

Biju Mathew (Fr Dhanyananda Oozhikattu MSJ)

The Role of the Petrine Ministry in the Ecumenical Relationship between the Malankara Orthodox Syrian Church and the Catholic Church



PETER LANG
EDITION

Table of Contents

General Introduction	15
List of Abbreviations	21
Part 1	
The Position of the Malankara Orthodox Syrian Church on Ecclesiology in her ecumenical Relationship with the Catholic Church.....	23
Chapter 1: The Ecclesiology of the Church of St Thomas	
Christians in the pre-Portuguese period	27
1.1 The Areas of Agreement with the Catholic Church.....	27
1.1.1 The Origin of the Church of St Thomas Christians	28
1.1.2 The Faith and Practice of the Church of St Thomas Christians	38
1.1.3 The Absence of Division in the Church of St Thomas Christians till the Arrival of the Portuguese Missionaries	41
1.1.4 The alleged Antiochian Relation of the Church of St Thomas Christians	44
1.1.5 The hierarchical Relation and ecclesial Affinity with the Church of the East: No Obstacle to the Identity and administrative Autonomy in the Church of St Thomas Christians	50
1.1.6 <i>Mar Thoma Margam</i> (the Way of Thomas): the ecclesial Patrimony of the Church of St Thomas Christians	63
1.1.6.1 The Development of the indigenous ecclesial Identity of the St Thomas Christians	65
1.1.6.2 The Development of the advanced Ecclesial Identity through the East Syrian Influence	67
1.1.6.2.1 The three Levels of hierarchical Structure	68
1.1.6.2.1.1 The local Level: <i>Palliyogam</i>	69
1.1.6.2.1.2 The Community Level: The Archdeacon of All India	71

1.1.6.2.1.3	The hierarchical Level: The Metropolitan of All India and the Holy See of St Thomas.....	76
1.2	The Areas of Disagreement with the Catholic Church	80
1.2.1	The Alexandrian ecclesial Relationship of the Church of St Thomas Christians.....	80
1.2.2	The alleged Communion of the Church of St Thomas Christians with the Roman Catholic Church in the pre-Portuguese Period	84
	Conclusion	91
Chapter 2: The Division within the Church of St Thomas Christians after the Arrival of the Portuguese Missionaries		
2.1	The Synod of Diamper (1599).....	93
2.2	The Coonan-Cross Oath (1653)	98
	Conclusion	105
Chapter 3: The Ecclesiology of the Malankara Orthodox Syrian Church		
3.1	The Nature of the Church.....	108
3.1.1	The Origin of the Church	108
3.1.2	The Church in the Pauline Letters	110
3.1.3	The Church and the Apostolic College	111
3.1.4	The pneumatological Dimension of the Malankara Ecclesiology ..	112
3.1.5	The Church: various biblical Images	114
3.1.6	The Church is One.....	119
3.1.7	The Church is Holy.....	121
3.1.8	The Church is Catholic.....	122
3.1.9	The Church is Apostolic.....	126
3.1.10	The Church and the Authority of Christ	127
3.1.11	The Authority of the Church	129
3.2	The Structure of the Church.....	130
3.3	The Catholicos cum Malankara Metropolitan.....	134
3.4	The Episcopate	138
3.5	The Patriarch	144
3.6	The Primacy on the Universal Level from the Perspective of the Malankara Orthodox Syrian Church.....	147
	Conclusion	152

Chapter 4: The Position of the Malankara Orthodox Syrian Church on the Question of the Jurisdictional Papal Primacy of the Catholic Church	153
4.1 The Lack of the biblical Foundation for the Jurisdictional Papal Primacy.....	153
4.2 The Primacy of the Church of Rome because of Rome as the Imperial Capital	159
4.3 No Jurisdictional Primacy, but only the Primacy of Honor of the Bishop of Rome at the Time of the Ecumenical Councils	164
4.4 The Universal Jurisdictional Papal Primacy of the Bishop of Rome: A Medieval Western Fabrication	173
Conclusion	175
Part 2	
The Primacy in the View of the Catholic Church	177
Chapter 1: The Arguments of the Catholic Church in answer to the Objections of the MOSC against the Papal Primacy	179
1.1 The Biblical Foundation of the Primacy of the Bishop of Rome	180
1.2 The Primacy of the Church of Rome because of the Petrine Succession and the Apostolicity	189
1.2.1 The religious and spiritual Significance of the Roman Church	193
1.2.1.1 The Letter of Clement	194
1.2.1.2 The Letter of Bishop Dionysius of Corinth.....	195
1.2.1.3 The Letter of Ignatius of Antioch	196
1.2.1.4 Irenaeus of Lyon	196
1.2.2 The Sense of Responsibility of the Roman Church for the whole Church.....	197
1.2.3 The Claim of the Bishop of Rome to be the Successor to Peter with Reference to Mt 16, 18	198
1.2.4 Rome as the Centre of Communio.....	199
1.3 The Primacy of the Bishop of Rome: Not mere Primacy of Honour at the Time of the early Ecumenical Councils	202
1.3.1 Leo the Great and his Contribution to the Concept of the Jurisdictional Papal Primacy	208
1.3.2 Symmachian Forgeries	211

1.4	The Universal Jurisdictional Papal Primacy of the Bishop of Rome: No medieval western Fabrication, but the Result of a gradual Growth	212
1.4.1	Gregory the Great (590–604)	213
1.4.2	The Pentarchy	214
1.4.3	The Pseudo-Isidorian False Decretals (850).....	217
1.4.4	The Donation of Constantine.....	219
1.4.5	Jurisdictional Papal Primacy: Solution to the Problems and the Conflicts of the Second Millennium	220
1.4.5.1	Pope Gregory VII (1073–1085).....	222
1.4.5.2	Innocent III (1198–1216).....	225
1.4.5.3	Innocent IV (1243–1254).....	227
1.4.5.4	The Decline of the Papacy and the Revival of Conciliarism	228
1.4.5.5	The Reformation and the post-Trent Period	230
1.4.5.6	Gallicanism	231
1.4.5.7	The German Imperial Church Episcopalism and the judicial Powers of Nuncios	232
1.4.5.8	The French Revolution (1789) and the Papacy	233
1.4.5.9	The Ultramontanism and the Papacy	234
	Conclusion	235
	Chapter 2: The Petrine Ministry in Vatican I and Vatican II.....	237
2.1	The Petrine Ministry in Vatican I.....	237
2.1.1	The historical Background of Vatican I	238
2.1.2	The Polarization of the Council Fathers into the Minority and the Majority Camps	243
2.1.3	The Document on the Church »Pastor aeternus«	245
2.1.3.1	The Principle of the papal jurisdictional Primacy	247
2.1.3.2	The Principle of the papal Infallibility.....	250
2.2	The Petrine Ministry in Vatican II	256
2.2.1	<i>Lumen Gentium</i> and the Petrine Ministry	257
2.2.1.1	The Catholic Church in Relation to the Petrine Ministry of the Bishop of Rome.....	258
2.2.1.2	The Nature of the Petrine Ministry of the Bishop of Rome.....	259
2.2.1.3	The Episcopacy in Relation to the Petrine Ministry of the Bishop of Rome.....	260
2.2.2	<i>Orientalium Ecclesiarum</i> and the Petrine Ministry.....	265

2.2.2.1	The historical Background of the Document <i>Orientalium Ecclesiarum</i>	265
2.2.2.2	The Petrine Ministry of the Bishop of Rome in Relation to the Individual Churches.....	266
2.2.3	<i>Unitatis Redintegratio</i> and the Petrine Ministry.....	267
2.2.3.1	The historical Background of the Document <i>Unitatis Redintegratio</i>	267
2.2.3.2	The Unity of the Christians in Relation to the Petrine Ministry of the Bishop of Rome.....	267
2.2.4	<i>Christus Dominus</i> and the Petrine Ministry	268
2.2.4.1	The Episcopacy in Relation to the Petrine Ministry of the Bishop of Rome	269
Conclusion		271
Chapter 3: The Post-Vatican Pronouncements of the Catholic Church concerning the Petrine Ministry.....		273
3.1	Encyclicals and Apostolic Letters.....	273
3.1.1	The Apostolic Letter <i>A Concilio Constantinopolitano I</i> (1981).....	273
3.1.2	The Final Report of the 1985 Extraordinary Synod.....	274
3.1.3	Apostolic Constitution <i>Pastor Bonus</i> (1988).....	274
3.1.4	The Apostolic Letter <i>Tertio Millennio Adveniente</i> (1994).....	278
3.1.5	The Apostolic Letter <i>Orientalis Lumen</i> (1995)	279
3.1.6	<i>Ut unum sint</i> (1995)	282
3.1.7	The Apostolic Constitution <i>Universi Dominici Gregis</i> (1996).....	288
3.1.8	The Apostolic Letter <i>Motu proprio Ad Tuendam fidem</i> (1998)	289
3.1.9	The Apostolic Letter <i>Motu proprio Apostolos Suos</i> (1998).....	290
3.1.10	The post-synodal Apostolic Exhortation <i>Ecclesia in America</i> (1999).....	291
3.1.11	The post-synodal Apostolic Exhortation <i>Ecclesia in Asia</i> (1999).....	292
3.1.12	Apostolic Letter <i>Novo Millennio Ineunte</i> (2000).....	293
3.1.13	The post-synodal Apostolic Letter <i>Ecclesia in Europa</i> (2003)	293
3.1.14	The post-synodal Apostolic Letter <i>Pastores Gregis</i> (2003)	294
3.1.15	Apostolic Constitution <i>Anglicanorum Coetibus</i> (2009).....	297
3.2	The Common Declarations of the Pope and the Ecumenical Patriarch	297
3.2.1	The Common Declaration of Pope Paul VI and the Ecumenical Patriarch Athenagoras I (1967)	297
3.2.2	The Common Declaration of Pope John Paul II and the Ecumenical Patriarch Bartholomew I of Constantinople (2004) ...	298

3.2.3	The Common Declaration of Pope Benedict XVI and the Ecumenical Patriarch Bartholomew I (2006)	299
3.3	Documents of the Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith.....	299
3.3.1	Letter to the Bishops of the Catholic Church on some Aspects of the Church understood as Communion (1992)	299
3.3.2	The Note on the Expression »Sister Churches« (2000).....	301
3.4	Directory for the Application of Principles and Norms on Ecumenism.....	303
3.5	The Petrine Ministry of the Bishop of Rome in CCEO (1990).....	303
	Conclusion	311

Part 3

	The Chances for an extensive Rapprochement between the Positions of the Malankara Orthodox Syrian Church and the Catholic Church on the Petrine Ministry	313
--	--	-----

Chapter 1:	The Council Document <i>Orientalium Ecclesiarum</i> with regard to the Catholic Oriental Churches: Theory and Practice	315
1.1	The positive and negative Aspects of the Document OE	315
1.2	The State of the Syro Malabar Church in the Light of the Document OE.....	320
1.2.1	The All-India Jurisdiction of the Father and Head of the Syro Malabar Church	320
1.2.2	The Pastoral Care of the Migrants of the Syro Malabar Church .	322
1.2.3	The universal Scope for the Missionary Enterprise.....	324
1.2.4	The Restoration of the ancient Heritage of the St Thomas Christians.....	326
1.2.4.1	The Restoration of the Liturgy.....	326
1.2.4.2	The Restoration of the <i>Palliyogam</i>	328
1.2.4.3	The Restoration of the Office of the Archdeacon	329
1.2.4.4	The Restoration of the Permanent Diaconate.....	330
1.2.4.5	The Restoration of the proper Name of the Syro Malabar Church.....	330
1.2.5	The Patriarchal Status of the Syro Malabar Church	332
1.2.6	The Petrine Ministry of the Bishop of Rome: Part of the Catholic Faith of the Syro Malabar Church	334
	Conclusion	336

Chapter 2: The Petrine Ministry in the Wake of the new Suggestions of the different Non-official Institutions of Dialogue from all over the World	339
2.1 Ecumenical Foundation <i>Pro Oriente</i>	339
2.1.1 The five non-official Ecumenical Consultations	340
2.1.1.1 Communiqué: the second Ecumenical Consultation (1973)	340
2.1.1.2 Communiqué: the third Ecumenical Consultation (1976)	341
2.1.1.3 Communiqué: the fourth Ecumenical Consultation (1978)	342
2.1.1.4 Communiqué: the fifth Ecumenical Consultation (1988)	345
2.1.2 The Study Seminars	346
2.1.2.1 The first Study Seminar 1991: Primat	346
2.1.2.2 The second Study Seminar 1992: Councils and Conciliarity	347
2.1.2.3 The third Study Seminar 1994: Ecclesiology	349
2.2 Saint Irenaeus Joint Orthodox-Catholic Working Group.....	349
2.2.1 Communiqué-Chevetogne (2006)	350
2.2.2 Communiqué-Belgrade (2007)	351
2.2.3 Communiqué-Vienna (2008).....	352
2.2.4 Communiqué-Kiev (2009)	353
2.2.5 Communiqué – Magdeburg (2010).....	355
2.2.6 Communiqué – Petersburg (2011)	357
2.3 The Bensheim Institute for Inter-Confessional Research.....	358
2.3.1 The Concept of Petrine Ministry according to the Evangelical Church in Germany.....	359
2.4 The North American Orthodox-Catholic Theological Consultation	360
2.4.1 An Agreed Statement on the Church (1974)	361
2.4.2 Apostolicity as God's Gift in the Life of the Church (1986)	361
2.4.3 An Agreed Statement on Conciliarity and Primacy in the Church (1989)	362
2.4.4 A Common Response to the Joint International Commission for the Theological Dialogue between the Roman Catholic Church and the Orthodox Church regarding the Ravenna Document: "Ecclesiological and canonical Consequences of the sacramental Nature of the Church: ecclesial Communion, Conciliarity and Authority" (2009)	363

2.4.5 Steps towards a Reunited Church: A Sketch of an Orthodox-Catholic Vision for the Future (2010)	364
Conclusion	370
 Chapter 3: Suggestions for a possible ecumenical Rapprochement between the Malankara Orthodox Syrian Church and the Catholic Church on the Point of the Petrine Ministry	371
3.1 The Erection of a triadic Structure for the Catholic Church in Accordance with the Communion Ecclesiology.....	378
3.2 The Erection of a permanent Synod for the Catholic Church.....	382
3.3 The Constitution of a new Electoral College for the Election of the Head of the Catholic Church.....	382
3.4 The Convocation of a particular Synod of the Bishops of the Catholic Oriental Churches for Deliberations on the Role of the Petrine Ministry in the Catholic Church.....	384
3.5 The Need for the Catholic Church to give sufficient theological Reasons for the Absence of the Title “Patriarch of the West” in <i>Annuario Pontificio</i> 2006.....	385
3.6 The Enlargement of the Fields of practical Co-operation.....	389
Conclusion	389
 General Conclusion	391
 Bibliography	417