

THE SOCIAL WORLD OF INTELLECTUALS IN THE ROMAN EMPIRE

This book examines the role of social networks in the formation of identity among sophists, philosophers, and Christians in the early Roman Empire. Membership in each category was established and evaluated socially as well as discursively. From clashes over admission to classrooms and communion to construction of the group's history, integration into the social fabric of the community served as both an index of identity and a medium through which contests over status and authority were conducted. The juxtaposition of patterns of belonging in Second Sophistic and early Christian circles reveals a shared repertoire of technologies of self-definition, authorization, and institutionalization, and shows how each group manipulated and adapted those strategies to its own needs. This approach provides a more rounded view of the Second Sophistic and places the early Christian formation of "orthodoxy" in a fresh context.

KENDRA ESHLEMAN is an assistant professor of Classical Studies at Boston College.



GREEK CULTURE IN THE ROMAN WORLD

Editors

SUSAN E. ALCOCK, Brown University JAS ELSNER, Corpus Christi College, Oxford SIMON GOLDHILL, University of Cambridge

The Greek culture of the Roman Empire offers a rich field of study. Extraordinary insights can be gained into processes of multicultural contact and exchange, political and ideological conflict, and the creativity of a changing, polyglot empire. During this period, many fundamental elements of Western society were being set in place: from the rise of Christianity, to an influential system of education, to long-lived artistic canons. This series is the first to focus on the response of Greek culture to its Roman imperial setting as a significant phenomenon in its own right. To this end, it will publish original and innovative research in the art, archaeology, epigraphy, history, philosophy, religion and literature of the empire, with an emphasis on Greek material.

Recent titles in the series:

The Making of Roman India Grant Parker

Philostratus

Edited by Ewen Bowie and Jas Elsner

The Politics of Munificence in the Roman Empire: Citizens, Elites and Benefactors in Asia Minor Arjan Zuiderhoek

Saints and Church Spaces in the Late Antique Mediterranean: Architecture, Cult, and Community Ann Marie Yasin

> Galen and the World of Knowledge Edited by Christopher Gill, Tim Whitmarsh and John Wilkins

Local Knowledge and Microidentities in the Imperial Greek World Edited by Tim Whitmarsh

Homer between History and Fiction in Imperial Greek Literature
Laurence Kim

Facing the Gods: Epiphany and Representation in Graeco-Roman Art, Literature and Religion Verity Platt

> Narrative, Identity and the Ancient Greek Novel Tim Whitmarsh

Women and Visual Replication in Roman Imperial Art and Culture Jennifer Trimble

The Maeander Valley: A Historical Geography from Antiquity to Byzantium Peter Thonemann

Greece and the Augustan Cultural Revolution
A. J. S. Spawforth

Saints and Symposium: The Literature of Food and the Symposium in Greco-Roman and Early Christian Culture Jason König

The Social World of Intellectuals in the Roman Empire: Sophists, Philosophers, and Christians Kendra Eshleman



THE SOCIAL WORLD OF INTELLECTUALS IN THE ROMAN EMPIRE

Sophists, Philosophers, and Christians

KENDRA ESHLEMAN





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town,
Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107026384

© Kendra Eshleman 2012

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2012

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Eshleman, Kendra, 1973–

The social world of intellectuals in the Roman Empire : sophists, philosophers, and Christians / Kendra Eshleman.

pages cm. – (Greek culture in the Roman world) Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-02638-4

- 1. Social networks Rome. 2. Social structure Rome. 3. Group identity Rome.
- 4. Identity (Philosophical concept) History To 1500. 5. Rome Intellectual life.
- 6. Sophists (Greek philosophy) 7. Second Sophistic movement. 8. Philosophers Rome.

9. Christians – Rome. I. Title.

DG78.E75 2012 305.5′520937 – dc23 2012018821

ISBN 978-1-107-02638-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

Li	st of figures	<i>page</i> vi
Αι	rknowledgments	vii
N	ote on abbreviations	ix
	Introduction: "Who are you?" The social formation of identity	I
I	Inclusion and identity	21
2	Contesting competence: the ideal of self-determination	67
3	Expertise and authority in the early church	91
4	Defining the circle of sophists: Philostratus and the construction of the Second Sophistic	125
5	Becoming orthodox: heresiology as self-fashioning	149
6	Successions and self-definition	177
7	"From such mothers and fathers": succession narratives in	
	early Christian discourse	213
	Conclusion	259
References		263
Index		288

V



Figures

I	Major figures mentioned in Philostratus, Lives of the Sophists	<i>page</i> 130
2	Genealogy of heresy according to Hippolytus, Refutation	228



Acknowledgments

This book began life as a dissertation written at the University of Michigan. Its seed was planted by David Potter: hearing that I wanted to write on early Christian heresy, he sent me off to read Hippolytus and Philostratus, two authors unknown to me, but who he promised would have much to say to each other. He was right, as he usually is. The project has evolved considerably from its initial form, but it has been nourished throughout by David's wisdom, enthusiasm, and apparent omniscience.

On the road to publication, a book accrues many debts. The bulk of the revisions were completed with the help of a Boston College Faculty Fellowship in the spring of 2010. An earlier version of Chapter 4 appeared in Classical Philology 103 (2008). Lauren Caldwell read more drafts than she probably cares to remember, and she helped to make straight much that was tangled and inelegant. The book would never have been completed without her. Others who commented on drafts, fielded queries, and asked inconvenient questions include Sara Ahbel-Rappe, Derek Collins, John Finamore, Daniel Harris-McCoy, Meredith Monaghan, Catherine R. Osborne, Pheme Perkins, Jim Porter, Adam Serfass, William Turpin, Chris van den Berg, Tim Whitmarsh, Meghan Williams, Ralph Williams, and two anonymous readers at Cambridge University Press. I am grateful as well to the many others who responded to portions of the work in progress at the American Philological Association, the Classical Association of the Middle West and South, the Boston Patristics Group, the MACTe Junior Faculty group, the University of Toronto, Georgetown, Oberlin, Skidmore, Boston College, and the Mennonite Congregation of Boston. Aaron Hertzmann helped to find the cover image and has generally been a font of practical wisdom. Corey Streitweiser was a prince among proofreaders.

To my family – Ken and Myrna Eshleman, Tina Eshleman, Don Harrison, Olivia Page Harrison, Lin Albertson Thorpe – are due special thanks



viii

Acknowledgments

for setting my feet on paths of scholarship and for their love and support through the long gestation of this book.

Finally, my husband, Jeremy Thorpe, to whom this book is dedicated. He prepared the figures, talked me through the hard bits, and knows more about Alexander the Clay-Plato than a reasonable person ought.



Note on abbreviations

Citations of periodicals follow the abbreviations used by *L'Année philologique*. Abbreviations for ancient authors and works follow the *Oxford Latin Dictionary* and Liddell–Scott–Jones' *Greek–English Lexicon*; for Christian texts not covered by those two works, I have followed the system of the Society of Biblical Literature.