Gacaca Courts versus the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda and National Courts

Lessons to Learn from the Rwandan Justice Approaches to Genocide

von
Dr. Charity Wibabara

1. Auflage

Nomos Baden-Baden 2014

Verlag C.H. Beck im Internet:
www.beck.de
ISBN 978 3 8487 1247 2
Gacaca Courts versus the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda and National Courts

Lessons to Learn from the Rwandan Justice Approaches to Genocide

Charity Wibabara

Schriften zum Internationalen und Europäischen Strafrecht

Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft

Sämplfli Verlag

ISBN 978-3-8487-1247-2

ISBN 978-3-7272-7744-3
Schriften zum Internationalen und Europäischen Strafrecht

Edited by

Professor Dr. Martin Heger, Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin
Professor Dr. Florian Jeßberger, Universität Hamburg
Professor Dr. Frank Neubacher, M.A., Universität zu Köln
Professor Dr. Helmut Satzger, LMU München
Professor Dr. Gerhard Werle, Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin

Vol. 13
This project was supported by the German Academic Exchange Service/Deutschen Akademischen Austauschdienst (DAAD).

Die Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data is available in the Internet at http://dnb.d-nb.de

a.t.: Kapstadt (South Africa)/Berlin (Germany), South African-German Centre for Transnational Criminal Justice, Faculty of Law of the University of the Western Cape in cooperation with the Faculty of Law of Humboldt-University zu Berlin, Diss., 2013

978-3-7272-7744-3 (Stämpfli Verlag, Bern)
ePDF 978-3-8452-5360-2

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data
A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.


Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data
Wibabara, Charity
Gacaca Courts versus the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda and National Courts
Lessons to Learn from the Rwandan Justice Approaches to Genocide
Charity Wibabara
298 p.
Includes bibliographic references.

ISBN 978-3-8487-1247-2

1. Edition 2014
© Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft, Baden-Baden, Germany 2014. Printed and bound in Germany.

This work is subject to copyright. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, re-cording, or any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publishers. Under § 54 of the German Copyright Law where copies are made for other than private use a fee is payable to “Verwertungsgesellschaft Wort”, Munich.

No responsibility for loss caused to any individual or organization acting on or refraining from action as a result of the material in this publication can be accepted by Nomos or the autor(s)/editor(s).
Table of Contents

List of Abbreviations 13

Abstract 17

Chapter One: General Introduction of the Study 19
A. Background of the Study 19
B. Statement of the Problem 21
C. Objectives of the Study 22
D. Significance of the Study 23
E. Methodological Approach 23
F. Scope of the Study 24
G. Definitions of Concepts used within the Chapters 25

Chapter Two: Historical Background to the Internecine Conflict in Rwanda 28
A. Introduction 28
B. Pre-Colonial Accounts of Rwandan History 29
   I. Origin of the Twa, Hutu and Tutsi 29
   II. The Relationship between Tutsi and Hutu 32
C. The Colonial Period 36
   I. The German Colonial Rule 36
   II. The Belgian Colonial Rule 39
   III. The Fall of the Tutsi Monarchy 42
D. Post-Colonial Period 46
   I. The First Republic 46
   II. The Second Republic 48
E. Formation of the Rwandese Patriotic Front (RPF) 50
F. The Genocide Period 53
# Table of Contents

Chapter Three: The Legacy of the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Introduction</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Generalities about the Tribunal</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Genesis of the ICTR</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Legal Basis of the ICTR</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Organization of the Tribunal</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Relationship between Rwanda and the Tribunal</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Status of the ICTR Cases</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Analysis of Important Jurisprudence before the ICTR</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Prosecutor versus Akayesu</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Prosecutor versus Kayishema</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Prosecutor versus Kambanda</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Prosecutor versus Nahimana, Barayagwiza and Ngeze</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Prosecutor versus Ntagerura, Bagambiki, and Imanishimwe</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI. Prosecutor versus Colonel Bagosora</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII. Prosecutor versus Nyiramasuhuko</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Achievements of the Tribunal</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Development of International Criminal Law</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Accountability for Leaders</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Creation of a Historical Record</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. Major Shortcomings of the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Delayed Justice</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Location of the ICTR</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Limited Impact on Rwanda</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chapter Four: Prosecution of Genocide in National Courts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Introduction</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Generalities on Rwanda National Courts</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Genesis of Genocide Prosecutions</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Organisation of Ordinary Courts</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Reparations</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Status of Case Law within the Ordinary Court System</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table of Contents

D. Analysis of the National Court Case Law  114
   I. Prosecutor versus Captain Twagiramungu  118
   II. Prosecution versus Private Gataza  120
   III. Prosecutor versus Corporal Gatorano  123
   IV. Prosecutor versus Major Nyirahazimana and Pasteur Ngitinshuti  124
   V. Prosecutor versus Harelimana et al.  127
   VI. Prosecutor versus Nzirabatinyi  128
   VII. Prosecutor versus Nzisabira  130
   VIII. Prosecutor versus Pandasi, Bugeri and Nzajyibwami  132
   IX. Prosecutor versus Rurangirwa, Bimenyimana, and Ntwangaheza  133
   X. Prosecutor versus Sibomana  135
E. Achievements of National Court Trials  138
F. Major Shortcomings of Domestic Prosecutions  142
   I. Congested Prisons and Insufficient Infrastructure  142
   II. Violation of Fair Trial Rights  145
      1. The Right to Speedy Trial  145
      2. The Principle of Presumption of Innocence  146
      3. The Right to Counsel of One's Choice  147
G. Excursus: Prosecution of Genocide Suspects by Third States  150
   I. Extradition Matters  150
   II. Third State Prosecutions: Case of Rwabukombe in Germany  154

Chapter Five: The Traditional Gacaca Court System  160
A. Introduction  160
B. Generalities on Grassroot Courts  161
   I. The Evolution of Gacaca Courts  162
   II. Traditional Roots of Gacaca  164
   III. Legal Basis of Gacaca Courts  167
   IV. A Standard Gacaca Trial  173
C. Status of Gacaca Case Law  175
D. Analysis of the Gacaca Case Law  176
   1. Detailed Assessment of the above 16 Case Law  180
Table of Contents

E. The Nature of Gacaca Courts: Are they Retributive or Restorative? 191
   I. Aims of Gacaca Courts 195
   II. Sentences 196
   III. Stakeholders 197
   IV. Evaluation 198
F. Achievements of Gacaca Courts 199
   I. Speedy Justice 199
   II. Reconciliatory Mechanism 201
   III. Affordable Justice 204
   IV. Enhancement of Local Transitional Justice Approaches 204
G. Shortcomings of Gacaca Courts 205
   I. Lack of Legal Representation 206
   II. Absence of Reparations 207
   III. Inadequate Protection of Witnesses 209
   IV. Corruption within the System 210
   V. Instability of Gacaca Laws 211
   VI. Non-Prosecution of all Crimes 212
   VII. Interim Remarks 214

Chapter Six: A Critical Analysis of the Relationship between the ICTR, National Courts and Gacaca Courts 216
A. Introduction 216
B. Jurisdictional Relationship 217
C. Disparities among the Different Approaches 220
   I. Right to Legal Counsel 222
   II. Right to Silence 223
   III. Right to be tried without Undue Delay 224
   IV. Jurisdiction Disparities 226
   V. Discrepancy in Sentences 228
   VI. Unequal Detention Facilities 230
D. The Contribution of Different Trials to Reconciliation 232
   I. Meaning of Reconciliation 233
   II. The ICTR, National Courts and Gacaca Contribution to Reconciliation 236
      1. Official Acknowledgement of the Crimes 236
      2. Individualization of Guilt 240
### Table of Contents

3. Truth 244
   a) Personal and Narrative Truth 245
   b) Factual and Forensic Truth 247

III. Interim Conclusion 249

Chapter Seven: General Conclusions 252

A. General Conclusions 252

B. Overall Concluding Remarks and Optimal Approach 257

Bibliography 263