

A Theory of Secession The Case for Political Self-Determination

A Theory of Secession: The Case for Political Self-Determination offers an unapologetic defense of the right to secede. Christopher Heath Wellman argues that any group has a moral right to secede as long as its political divorce will leave it and the remainder state in a position to perform the requisite political functions. He explains that there is nothing contradictory about valuing legitimate states while permitting their division. Once political states are recognized as valuable because of the functions that they are uniquely suited to perform, it becomes apparent that the territorial boundaries of existing states might permissibly be redrawn as long as neither the process nor the result of this reconfiguration interrupts the production of the crucial political benefits. Thus, if one values self-determination, then one has good reason to conclude that people have a right to determine their political boundaries.

Christopher Heath Wellman teaches in the Department of Philosophy at Washington University in St. Louis. He works in ethics, specializing in political and legal philosophy, and is coauthor, with A. John Simmons, of *Is There a Duty to Obey the Law?* (2005).



A Theory of Secession

The Case for Political Self-Determination

CHRISTOPHER HEATH WELLMAN

Washington University in St. Louis





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521849159

© Christopher Heath Wellman 2005

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2005

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Wellman, Christopher Heath.

A theory of secession : the case for political self-determination /
Christopher Heath Wellman.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 0-521-84915-2 (hardback)

1. Secession. 2. Self-determination, National. 3. Sovereignty. I. Title.

JC327.W46 2005

320.1′5 – dc22 2004030403

ISBN-13 978-0-521-84915-9 hardback ISBN-10 0-521-84915-2 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For Tim



Contents

Acknowledgments		page ix
1	Introduction	1
2	The Case for Statism	6
3	Valuing Self-Determination	34
4	Lincoln on Secession	65
5	The Truth in Nationalism	97
6	Political Coercion and Exploitation	128
7	Secession and International Law	157
8	The Velvet Transformation	181
Bibliography		187
Index		197



Acknowledgments

I began thinking about secession in graduate school, so my debts date back to my time at the University of Arizona. I was a terribly raw and uncensored student, and I shudder to think how things might have turned out had I not studied alongside such supportive classmates and under the direction of such an attentive and nurturing faculty. I am fond of many places, but Tucson is my movable feast.

Portions of this book draw upon essays that have already appeared in print, and I would like to thank the following journals and presses for allowing me to incorporate parts of my previously published work into this project. "A Defense of Secession and Political Self-Determination" and "Liberalism, Political Legitimacy, and Samaritanism" were both published in *Philosophy and Public Affairs*; "Lincoln on Secession" first appeared in *Social Theory and Practice* (this article was coauthored with Peter Lindsay, so I am especially grateful to Peter for allowing me to draw upon our jointly authored work here); "Nationalism and Secession" was written for Blackwell's *A Companion to Applied Ethics*; "The Paradox of Group Autonomy" was published in *Social Philosophy and Policy*; and "The Truth in the Nationalist Principle" first appeared in the *American Philosophical Quarterly*.

Many friends and colleagues have generously commented on my work over the years, and I would like to reiterate my thanks to the following people for helping me with either the articles just listed or portions of earlier drafts of this book: Patrick Boleyn-Fitzgerald, Bernard Boxill, Jan Boxill, Allen Buchanan, Thomas Christiano, David Copp, Nancy Daukas, Joel Feinberg, Ray Frey, Will Kymlicka, Jonathan Malino, Larry May, David Miller, Ron Milo, Christopher Morris, Wayne Norman, Alan Patten, Ellen



Х

Cambridge University Press
0521849152 - A Theory of Secession: The Case for Political Self-Determination
Christopher Heath Wellman
Frontmatter
More information

Acknowledgments

Frankel Paul, Geoff Sayre-McCord, David Schmidtz, and James Stacey Taylor. Andy Altman, Russ Shafer-Landau, John Simmons, and Carl Wellman deserve special credit (and sympathy) for reading numerous unpublished papers. In addition, I have been very lucky to have worked under three ideal department chairs: Jonathan Malino, Robert Arrington, and George Rainbolt.

It has been a pleasure to work with everyone at Cambridge University Press. I am particularly indebted to the two anonymous reviewers for their detailed feedback and for being so flexible about my reluctance to change aspects of the manuscript. Beatrice Rehl and Eric Schwartz made the production process easier than I could have asked for, and the late Terry Moore exhibited the patience of Job during the years it took me to revise the bloody thing. Above all, I would like to thank Russell Hahn for his extraordinary care, skill, and imagination in editing the manuscript.

Among the many people who have helped me with this project, Allen Buchanan stands out. Everyone who works on secession profits from his peerless work, but none owes him as much as I. Over the last fifteen years, he has been an inspiring professor, a generous mentor, and a cherished friend. Allen is rightly prized for his rigorous argumentation and crystal clear writing, but I have always been most struck by his enthusiasm for philosophy and his (not unrelated) passionate concern with issues that impact people's lives. He and I do not agree on all points, but I suspect that the important ways in which Allen and his work continue to be models for me will be readily apparent to many who read this book.

Naturally, my greatest debts are also the most personal. I am ever thankful that someone as lovely as Donna continues to put up with the likes of me; I rely more than I care to admit on her boundless love, patience, and support. Finally, my deepest and least calculable debts are to my parents, who sacrificed mightily to ensure that my life would be easier than theirs. Those who know Carl professionally will recognize his influence on every page that follows, and those who know me best understand that I could not advance the theses I do unless I were quintessentially my mother's son.

February 2005



A Theory of Secession
The Case for Political Self-Determination