary multilingualism theory and interdisciplinary perspectives deliver fresh insights into remarkable evidence and offer new directions for the future.

ALEX MULLEN is a post-doctoral research fellow at All Souls College, Oxford. She was previously Lumley Research Fellow at Magdalene College, Cambridge, and Affiliated Lecturer at the Faculty of Classics.

PATRICK JAMES is an Assistant Editor for the Cambridge Greek Lexicon Project and was previously a research associate at Jesus College, Cambridge. He teaches Latin and Greek languages and linguistics for the Faculty of Classics.





# MULTILINGUALISM IN THE GRAECO-ROMAN WORLDS

EDITED BY
ALEX MULLEN AND PATRICK JAMES





> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107013865

© Cambridge University Press 2012

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2012

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Multilingualism in the Graeco-Roman worlds / edited by Alex Mullen and Patrick James.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and indexes.

ISBN 978-1-107-01386-5

 Multilingualism – Rome.
 Multilingualism – Greece I. Mullen, Alex, 1982– II. James, Patrick, 1981–

PII5.5.R57M85 2012

404'.20938 – dc23 2012013655

ISBN 978-1-107-01386-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



#### Contents

ist	t of figures	page vii
ist	of tables	xi
Vot	tes on contributors	xii
Prej	face and acknowledgements	xiii
$4b\ell$	previations	XV
I	Introduction: multiple languages, multiple identities  Alex Mullen	I
2	Language maintenance and language shift in the Mediterranean world during the Roman Empire James Clackson	36
3	Why did Coptic fail where Aramaic succeeded? Linguistic developments in Egypt and the Near East after the Arab conquest Arietta Papaconstantinou	58
4	Language contact in the pre-Roman and Roman Iberian peninsula: direct and indirect evidence Oliver Simkin	77
5	Complaints of the natives in a Greek dress: the Zenon Archive and the problem of Egyptian interference <i>Trevor Evans</i>	106
6	Linguae sacrae in ancient and medieval sources: an anthropological approach to ritual language Alderik Blom	124
7	Typologies of translation techniques in Greek and Latin: Latin <i>elticis</i> : <i>catelticis</i> = Greek ἑλκτική : καθεκτική <i>David Langslow</i>	141

V



vi	Contents	
8	Greek in early medieval Ireland <i>Pádraic Moran</i>	172
9	An habes linguam Latinam? Non tam bene sapio: views of multilingualism from the early medieval West Paul Russell	193
Ю	Towards an archaeology of bilingualism: on the study of Greek–Coptic education in late antique Egypt Scott Bucking	225
II	Neo-Punic and Latin inscriptions in Roman North Africa: function and display Andrew Wilson	265
12	Cultures as languages and languages as cultures <i>Robin Osborne</i>	317
Bil	pliography	335
	neral index	380
Ina	lex of linguistic entities	385
Ina	Index locorum	



# **Figures**

I.I	Funerary monument to Regina (RIB I 1065)	
	(reproduced by kind permission of Arbeia Roman Fort	
	and Museums, Tyne & Wear Archives & Museums).	page 33
2.1	Bilingual inscription from Pisaurum (reproduced by	
	kind permission of the Biblioteca e Musei Oliveriani,	
	Pesaro).	39
2.2	Gaulish spindle-whorl (Héron de Villefosse 1914:	
	Fig. 1).	44
	Ancient languages of the Iberian peninsula.	80
4.2	Use of the Roman alphabet, as percentage of total	
	inscriptions.	94
4.3	Connections attested on the mosaic inscriptions of	
	Andelos and Caminreal.	IOI
4.4	Connections attested on selected Celtiberian tesserae	
	(after Simón Cornago 2008).	102
9.1	Oxford, Bodley MS, 572, fol. 43r (extract) (reproduced	
	by kind permission of The Bodleian Library, University	
	of Oxford).	203
10.1	Map of Egypt, showing sites mentioned in the chapter.	227
	Temple of Hatshepsut at Deir el-Bahri, Thebes: middle	/
10.2	and upper terraces with connecting ramp (photo:	
	D. Fafard).	225
10.2	Plan of upper terrace of Hatshepsut temple, Deir	235
10.5	el-Bahri, showing locations of alphabetic graffiti (after	
	2 1 2	227
	Łajtar 2006: Fig. 2).	237
10.4	North-eastern corner of central court of upper terrace,	
	Hatshepsut temple, Deir el-Bahri, with arrows	
	indicating locations of Bataille 185 and graffiti cluster	
	C.1 (photo: S. Bucking).	239

vii



viii

#### List of figures

10.5	Upper terrace of Hatshepsut temple, Deir el-Bahri, during Naville's excavations, with remains of	
	Building G prior to their disengagement (Egypt	
	Exploration Society, Carter 10, reproduced by kind	
	permission of the Egypt Exploration Society).	240
10.6	Drawing of relief on western wall of corridor leading	
	to Chapel of the Night Sun, Hatshepsut temple,	
	Deir el-Bahri, with locations of alphabet graffiti and	
	bearded male bust (after Naville 1895: Pl. 2).	241
10.7	Bearded male bust (Godlewski 6.36) in corridor	
10.7	leading to Chapel of the Night Sun, Hatshepsut	
	temple, Deir el-Bahri (photo: S. Bucking).	242
10.8	Graffiti cluster C.1, northern wall, central court of	
10.0	upper terrace, Hatshepsut temple, Deir el-Bahri	
	(photo: S. Bucking).	245
ro oa. b	Columbia apis.348, excavated at Deir el-Bahri by the	24)
10. yu, U	Metropolitan Museum of Art, 1926–1928: a. alphabet	
	verse; b. Coptic religious phrase (O. Col. inv. 348,	
	reproduced by kind permission of the Rare Book	
	and Manuscript Library, Columbia University).	247
10.10	View of southern side of western wall, central court,	24/
10.10	Hatshepsut temple, Deir el-Bahri, showing Niches	
	A–I (Niche A at far left) (photo: S. Bucking).	249
10.11	Alphabet graffito (Bataille 101), Niche A in western	<del>44</del> 9
10.11	wall of central court, Hatshepsut temple, Deir	
	el-Bahri (photo: S. Bucking).	250
10.12	Plan of Tomb 23, Beni Hasan, showing location of	2,0
10.12	alphabet table (after Newberry 1893: Pl. 23).	257
10.12	Facsimile of Tomb 23 alphabet table, Beni Hasan	257
10.15	(Newberry 1893: Pl. 25).	258
10.14	Main concentration of alphabet graffiti on northern	2)0
10.14	wall of Tomb 15, Beni Hasan (photo: S. Bucking).	262
TT T	Distribution of neo-Punic inscriptions in North	202
11.1	Africa (A. Wilson/H. Friedman; data from Jongeling	
	2008).	270
11.2	Distribution of neo-Punic bilingual inscriptions in	2/0
11.2	North Africa (A. Wilson/H. Friedman; data from	
		251
** *	Jongeling 2008). Dedication to Shadrana and Malkachtart (IPT 21)	271
11.3	Dedication to Shadrapa and Melkashtart ( <i>IPT</i> 31),	
	found reused in the Byzantine defensive wall around	



	List of figures	ix
11.4	the Old Forum at Lepcis Magna (Levi della Vida and Amadasi Guzzo 1987: Pl. 19).  Neo-Punic inscription from the north-east <i>tholos</i> of the <i>macellum</i> , Lepcis Magna, 8 BC ( <i>IPT</i> 21), recomposed on elements of the <i>tholos</i> , in the	273
	museum at Lepcis (Levi della Vida and Amadasi	
	Guzzo 1987: Pl. 8).	275
11.5	Latin building inscription from the external south	
	wall of the <i>macellum</i> , 8 BC (The British School at	
	Rome Archive, IRT Collection, 319, reproduced by	
11.6	kind permission of The British School at Rome). Bilingual inscription ( <i>IRT</i> 321 and <i>IPT</i> 24a) from	277
11.0	over the corridor into the orchestra in the theatre	
	at Lepcis Magna, commemorating the building	
	of the theatre by Annobal Rufus, AD 1/2	
	(photo: A. Wilson).	279
11.7	Latin inscription (IRT 323) over the street entrance	
	to the theatre at Lepcis Magna, AD 1/2 (photo:	0
O	A. Wilson).	281
11.8	Detail of neo-Punic inscription ( <i>IPT</i> 22) from around the doorframe of the <i>cella</i> of the Temple of	
	Roma and Augustus in the Old Forum at Lepcis	
	Magna, AD 19–22 (Levi della Vida and Amadasi	
	Guzzo 1987: Pl. 10.22.1).	283
11.9	Trilingual building inscription (IRT 481; IPT 16;	
	SEG IX 802) recording the erection of an imperial	
	temple or shrine. Ras el-Hammam, probably reused	
	from Lepcis Magna. Reign of Tiberius (The British	
	School at Rome Archive, <i>IRT</i> Collection, 481, reproduced by kind permission of The British	
	School at Rome).	285
II.IO	Bilingual inscription (IRT 338; IPT 26a) recording	20)
	the paving of the Old Forum at Lepcis Magna,	
	AD 53/54 (photo: A. Wilson).	288
II.II	Fragmentary inscription (IPT 26b) similar to the	
	inscription in Fig. 11.10, showing holes for bronze	
	letters of the Latin inscription, and the neo-Punic	
	inscription carved into the stone (Levi della Vida and Amadasi Guzzo 1987: Pl. 16.26b).	290
	4114 1 111144401 Gullo 190/. 1 1. 10.200/.	290



x

#### List of figures

11.12	Three of the seats with neo-Punic inscriptions (IPT	
11.13	17.1–3), found in the Hadrianic Baths, Lepcis Magna (Levi della Vida and Amadasi Guzzo 1987: Pl. 6). Altar in the orchestra of the theatre at Lepcis Magna, with honorific inscription in neo-Punic ( <i>IPT</i> 27),	294
	AD 92 (Levi della Vida and Amadasi Guzzo 1987: Pl.	
	17).	296
11.14	Stone basin with bilingual dedication to	
	Saturn/Ba'al, from Sabratha (Rossi and Garbini	
	1976–1977: Pl. 5b).	301
11.15	Bronze pin-beater with bilingual inscription naming	
	Mutumbal/Diodorus (IPT 91), in Lepcis Magna	
	museum (Levi della Vida and Amadasi Guzzo 1987:	
	Fig. 23).	304
11.16	Latino-Punic brickstamp from the Hadrianic Baths	
	at Lepcis Magna (Bartoccini 1929: Fig. 205).	308
11.17	Distribution of Latino-Punic inscriptions in	
	Tripolitania (A. Wilson/H. Friedman; data from	
	LPE).	310
11.18	Gasr Isawi, Libya: Latin building inscription in	
	tabula ansata, with Latino-Punic inscription	
	following (Brogan and Reynolds 1960: Pl. 19,	
	reproduced by kind permission of the British School	
	at Rome).	311
12.1	Funerary stele to Antipatros (reproduced by kind	
	permission of Marie Mauzy).	320



### Tables

I.I	Typology of bilingual texts	<i>page</i> 16
1.2	Indicators of ethnolinguistic vitality	27
2.1	Letters found at Kellis sorted by gender and language	51
8.1	Glossaries in CGL II–III with most entries matching	
	O'Mulconry	187
8.2	Glossaries in CGL II–III with most entries matching	
	O'Mulconry (untraced sources)	т88



#### Notes on contributors

ALDERIK BLOM is a British Academy Post-Doctoral Fellow and Junior Research Fellow at Corpus Christi College, University of Oxford.

SCOTT BUCKING is an Associate Professor in History at DePaul University, Chicago.

JAMES CLACKSON is a University Senior Lecturer in the Faculty of Classics, University of Cambridge.

TREVOR EVANS is a Senior Lecturer in the Department of Ancient History, Macquarie University, Sydney.

PATRICK JAMES is an Assistant Editor of the Greek Lexicon Project, University of Cambridge.

DAVID LANGSLOW is Professor of Classics at the University of Manchester.

PÁDRAIC MORAN is a Post-Doctoral Fellow at the National University of Ireland, Galway.

ALEX MULLEN is a Post-Doctoral Research Fellow at All Souls College, University of Oxford.

ROBIN OSBORNE is Professor of Ancient History at the University of Cambridge.

ARIETTA PAPACONSTANTINOU is a Reader in Ancient History at the University of Reading.

PAUL RUSSELL is a Reader in the Department of Anglo-Saxon, Norse and Celtic, University of Cambridge.

OLIVER SIMKIN is a Post-Doctoral Scholar at the University of Copenhagen.

ANDREW WILSON is Professor of the Archaeology of the Roman Empire at the University of Oxford.

xii



## Preface and acknowledgements

At the opening of this book, Barates, the Palmyrene from Syria, says farewell to his beloved Catuvellaunian wife, Regina, in a multilingual epitaph from second-century AD South Shields. At the close of the volume, Domsalôs dedicates a Phoenician—Greek tri-version text to Antipatros in the Dipylon cemetery of early Hellenistic Athens. Both monuments intrigue us with their complex linguistic and visual clues. Barates offers a carved image of Regina in an evocative mix of Western provincial and Syrian style, whereas Domsalôs baffles us with a lion and an apparently prow-headed man leaning over a corpse. These stone treasures illustrate many of the concerns of the volume, which aims to assess and further the rapidly expanding research into multilingualism in the ancient and medieval worlds.

Through the words and images employed both by individuals such as Barates and Domsalôs and by a range of literate communities, we can interrogate the complexity of multilingual representations of identity. Barates and Domsalôs lived under two different Empires and span the traditional East and West divide. By treating a complex range of materials and contexts, encompassing multiple languages, and temporal and political boundaries, we can investigate the points of cross-cultural similarity and difference and consider the changing linguistic landscape of both East and West from antiquity into the medieval period. We offer insights into the application of contemporary multilingualism theory and interdisciplinary perspectives, and hope that this volume offers food for thought and inspiring prospects for the future.

This volume began its life in the conference *Multilingualism from Alexander to Charlemagne: cross-cultural themes and perspectives*, held at the Faculty of Classics, University of Cambridge, May 2009. We are very grateful to all the speakers, chairs and delegates who made those days so stimulating and rewarding. We were extremely fortunate to have had support, financially and logistically, from numerous bodies, including



xiv

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-01386-5 - Multilingualism in the Graeco-Roman Worlds Edited by Alex Mullen and Patrick James Frontmatter More information

Preface and acknowledgements

the University of Cambridge's Faculty of Classics, who awarded us support from The Sir Perceval Maitland Laurence Fund; The Greek Lexicon Project; the Department of Anglo-Saxon, Norse and Celtic; Magdalene, Jesus, Trinity and St John's Colleges, Cambridge and All Souls College, Oxford. Geoff Horrocks, Steve Kimberley and the team of graduate helpers also provided assistance.

We subsequently commissioned a series of chapters from the conference participants, developing and expanding several themes which we deemed significant for progress in the field. Our contributors hail from a range of departments: Archaeology, Classics, Egyptology, Indo-European, Oriental Studies, and Anglo-Saxon, Norse and Celtic, underscoring the breadth of interest in multilingualism. We note our appreciation for the invaluable support received throughout the process from James Adams, James Clackson and Paul Russell. Three anonymous readers also provided thought-provoking and constructive comments. The unfailing support of Michael Sharp of Cambridge University Press and the meticulous work of our copy-editor, Iveta Adams, saw this volume to completion. We have found as editors our complementary skills and specialisms, support of family and friends and the patience and open-mindedness of our contributors extremely valuable.

Finally, we would like to express our gratitude to the following for their kind permission to reproduce images: Arbeia Roman Fort and Museums, Tyne & Wear Archives & Museums; Biblioteca e Musei Oliveriani, Pesaro; The Bodleian Library, University of Oxford; The Egypt Exploration Society; The Rare Book and Manuscript Library, Columbia University; The British School at Rome; Marie Mauzy. We also reiterate the thanks of two contributors to their funding bodies: the Irish Research Council for the Humanities and Social Sciences (Pádraic Moran) and the National Endowment for the Humanities and the American Research Center in Egypt (Scott Bucking).



#### Abbreviations

The titles of periodicals have been abbreviated following *L'Année Philologique*. The abbreviations in the *Checklist of Editions of Greek, Latin, Demotic, and Coptic Papyri, Ostraca and Tablets*, edited by J. D. Sosin, R. S. Bagnall, J. Cowey, M. Depauw, T. G. Wilfong, and K. A. Worp (available online at: scriptorium.lib.duke.edu/papyrus/texts/clist.html) have been employed for editions of ostraca and papyri, unless an alternative has been noted below.

ANRW	Aufstieg	und Niedergan	ng der römischen	Welt. Berlin

and New York.

apis Advanced Papyrological Information System.

Available online at: www.columbia.edu/cu/lweb/

projects/digital/apis/index.html.

Bataille Bataille (1951).

CAT C. W. Clairmont (1993–1995) Classical Attic

Tombstones (8 vols.). Kilchberg.

CEG P. A. Hansen (1983–1989) Carmina Epigraphica Graeca

(2 vols.). Berlin.

CETEDOC Cetedoc Library of Christian Latin Texts.

CGL G. Goetz (1888–1923) Corpus Glossariorum Latinorum:

Thesaurus Glossarum Emendatarum (7 vols.). Leipzig

and Berlin.

CIL (1893–) Corpus Inscriptionum Latinarum. Berlin.

CNH Villaronga (1994).

CPL R. Cavenaile (1958) Corpus Papyrorum Latinarum.

Wiesbaden.

DCPH Delestrée and Tache (2002).

DT García-Bellido and Blázquez (2001).

ET H. Rix (1991) Etruskische Texte (2 vols.). Tübingen.



xvi List of abbreviations

F. Jacoby (1923–) Die Fragmente der griechischen

Historiker, Parts 1-111. Berlin.

GL H. Keil (1855–1880). Godlewski (1986).

GVI W. Peek (1955) Griechische Vers-Inschriften, vol. 1:

Grab-Epigramme. Berlin.

HEp Hispania Epigraphica.

ICUR A. Silvagni, A. Ferrua and D. Mazzoleni (1922–1985)

Inscriptiones Christianae Vrbis Romae (9 vols.). Rome.

IG (1890–) Inscriptiones Graecae. Berlin.

IGUR L. Moretti (1968–1991) Inscriptiones Graecae Vrbis

Romae. Rome.

ILAf R. Cagnat, A. Merlin and L. Chatelain (1923)

Inscriptions Latines d'Afrique. Paris.

ILCV E. Dielh (1925–1931) Inscriptiones Latinae Christianae

Veteres (3 vols.). Berlin.

IPT Levi della Vida and Amadasi Guzzo (1987).IRPL Arias Vilas, Le Roux and Tranoy (1979).IRT Reynolds and Ward-Perkins (1952).

Łajtar (2006).

LDAB Leuven Database of Ancient Books. Available online

at: www.trismegistos.org/ldab/index.php.

*LPE* Jongeling and Kerr (2005).

LSJ H. G. Liddell and R. Scott (1996) A Greek–English

Lexicon, Revised and Augmented Throughout by H. S. Jones, with the Assistance of R. McKenzie, with a Revised Supplement by P. G. W. Glare, with the

Assistance of A. A. Thompson. Oxford.

Mertens-Pack<sup>3</sup> R. A. Pack, *Index of Greek and Latin Literary Texts* 

from Graeco-Roman Egypt, 3rd (digital) edn. Available

online at: promethee.philo.ulg.ac.be/cedopal/.

OCD S. Hornblower and A. Spawforth (1996) Oxford

Classical Dictionary, 3rd edn. Oxford.

OM O'Mulconry's Glossary, see Stokes (1900).

PG J. G. Migne (1857–1866) Patrologia Graeca (Patrologia

cursus completus, series Graeca). Paris.

PGM K. Preisendanz et al. (1973, 1974) Papyri Graecae

Magicae: Die griechische Zauberpapyri, 2nd edn, revised by A. Henrichs (2 vols.). Leipzig and Berlin.



	List of abbreviations	xvii
PL	J. G. Migne (1844–1864) Patrologia Latina (Patrologia	gia
	cursus completus, series Latina). Paris.	
RIB	R. G. Collingwood, R. P. Wright, S. S. Frere,	
	M. W. C. Hassall, M. Roxan and R. S. O. Tomlin	
	(1965, 1990–1995, 2009) The Roman Inscriptions of	
	Britain. Oxford and Gloucester.	
RIG	PM. Duval et al. (1985–2002) Recueil des inscriptio	ns
	gauloises. Paris.	
RIL	Chabot (1940–1941).	
SEG	(1923–) Supplementum Epigraphicum Graecum.	
	Amsterdam and Leiden.	
ST	H. Rix (2002) Sabellische Texte: Die Texte des	
	Oskischen, Umbrischen und Südpikenischen.	
	Heidelberg.	
ThLL	(1900–) Thesaurus Linguae Latinae. Leipzig.	
v.l.	varia lectio (variant reading).	