

Elisa Freschi / Tiziana Pontillo

Rule-extension Strategies in Ancient India

Ritual, Exegetical and Linguistic Considerations
on the *tantra*- and *prasaṅga*-Principles



PETER LANG
EDITION

Contents

Acknowledgements	xi
1 General Introduction	1
1.1 Conceptual tools for dealing with continuity and discontinuity . .	2
1.2 <i>tantra</i> as opposed to <i>prasaṅga</i>	5
1.3 Questions	5
2 <i>tantra</i>	7
2.1 Chronology of the Śrautasūtras	7
2.2 <i>tantra</i> in the Śrautasūtras	9
2.2.1 <i>tantra</i> in the sense of basic procedure	10
2.2.2 “Just once” vs. repeatedly	14
2.2.3 <i>tantra</i> as a part of the basic procedure	16
2.2.4 Further developments of <i>tantra</i>	17
2.2.5 Conclusions on the meaning of <i>tantra</i> in the Śrautasūtras	18
2.3 The hermeneutic usage of <i>tantra</i> in the Śrautasūtras	18
2.3.1 <i>tantra</i> as a principle	18
2.3.1.1 Hermeneutical background	19
2.3.1.1.1 <i>saṁsthā</i>	20
2.3.1.1.2 <i>pratyaya</i>	22
2.3.1.1.3 <i>nyāya</i>	23
2.4 The syntactic role of <i>tantra</i> in the Śrautasūtras	24
2.4.1 <i>tantra</i> and <i>āvāpa</i>	24
2.4.1.1 <i>tantrasthāna</i>	26
2.5 The semantic web of <i>tantra</i> in the Śrautasūtras	27
2.5.1 <i>tantra</i> , <i>prakṛti</i> and <i>kalpa</i>	27
2.5.2 <i>tantra</i> and <i>tati</i>	28
2.5.3 <i>prakṛti-tantra</i> distinction: the operative value of <i>tantra</i> . .	32
2.5.3.1 KātyŚrSū 1.7.2	32
2.5.3.2 <i>śruti</i> and <i>tantra</i>	34
2.6 <i>tantra</i> in Mīmāṃsā	35

2.6.1	Jhā's understanding	35
2.6.2	<i>tantra</i> in its various meanings	35
2.6.3	<i>tantra</i> in Jaimini	38
2.6.3.1	Conditions for <i>tantra</i>	43
2.6.3.2	semantic web of <i>tantra</i> in Jaimini	44
2.6.3.3	<i>tantrin</i> and hierarchy of <i>tantras</i>	45
2.6.4	What are the differences between the Mīmāṃsā and the Śrautasūtras' usage of <i>tantra</i> ?	46
2.7	<i>tantra</i> in Vyākaraṇa	46
2.7.1	<i>tantra</i> in Pāṇini	46
2.7.2	<i>tantra</i> in the <i>Mahābhāṣya</i>	48
2.7.3	Are gender and number of a word in the <i>Aṣṭādhyāyī tantra</i> ?	49
2.7.4	Rice and husks, fish and scales	53
2.7.5	Is the comparative suffix in the <i>Aṣṭādhyāyī tantra</i> ?	55
2.7.6	<i>tantra</i> vs. <i>nipātana</i>	59
2.7.7	Conclusions on <i>tantra</i> in Vyākaraṇa	61
2.7.8	What are the differences between the Vyākaraṇa's and the Śrautasūtra-Mīmāṃsā's usage of <i>tantra</i> ?	64
2.8	Semantic analysis of <i>tantra</i>	64
3	<i>prasaṅga</i>	65
3.1	How to translate <i>prasaṅga</i>	65
3.2	<i>prasaṅga</i> in the Śrautasūtras	66
3.2.1	<i>prasaṅga</i> in KātyŚrSū	67
3.2.2	Meaning of <i>prasaṅga</i> in the Śrautasūtras and difference from <i>tantra</i>	70
3.3	<i>prasaṅga</i> in Mīmāṃsā	71
3.3.1	Examples	72
3.3.2	<i>prasaṅga</i> in Jaimini	73
3.3.3	Meaning of <i>prasaṅga</i> in Jaimini and difference from <i>tantra</i>	75
3.3.4	<i>prāsaṅgika</i> in Jaimini	76
3.3.5	Summary on the semantics of <i>prasaṅga</i>	77
3.3.5.1	Contiguity in <i>prasaṅga</i>	79
3.3.5.2	<i>prasaṅga</i> and <i>vidhi</i>	79
3.3.6	<i>prasaṅga</i> in Mīmāṃsā: similarities with Vyākaraṇa?	80
3.4	<i>prasaṅga</i> in Vyākaraṇa	81
3.4.1	<i>prasaṅga</i> in Kātyāyana's <i>vārttikas</i>	82
3.4.1.1	<i>prasaṅga</i> as an automatic involvement to be tested	84
3.4.1.2	<i>prasaṅga</i> as the involvement of something which is not there	86
3.4.1.3	<i>prasaṅga</i> as the involvement of a rule or of a segment of rule	88
3.4.1.4	Conflict between <i>prasaṅgas</i>	90

3.4.1.5	Is <i>prasaṅga</i> an undesired consequence?	91
3.4.2	Conclusions on <i>prasaṅga</i> in Kātyāyana's <i>vārttikas</i>	94
3.4.3	<i>prasaṅga</i> in the <i>Mahābhāṣya</i>	94
3.4.3.1	Multiplicity of potential involvements	105
3.4.4	Comparison between the <i>prasaṅga</i> - and the <i>ādeśa</i> -system in the M	106
3.4.4.1	Contra	106
3.4.4.2	Pro	109
3.4.4.3	Rule-extension as a common practice	112
3.4.4.4	Patañjali's descriptive methodology: <i>sthānivat</i>	114
3.4.4.5	Conclusions on the comparison between substi- tution and <i>prasaṅga</i>	116
3.4.5	Conclusions on <i>prasaṅga</i> in the <i>Mahābhāṣya</i>	120
3.4.6	<i>prasakta</i>	121
3.4.7	<i>prasaṅga</i> /attachment	122
3.4.7.1	<i>prasaṅga</i> in the sense of "attachment" in pre- classical Sanskrit Literature	122
3.4.8	Conclusions on <i>prasaṅga</i> and <i>tantra</i> in Vyākaraṇa	123
3.5	Different approaches to substitution: <i>ādeśa</i> , <i>vikāra</i> and <i>pratinidhi</i>	123
3.5.1	<i>vikāra</i>	123
3.5.2	<i>ādeśa</i>	124
3.5.3	<i>ādeśa</i> and <i>vikāra</i> in Kalpasūtra, Nirukta and Vyākaraṇa	124
3.5.3.1	Kalpasūtras and Prātiśākhya	124
3.5.3.2	Yāska, Pāṇini and Patañjali	125
3.5.4	<i>pratinidhi</i> in the Śrautasūtras	128
4	Śābara and Bhartṛhari and thereafter	131
4.1	Śābara on <i>tantra</i> and <i>prasaṅga</i>	132
4.1.1	What does Śābara think about <i>tantra</i> and <i>prasaṅga</i> ?	132
4.1.1.1	Further requirement of <i>prasaṅga</i>	134
4.1.1.2	Distinction of <i>tantra</i> and <i>prasaṅga</i>	135
4.1.2	Bhartṛhari and the verse on <i>tantra</i> and <i>prasaṅga</i>	135
4.1.3	Śābara and the verse on <i>tantra</i> and <i>prasaṅga</i>	144
4.1.3.1	<i>aprayojaka</i>	148
4.1.4	Śābara on <i>tantra</i> and <i>prasaṅga</i> : contexts of usage	148
4.1.5	<i>prasaṅga</i> from Jaimini to Śābara	150
4.2	<i>tantra</i> and <i>prasaṅga</i> after Śābara	150
4.2.1	Later developments	150
4.2.2	Context for <i>tantra</i> and <i>prasaṅga</i> in later Mīmāṃsā	151
4.2.3	<i>prasaṅga</i> as a śāstric term	152
4.2.3.1	<i>prasaṅga</i> in early Nyāya	152
4.2.3.2	<i>prasaṅga</i> in Nāgārjuna	154

5 Conclusions	157
Function <i>in absentia</i> explained through spatial substitution instead of sequential disappearance	157
Śrautasūtra, Mimāṃsā and Vyākaraṇa: a common prehistory?	157
Summary on <i>tantra</i> and <i>prasaṅga</i>	157
Mutual influences?	159
Further directions of research	159
Abbreviations	161
Bibliography	163
Index	175