

ETHICS AND POWER IN MEDIEVAL ENGLISH REFORMIST WRITING

The late medieval Church obliged all Christians to rebuke the sins of others, especially those who had power to discipline in Church and state: priests, confessors, bishops, judges, the Pope. This practice, in which the injured party had to confront the wrongdoer directly and privately, was known as fraternal correction. Edwin Craun examines how pastoral writing instructed Christians to make this corrective process effective by avoiding slander, insult, and hypocrisy. He explores how John Wyclif and his followers expanded this established practice to authorize their own polemics against mendicants and clerical wealth. Finally, he traces how major English reformist writing – Piers Plowman, Mum and the Sothsegger, and The Book of Margery Kempe - expanded the practice to justify their protests, to protect themselves from repressive elements in the late Ricardian and Lancastrian Church and state, and to urge their readers to mount effective protests against religious, social, and political abuses.

EDWIN D. CRAUN is Henry S. Fox, Jr. Professor of English at Washington and Lee University.



CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN MEDIEVAL LITERATURE

GENERAL EDITOR
Alastair Minnis, Yale University

EDITORIAL BOARD

Zygmunt G. Barański, University of Cambridge
Christopher C. Baswell, University of California, Los Angeles
John Burrow, University of Bristol
Mary Carruthers, New York University
Rita Copeland, University of Pennsylvania
Simon Gaunt, King's College London
Steven Kruger, City University of New York
Nigel Palmer, University of Oxford
Winthrop Wetherbee, Cornell University
Jocelyn Wogan-Browne, Fordham University

This series of critical books seeks to cover the whole area of literature written in the major medieval languages – the main European vernaculars, and medieval Latin and Greek – during the period c. 1100–1500. Its chief aim is to publish and stimulate fresh scholarship and criticism on medieval literature, special emphasis being placed on understanding major works of poetry, prose, and drama in relation to the contemporary culture and learning which fostered them.

RECENT TITLES IN THE SERIES

Jenni Nuttall The Creation of Lancastrian Kingship: Literature,
Language and Politics in Late Medieval England
Laura Ashe Fiction and History in England, 1066–1200

Mary Carruthers The Book of Memory: A Study of Memory in Medieval Culture
J. A. Burrow The Poetry of Praise
Andrew Cole Literature and Heresy in the Age of Chaucer
Suzanne M. Yeager Jerusalem in Medieval Narrative

Nicole R. Rice Lay Piety and Religious Discipline in Middle English Literature
D. H. Green Women and Marriage in German Medieval Romance
Peter Godman Paradoxes of Conscience in the High Middle
Ages: Abelard, Heloise and the Archpoet
Edwin D. Craun Ethics and Power in Medieval English Reformist Writing
Anthony J. Hasler Court Poetry in Late Medieval
England and Scotland: Allegories of Authority

A complete list of titles in the series can be found at the end of the volume.



ETHICS AND POWER IN MEDIEVAL ENGLISH REFORMIST WRITING

EDWIN D. CRAUN





> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo

> > Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521199322

© Edwin D. Craun 2010

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2010

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Craun, Edwin D. Ethics and power in medieval English reformist writing / Edwin D. Craun.

p. cm.

(Cambridge studies in medieval literature ; 76) ISBN 978-0-521-19932-2 (Hardback)

Admonition-History-To 1500.
 England-Church history-1066-1485.
 Church renewal-England-History-To 1500.
 Church discipline-England-History-To 1500.
 Christian literature, English (Middle)-History and criticism.

BR747.C73 2010 241.0942'09023-dc22 2009044696

ISBN 978-0-521-19932-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For Marlys, Lad, and Harlan



Contents

Acknowledgments Editorial practices, translations, abbreviations		<i>page</i> ix	
		xi	
	Introduction	I	
I	Universalizing correction as a moral practice	IO	
	Pastoral power and sin	12	
	Out of the monastery	15	
	Major sources	18	
	Sharing in pastoral reform: fraternal correction as moral practice	23	
	Pastoral power and power relations	27	
2	Negotiating contrary things	35	
	Universalist charity and avoiding intrusiveness	37	
	The dangers of hypocrisy and the imperatives of charity	40	
	Good repute and the common good	46	
	Courtliness and harshness	52	
	Moral authority	54	
3	Managing the rhetoric of reproof: the		
	B-version of <i>Piers Plowman</i>	57	
	Branding reproof as deviant: the galled horse bites back	61	
	Clergie and the corrector's integrity	65	
	Abiding by law: the "lewed" person's authority to correct		
	communal sin publicly	69	
	Mismade reproof: fallible Will	79	
	Licensing reformist fiction	82	
4	John Wyclif: disciplining the English clergy and the Pope	85	
5	Wycliffites under oppression: fraternal correction		
	as polemical weapon	IOI	

vii



viii	Contents	
	The true corrector	105
	Wresting pastoral care from the clergy	114
6	Lancastrian reformist lives: toeing the	
	line while stepping over it	120
	The truth-teller in political life: Mum and the Sothsegger	125
	The holy woman: Margery Kempe the impeccable corrector	132
	Postscript	143
Notes		147
Bibliography		194
Index		2.10



Acknowledgments

The final research for this project and the early stages of writing were supported by a series of grants. In 2002-3 I held a Jessie Ball duPont Fellowship at the National Humanities Center, made possible by the Jessie Ball duPont Religious, Charitable and Educational Fund; my fellowship was supplemented by the Duke Endowment. The Center staff, not least of all the librarians and Kent Mulliken, the Deputy Director at a time of transition, were unstintingly helpful, while the Fellows that year provided intellectual companionship for which I was starved. I was spoiled for life. During the fall of 2002 a Huntington Library and British Academy Fellowship enabled me to extend my research in manuscripts in British collections. In 2003 I held a Fellowship for College Teachers from the National Endowment for the Humanities, while Washington and Lee University supported the project from its inception to its end with a series of John M. Glenn grants during summers and with one Robert E. Lee grant, which gave me a second resourceful student assistant, Katie Destiny Compton. The first, equally resourceful, was Jennifer Fisher.

Few teachers at a liberal arts college have been luckier in their colleagues than I. Lad Sessions in philosophy and David Peterson in medieval and Renaissance Italian history persistently asked searching questions about the earliest draft of the first two chapters that shaped the entire course of this book, while Genelle Gertz has shared ideas about women's religious speech and writing ever since she arrived in my department five years ago. The direction of the whole book – indeed, its very brand of history – was set in part by generous comments by the members of the Medieval/Early Modern Writing Group at the National Humanities Center in 2003: Kathryn Burns, Paulina Kewes, Joanne Rappaport, Moshe Sluhovsky, Helen Solterer, and, over several more years, Kalman Bland, Annabel Wharton, and Gail Gibson. I received shrewd comments on individual chapters or the papers that preceded them from Larry Clopper, Thelma Fenster, the late David Fowler, Andy Galloway, Mike



x

Cambridge University Press 9780-521-19932-2 - Ethics and Power in Medieval English Reformist Writing Edwin D. Craun Frontmatter More information

Acknowledgments

Kuczynski, Susan Phillips, Derrick Pitard, Dan Smail, Jan Ziolkowski, and the members of the Cultural Studies Colloquium at Washington and Lee. Three editors at Cambridge University Press – Linda Bree, Elizabeth Hanlon, and Rosina Di Marzo – moved my typescripts resourcefully through publication, and Damian Love proved to be the inquisitive and imaginative copy-editor a scholar longs for.

I am indebted to these institutions and people for access to manuscripts in their keeping: the Bodleian Library (chiefly); the British Library; Cambridge University Library; the Master and Fellows of Balliol College, Oxford; the President and Fellows of Magdalen College, Oxford; the Warden and Fellows of Merton College, Oxford; the Provost and Fellows of Oriel College, Oxford; the Master and Fellows of Sidney Sussex College, Cambridge; the Master and Fellows of University College, Oxford; and the Marquess of Bath. Siegfried Wenzel generously shared with me material from several sermons. The librarians at Washington and Lee have been a constant resource, especially the unbeatable Elizabeth Teaffe in interlibrary loans. "'3e, by Peter and by Poul': Lewte and the Practice of Fraternal Correction," an early version of the middle of chapter 3, appeared in The Yearbook of Langland Studies 15 (2001), while part of chapter 6, "Fama and Pastoral Constraints on Rebuking Sinners: The Book of Margery Kempe," was published by Cornell University Press in 2003 in "Fama": The Politics of Talk and Reputation in Medieval Europe, edited by Thelma Fenster and Daniel L. Smail.

The dedication of this book records what may seem an unusual debt for an academic. My engagement in the ethics of social and institutional reform has been vivified over the years by three extraordinary people: my wife, Marlys, who devoted twenty-five years to administering public programs for the chronically mentally ill in the face of declining financial support and increasing mandates; my friend Lad Sessions, who dared, as a dean, to imagine that resources for the humanities and social sciences should not be eclipsed by commerce and law; and my friend Harlan Beckley, who founded and runs the innovative Shepherd Program for the Study of Poverty and Human Capability at Washington and Lee University. In the United States of the end of the twentieth and beginning of the twenty-first centuries, only the brave can be fair.

Oxford, Oxon., and Timber Ridge, Virginia



Editorial practices, translations, abbreviations

I modernize Middle English thorn, yogh, and i-y-u-v placements, whether in my transcriptions from manuscripts, in early printed books, or in modern editions. In Latin passages, I use i for the vowel, j for the consonant; u for the vowel, v for the consonant. I use modern punctuation and capitalization, and I expand contractions. I give all names in the person's vernacular, not Latin for some and English for others. I slightly modernize verses from the Douai translation of the Bible, using it throughout and occasionally modifying it to reflect how my sources read the Vulgate. Save for the Douai, all translations are mine. I use the following abbreviations:

CCCM	Corpus Christianorum: Continuatio Mediaevalis
	(Turnhout: Brepols, 1966–)
CCSL	Corpus Christianorum Scriptorum Latinorum
	(Turnhout: Brepols, 1953–)
CSEL	Corpus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum Latinorum (Vienna/
	Leipzig, Prague: Kommission zur Herausgabe des Corpus
	der lateinischen Kirchenväter, 1866–)
DML	Dictionary of Medieval Latin from British Sources
	(London: Oxford University Press, 1975–)
EETS	Early English Text Society (o.s. for original series and e.s.
	for extra series)
MED	Middle English Dictionary (Ann Arbor: University of
	Michigan Press, 1956–2001)
OED	Oxford English Dictionary, 2nd edn (Oxford University
	Press, 1989)
PL	Patrologia Latina (Paris: Jacques-Paul Migne, 1844–65)