

Philip Chika Omenukwa

An Ecclesiological Exploration of the Four Marks of the Church

An Ecumenical Option
for the Church in Nigeria



PETER LANG
EDITION

Table of Contents

Abbreviations	XIX
General Introduction	1
Structure of the Work	2
The Aim of the Work and the Choice of Francis Sullivan	3
Chapter One: Francis Sullivan and His Notion of the Church	5
Introduction	5
1.1 An Overview of the Life and Works of Francis Sullivan	5
1.1.1 Early Life and Education	6
1.1.2 The Development of Sullivan's Ecclesiological and Theological Thoughts	8
1.1.3 Historico-Theological Context of Sullivan's Ecclesiology	11
1.1.4 Sullivan's Theological Method	15
1.1.5 The Theological Vision of Sullivan	17
1.2 Sullivan's Notion of the Church	21
1.2.1 The Church: Any Possibility of Definition?	21
1.2.1.1 The Church as Mystery of Faith	23
1.2.1.2 The Church as a 'Kind of Sacrament'	26
1.2.1.3 The Church as the Work of the Trinity	30
1.2.1.4 The Church and the Kingdom of God	32
1.2.1.5 The Church as the Body of Christ	35
Concluding Remarks	38
Chapter Two: The Marks of the Church	41
Introduction	41
2.1 The Oneness of the Church	41
2.1.1 The Church's Oneness as Understood in the New Testament Period and in the Early Church	42
2.1.2 The Essential Constitutive Bond of the Oneness of the Church	44
2.1.2.1 Oneness of Apostolic Faith	47
2.1.2.2 Oneness of Sacramental Life	49
2.1.2.3 Oneness of Apostolic Ministry	52

2.1.3	The Foundational Source of the Oneness of the Church	54
2.1.4	The Notion of Unity in Diversity	56
2.1.5	The Theological Implication of the Profession of Oneness of the Church	59
2.1.5.1	The Oneness of the Church as a Gift and as a Task ...	59
2.2	The Holiness of the Church	60
2.2.1	The Biblical Notion of Holiness	63
2.2.2	The Essential Constitutive Elements of the Holiness of the Church	64
2.2.2.1	Holiness of the Constitutive Elements	65
2.2.2.2	Holiness of Consecration	66
2.2.2.3	Holiness of Grace and Charity	68
2.2.3	Grounds for the Indefectibility of the Holiness of the Church	70
2.2.3.1	Holiness as the Fruit of Christ's Sacrifice	72
2.2.3.2	The Church as the Bride of Christ	73
2.2.3.3	The Abiding Gift of the Holy Spirit	73
2.2.4	The Theological Implication of the Profession of Holiness	74
2.2.4.1	Holiness and Sinfulness as Constitutive Components of the Church's Holiness	76
2.2.4.2	The Implication of Holiness as Renewal in ever Continuum	77
2.2.4.3	The Holiness of the Church as a Gift and a Vocation	79
2.3	The Catholicity of the Church	80
2.3.1	The Identity of the Church's Catholicity	82
2.3.2	The Catholicity of the Church and some basic Distinctions	83
2.3.2.1	Catholicity as Primarily Distinguished from Catholicism	84
2.3.2.2	Catholicity as Primarily Distinguished from a Geographical Concept	85
2.3.2.3	Catholicity as Primarily Distinguished from Statistical Concept	86
2.3.2.4	Catholicity as Primarily Distinguished from a Sociological Concept	87

2.3.2.5	Catholicity as Primarily Distinguished from an Historical Concept	88
2.3.2.6	Qualitative and Quantitative Understanding of Catholicity	90
2.3.3	Some of the Essential Features of the Catholicity of the Church	91
2.3.3.1	Catholicity as Unity in Diversity	92
2.3.3.2	Catholicity as Apostolicity of Faith	94
2.3.3.3	Catholicity as Vocation to Holiness of Life	95
2.3.4	The Intrinsic Demand of the Profession of Catholicity	96
2.3.4.1	Catholicity as a Gift and a Task	97
2.4	The Apostolicity of the Church	99
2.4.1	Understanding the term “Apostle”	102
2.4.2	The Meaning of Apostolicity	105
2.4.2.1	Apostolicity of Origin	106
2.4.2.2	Apostolicity of Doctrine	108
2.4.2.3	The Apostolicity of Life	109
2.4.2.4	Apostolic Succession	111
2.4.3	The Theological Implication of the Profession of Apostolicity of the Church	114
2.4.3.1	Apostolicity as a Gift and as a Task	114
	Concluding Remarks	115
Chapter Three: The Dynamics of Sullivan’s Ecclesiological		
	Articulation of the Four Marks of the Church	117
	Introduction	117
3.1	The Oneness of the Church	118
3.1.1	The Church of Christ “subsists” in the Catholic Church	119
3.1.1.1	Controversy as to the Legitimate Interpretation of the new Introduction of “subsistit in” instead of “est.”	120
3.1.1.2	Argument Based on the Constitutive Understanding of its Etymological Foundation	123
3.1.1.3	Sullivan’s “subsistit in” as a Legitimate Recognition of other Churches and Ecclesial Communities	126
3.1.2	The Church as Communion	131

3.1.2.1	The Name Church as an Indicative Sign of Communion	133
3.1.2.2	Sullivan's Understanding of Communion as the Theology of the Second Vatican Council	135
3.1.2.3	Sullivan's Understanding of Unity in Diversity as Constitutive Component of Communion	140
3.2	The Holiness of the Church	142
3.2.1	The Biblical Idea of Holiness	143
3.2.2	Holiness of the Church as a Consequence of the Nature of the Church as a Mystery	144
3.2.3	The Qualification of the Holiness of the Church	146
3.2.3.1	The Church is Indefectibly Holy	147
3.2.3.2	The Church is Imperfectly Holy	152
3.3	The Catholicity of the Church	154
3.3.1	Sullivan's Understanding of the Term "Catholic"	155
3.3.2	Sullivan's Distinction between Catholicity and Catholicism	157
3.3.3	Sullivan's Elaboration on the "Gift" and "Task" Nature of Catholicity	159
3.3.4	The Implication of the Catholicity of the Catholic Church	162
3.3.5	Catholicity vis-à-vis the Doctrine, "Outside the Church there is no Salvation"	164
3.3.5.1	The Thesis: "extra ecclesiam nulla salus"	165
3.3.6	The Church as the Universal Sacrament of Salvation	170
3.4	The Apostolicity of the Church	174
3.4.1	The Apostolic Origin of Episcopal Ministry	176
3.4.1.1	Sullivan's Appreciation of Apostolic Succession	180
3.4.2	The Bishops as the Bearers of the Pastoral Teaching Office	183
3.4.2.1	The Magisterium and the Centrality of the Word of God	184
3.4.2.2	The Magisterium and the Thesis of Infallibility	187
3.4.3	The Ecclesial Vocation of Theologians in the Church	189
3.4.3.1	A Complementary Relationship as an Ideal between the Magisterium of the Bishops and the Magisterium of the Theologians	192
	Concluding Remarks	194

Chapter Four: Nigeria and the Birth of Christianity	
within Her Geographical Confines	197
Introduction	197
4.1 The Highlights of Major Nigerian Tribes	197
4.1.1 The Yoruba: People, Religion and Worldview	199
4.1.2 The Hausa: People, Religion and Worldview	201
4.1.3 The Igbo: People, Religion and Worldview	203
4.1.4 Other Minor Ethnic Groups in Nigeria	207
4.2 The First Early Moments of Missionary Engagements	
in Nigeria	208
4.2.1 Early Missionary Expeditions in Nigeria	209
4.2.1.1 Factors Responsible for its Collapse/Failure	210
4.2.1.1.1 A Blurred Missionary Vision	210
4.2.1.1.2 A False Presumption of the	
People's Cultural Beliefs and	
Politico-religious Structure	212
4.2.1.1.3 Absence of a Holistic Approach	
to Missionary Engagement	213
4.3 The Second Moment of Missionary Engagements in Nigeria	214
4.3.1 Ideological Missionary Presuppositions of	
African Image	215
4.3.2 The Protestant Missionary Action in Nigeria	218
4.3.2.1 The South-Eastern Nigerian Case	220
4.3.2.2 Some Evangelical Applause in the Method	
of Protestant Missionary Engagement	223
4.3.2.2.1 The Participation of the Indigenes	
in the Evangelization Drama	224
4.3.2.2.2 A Qualitative Response to the	
Fundamental Needs of the	
Evangelized as a Person	226
4.3.2.3 Some Evangelical Flaws in the Method	
of the Protestant Missionary Engagement	228
4.3.2.3.1 A Conscious Display of Self as	
the Ideal of Christian Action	228
4.3.2.3.2 An Unhealthy Romance with	
the European Commercial Agents	
in the Evangelization Work	229
4.3.2.3.3 The Initial Missionary Complacency	232

4.3.3	The Historical Episode of the Catholic Mission in Nigeria	233
4.3.3.1	Sketchy tit-bits of Early Missionary Action in Southern Nigeria	234
4.3.3.2	Sketchy tit-bits of Early Missionary Action in Northern Nigeria	237
4.3.3.3	Sketchy tit-bits of Early Missionary Action in Eastern Nigeria	240
4.3.3.4	The Missionary Methodology of the Catholic Missionaries	245
4.3.3.4.1	Enlightenment through Catechetical Instructions, School Apostolate and a Committed Engagement in Religious Activities	246
4.3.3.4.2	Evangelical Methodology of Formal Education	247
4.3.3.4.3	A Qualitative Response to the Fundamental Needs of the Evangelized as a Person	249
4.3.3.4.3.1	Charitable Works	251
4.3.3.4.3.2	Rehabilitation Homes/Christian Village ...	252
4.3.3.4.3.3	Hospitals and Maternity Homes	254
4.3.3.4.3.4	Workshops and Other Homes of Formation	257
4.3.3.4.3.5	Buying and Freeing of Slaves	259
4.3.4	Some Evangelical Flaws in the Method of Catholic Missionary Engagement	261
4.3.4.1	A Dichotomisation of the African Person	262
4.3.4.2	A Late Involvement of the Indigenes in the Evangelization Work	264
4.4	The Dark Moments of the Evangelization History	266
4.4.1	Interior Dimension of the Dark Moment	266
4.4.1.1	The Negative Effects of Being a National Church	267

4.4.1.2	Insensitivity to the Feelings of the Local People	269
4.4.1.3	A Politically Motivated Expulsion of the Sierra Leonean 'Indigenous' Evangelizers	272
4.4.2	The Exterior Dimension of the Missionary Dark Moments	277
4.4.2.1	Christian Missions at War	277
4.4.2.2	The Mission of Double Standard and of Division	280
4.5	Consequences of the Early Rivalry among the Different Denominations	285
4.5.1	Separation and Division among Brothers and Sisters	285
4.5.2	The Birth of African Independent Churches	288
4.5.3	The Growth and Effect of Pentecostalism	291
4.5.4	A Sketchy List of Church Communities in Nigeria	293
	Concluding Remarks	302
Chapter Five: Ecumenism, the Church in Nigeria and the Ecumenical Option of Sullivan's Four Marks of the Church		303
	Introduction	303
5.1	Understanding Ecumenism	303
5.1.1	The Term Ecumenism	303
5.1.2	The Birth of Ecumenical Movement	306
5.1.3	The Ecumenical Movement among Non-Catholics	308
5.1.3.1	The International Missionary Conference: Edinburgh 1910 (IMC)	309
5.1.3.2	The Faith and Order Movement	310
5.1.3.3	The Life and Work Movement	313
5.1.3.4	The World Council of Churches	314
5.1.4	The Catholic Church and the Ecumenical Movement	317
5.1.4.1	The Pre-Vatican II Ecumenical Initiations	318
5.1.4.2	Ecumenism and the Vatican II Council	322
5.1.4.3	Post-Vatican II Ecumenical Initiations	326
5.2	Ecumenism and the Church in Nigeria	333
5.2.1	The Birth of Ecumenical Initiatives in Nigeria	333
5.2.2	Factors Responsible for the Ecumenical Consciousness	337
5.2.2.1	External Factors	337
5.2.2.2	The Internal Factors	340
5.2.3	Remarkable Ecumenical Efforts in Display in the Church in Nigeria	343
5.2.3.1	Northern Christian Association (NCA)	344

5.2.3.2	Christian Council of Nigeria (CCN)	345
5.2.3.3	Evangelical Church of West Africa ECWA/Tarayya Ekklesiyayin Kristi a Nigeria (TEKAN)	346
5.2.3.4	The Christian Pentecostal Fellowship of Nigeria (CPFN)/Pentecostal Fellowship of Nigeria (PFN)	346
5.2.3.5	Organisation of African Instituted Churches (OAIC)	347
5.2.3.6	Christian Health Association of Nigeria (CHAN)	347
5.2.3.7	The Christian Association of Nigeria (CAN)	349
5.2.3.7.1	The Bible Society of Nigeria	352
5.2.3.7.2	The Establishment of the National Ecumenical Centre	352
5.2.3.7.3	The Declaration of Joint Statements	353
5.2.3.7.4	Joint Christian Media Services	353
5.2.3.7.5	Joint Church Unity Octave	353
5.2.3.7.6	Joint Advancement of Christian Education	354
5.2.4	Christian Unity in Nigeria and its Antecedent Problems	354
5.2.4.1	Internally Constituted Problems (The Churches Themselves)	355
5.2.4.2	Externally Constituted Problems (The Government)	358
5.2.5	Other Obstacles on the Road to a Sustainable Ecumenical Engagement in the Nigerian Church	360
5.2.6	Successes and Failures of Ecumenical Engagements in Nigeria	362
5.3	The Ecumenical Application of Sullivan's Ecclesiological Elucidation of the Marks of the Church in Nigeria	366
5.3.1	The Profession of Oneness	367
5.3.1.1	Understanding the One Church of Christ as a Communion of Churches	367
5.3.2	Understanding Communion as Sharing the Same Faith, the same Gospel Message and Fraternal Love	372
5.3.3	Understanding Legitimate Diversity as an Intrinsic Constituent of Communion	374

5.3.4	The Profession of Holiness	377
5.3.4.1	Understanding Holiness as a Gift and a Task	378
5.3.4.2	Consequences of the Profession of Holiness	380
5.3.4.3	The Demands of the Profession of Holiness	383
5.3.5	The Profession of Catholicity	385
5.3.5.1	The Relational Quality of Catholicity	385
5.3.5.2	Understanding Legitimate Diversity as an Intrinsic Constituent of Catholicity	387
5.3.5.3	Understanding Catholicity as a Motive for Evangelization	388
5.3.6	The Profession of Apostolicity	391
5.3.6.1	The Bishops as Agents of Ecumenical Realization	392
5.3.6.2	The Theologians and Teachers of Faith as Agents of Ecumenical Realization	396
5.3.6.3	Understanding Apostolicity as a Motive for Evangelization	400
5.3.7	Using the Four Marks of the Church as Veritable Instruments of Ecumenical Dialogue	402
5.3.8	The Missionary Mandate of the Four Marks of the Church	405
	Concluding Remarks	408
	General Evaluation and Conclusion	411
	Bibliography	425
	Primary Sources	425
	Archival Sources	439
	Other Sources	440