Zhong Zheng

Taking Private Use Seriously

A Critical Evaluation of the Legal Treatment of Private Use under Chinese Digital Copyright Law
## Table of Contents

Abbreviations ...................................................................................................... 15

Introduction ......................................................................................................... 17

I. Research Content: Private Use ................................................................ 18
  1. Terminology ........................................................................................ 18
  2. Definition ............................................................................................. 19
  3. The Boundary between Private Use and Copyright: Enjoyment vs. Exploitation ................................................................................. 20
  4. The Intersection between Private Use and Copyright: Copying of Works ................................................................................................. 22

II. Research Context: China ........................................................................ 25
  1. Universal Problems in Private Use Issues and China’s Special Instance .................................................................................................. 25
  2. The Significance of Research on Private Use in the Chinese Context ........................................................................................................... 27

III. Methodology and Structure.............................................................................. 28

Chapter I The Legal Treatment of Private Use under Chinese Copyright Law ..................................................................................................... 33
  1.1 Legal Framework of Chinese Copyright Law ....................................... 34
    1.1.1 General Principles .......................................................................... 34
    1.1.2 Protected Copyright ....................................................................... 36
      1.1.2.1 Moral Rights and Economic Rights ........................................ 36
      1.1.2.2 Standards for Copyright Infringement .................................... 38
      1.1.2.3 “Dual System” Approach to Copyright Protection ................. 41
    1.1.3 Restrictions on Copyright .............................................................. 43
      1.1.3.1 Chinese Copyright Limitation System in General ............... 44
      1.1.3.2 “Fair Use” under the Chinese Copyright Law ...................... 46

  1.2 Statutory “Free Zone” of Private Use under Chinese Copyright Law ............................................................................................................ 50
1.2.1 First Sale Doctrine ........................................................................................................ 51
1.2.2 Private Use Exemption within Fair Use .................................................................. 53
1.2.3 Restrictions on Private Use Exemption by “Three-step Test” .......................... 55
1.3 The Impact of Digitisation on the Legal Treatment of Private Use in Contemporary China .................................................................................................................. 57
  1.3.1 Copyright Expansion in the Digital Environment ............................................. 58
  1.3.2 The First Sale Doctrine Is Inapplicable in Cyberspace .................................. 59
  1.3.3 No Private Use Exemption within Fair Use of Information Network Transmission Right ................................................................. 61
  1.3.4 No Private Use Exception to the Anticircumvention Provision of TPMs .......... 63
1.4 Summary ......................................................................................................................... 65

Chapter II  Private Use and the China Piracy Battle ......................................................... 67
2.1 Legislative Background of the Chinese Digital Copyright System ...................... 67
  2.1.1 Great Pressure Against China’s Piracy ............................................................... 67
  2.1.2 Impact from the International Copyright Protection Framework ................... 70
  2.1.3 Piracy Suspected P2P File Sharing by Individual Users ................................. 73
  2.1.4 No “Free Zone” of Private Use in Digital Copyright Framework as an Anti-piracy Measure .................................................................................................................. 76
2.2 The Gap between “Law on the Books” and “Law in Action”: Institutional Analysis of the Piracy Dilemma in China ................................................................. 78
  2.2.1 Foreign Pressure and China’s Copyright Regime: A Review of Chinese Copyright Law Making History ................................................................. 79
    2.2.1.1 Law at Gunpoint: A History of the Neoteric Chinese Copyright Law ........ 80
    2.2.1.2 Ups and Downs: Copyright Policy of the PRC from 1949-1976 .................... 82
    2.2.1.3 The Foundation of Socialist Copyright Law: Requirements of the Opening-up policy and the Normalization of China-US Relationship ................................................................. 87
  2.2.2 Limitations of the Copyright Implementation “Dual System” ....................... 91
    2.2.2.1 The Administrative Dominant “Dual System” ........................................ 92
### Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.2.2.2 Limitations of an Administrative Dominant Copyright Protection Regime</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.3 Fostering a Culture of Copyright in Chinese Society: A Long Way to Go</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.4 Pricing: A Vital Factor Influencing the Buying Behavior of Piracy Products in the Chinese Market</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 Summary</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter III Pros and Cons: Debates on Employing TPMs to Control Private Use in the Digital Environment</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Locating the Boundary between Exploitation and Enjoyment</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.1 Commercial Use or Noncommercial Use</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.1.1 Commercial Use Effecting on Exploitation</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.1.2 Noncommercial Use for Enjoyment</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.1.3 A Plausible Boundary between Commercial Use and Noncommercial Use</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.2 Market Place or Private Domain</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.2.1 Copyright as a Marketing Monopoly</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.2.2 Non-competitive Private Use in the Private Domain</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.3 The Blurred Distinction between Enjoyment and Exploitation in the Digital Environment</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 Efforts to Harmonize TPMs and Private Use</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1 Prerequisite of TPMs Protection in the 1996 WIPO “Internet Treaties”</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2 Saving Clauses on TPMs Protection in the Digital Millennium Copyright Act of 1998</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.3 Judicial Restraint on the Application of Anticircumvention Rules: MGE UPS Systems Inc. v. GE Consumer and Industrial Inc.</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.4 Copyright Limitations as Users’ Right: CCH Canadian Limited v. Law Society of Upper Canada</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 Assumption I: “Unauthorized Copying is Piracy”</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.1 The Market Failure Justification of Private Copying Loses Its Importance in the Digital Environment</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Taking Private Use Seriously

3.3.1.1 The Public Goods Characteristics of Intellectual Creations ................................................. 144
3.3.1.2 Transaction Costs of Forbidding Private Copying: Market Failure Consideration ......................... 145
3.3.1.3 No Market Failure, No Private Copying Exemption ............ 147
3.3.2 From de minimas to Multiple: Private Copying as Competitive Exploitation in the Digital Environment ......................... 148
3.3.2.1 Private Copying as Displaced Sales ....................................... 149
3.3.2.2 Accumulative Noncommercial Use Equals Commercial Use .......................................................... 150
3.3.3 The Necessity of Access Control by TPMs ........................................................ 151
3.3.3.1 From Having Copies to Experiencing Works: The Shifting Exploitation of Works ............................. 152
3.3.3.2 Price Discrimination Depending on Various Uses of Works ................................................................ 153
3.4 Assumption II: The Undue Encroachment of Copyright on Users’ “Free Zone” ......................................................... 155
3.4.1 Control on the Use of Works Exceeding Copyright ................................................................. 156
3.4.2 Perfect Control in the TPMs “Panoptical Prison” Harms User’s Fundamental Rights ................................. 157
3.4.2.1 User’s Autonomy in the Use of Works ......................................................... 158
3.4.2.2 User’s Right to Privacy ........................................................................... 159
3.4.3 Copy-preventing Control Undermines the Free Speech Value of Private Copying ......................................................... 161
3.5 What is the Place of Private Use in the Digital Copyright Regime? .. 164
3.5.1 Starting Point: What Is the Copyright Law For? ......................... 164
3.5.1.1 Historical Divergence of Copyright Laws in Anglo-US and Continental European Countries .................. 165
3.5.1.2 The “Dual Objective” of the Chinese Copyright Law ........ 178
3.5.2 Evaluation of the Incentive-based Perfect Control Approach .... 182
3.5.2.1 The Merits of TPMs for Copyright Protection ................. 182
3.5.2.2 The Limitations of Perfect Control on Creativity  
Enhancement from a Dynamic Efficiency Perspective .......... 183
3.5.2.3 Towards an Appropriate Level of Copyright Incentive....... 194
3.5.3 Why Should Copyright Law Care about Private Use? .......... 197
   3.5.3.1 Consideration of the Ultimate Objective of Chinese  
Copyright Law .................................................................................. 197
   3.5.3.2 “Consumption Is Itself Productive” ............................... 200
   3.5.3.3 Technology Neutrality and Consumers’ Reasonable  
Expectations ...................................................................................... 201
3.6 Summary .................................................................................... 204

Chapter IV Alternative Business Models of Digital Content Provision  
and Their Social Conditions ................................................................ 207
4.1 Four Alternative Business Models ............................................ 207
   4.1.1 The “TPMs & Contract” Model ........................................... 208
   4.1.2 The “Levy System” Model ............................................... 209
   4.1.3 The “Device-Centric” Model ............................................. 211
   4.1.4 The “Cloud” Model ......................................................... 212
4.2 No Best Alternative: Pros and Cons of Diverse Business Models  
towards Private Use ........................................................................ 214
   4.2.1 The “TPMs & Contract” Model ........................................... 215
   4.2.2 The “Levy System” Model ............................................... 218
   4.2.3 The “Device-Centric” Model ............................................. 219
   4.2.4 The “Cloud” Model ......................................................... 221
4.3 Business Models and Required Social Conditions .................... 223
   4.3.1 The “TPMs & Contract” Model ........................................... 223
   4.3.2 The “Levy System” Model ............................................... 225
   4.3.3 The “Device-Centric” Model ............................................. 228
   4.3.4 The “Cloud” Model ......................................................... 229
4.4 Problems in Chinese Practice of Reaching the Necessary  
Social Conditions ............................................................................. 229
4.4.1 The Difficulty in Distinguishing Between Private Use and Piracy ........................................................................... 230
4.4.2 Agency Capture & Corruption ..................................................... 231
4.4.3 The Conflict Between Free Competition and Commercial Profit ....................................................................................... 232
4.4.4 Full Internet Penetration Takes Time .......................................... 234
4.4.5 Security Concerns for “Cloud” ........................................................ 236
4.4.6 The Dilemma Between Access and Control .................................. 237
4.5 Summary ........................................................................................................ 238

Chapter V Working Proposals of the Legal Treatment of Private Use in China: An Example of the “TPMs & Contract” Model ................................ 241

5.1 Considerations for Determining Private Use .......................................... 242
5.1.1 Determining Noncommercial Use: Weighing the Impact of Particular Private Use on Copyright Incentives and Liberties .... 243
5.1.2 Restrictive Interpretation on Private Domain ........................................ 246
5.2 Legal Protection of TPMs Should Follow Copyright Limitations .... 247
5.2.1 Adding Private Use Limitation in Digital Copyright Framework .......................................................... 248
5.2.2 A Restrictive Reading of “Effectiveness” in Anticircumvention Rules ....................................................................................... 251
5.3 Regularizing the Third-Party Institution Management Infrastructure ........................................................................... 253
5.3.1 Choosing the NCAC as the Third-Party Institution ...................... 253
5.3.2 Regularizing the NCAC’s Management for Transparency ........ 254
5.4 Summary ........................................................................................................ 256

Conclusion ......................................................................................................... 257

Bibliography ...................................................................................................... 259