# TABLE OF CONTENTS

*Preface*  
Table of Cases  
Table of Statutes  
Table of Abbreviations

### 1. The Social and Legal Background  
#### I. Introduction  
1. The Treatment Context  
2. The Regulation of Medical Practice  
#### II. The Framework of Private Law  
1. Comparative Background  
2. Medical Malpractice in Tort and Contract  
   (a) England: The Primacy of Tort  
   (b) Germany: The Primacy of Contract  
#### III. The Scope of the Patient’s Protected Interests  
1. The Position in England  
   (a) Bodily Integrity and Health  
   (b) Other Interests  
2. The Position in Germany  
   (a) Bodily Integrity and Health  
   (b) Other Interests  
#### IV. Preliminary Conclusions and Following Structure

### 2. Treatment Malpractice—The Substantive Law  
#### I. Introduction  
#### II. Establishing Malpractice  
1. A Fault-Based Approach to Liability  
   (a) England: Negligence Liability  
   (b) Germany: Negligent Breach of Contract  
2. The Standard of Care Expected of the Doctor  
   (a) England: The Reasonably Skilled Practitioner  
   (b) Germany: Required Care Under § 276 II BGB  
3. Establishing Lack of Care: The Role of Accepted Practice  
   (a) England: The *Bolam* Test  
   (b) Germany: A Stricter Approach
III. Causation of Damage 46
   1. Factual Causation 46
      (a) England: The ‘But For’ Test 47
      (b) Germany: The Condicio Sine Qua Non formula 49
   2. Legal Causation/Remoteness of Damage 51
      (a) England: The Reasonable Foreseeability Test 52
      (b) Germany: Adäquate Kausalzusammenhang and Schutzzweck 54
IV. Comparative Assessment 57

III. Treatment Malpractice—Proof Issues 61
   I. Introduction 61
   II. The General Approach to Proof 62
      1. England: An Adversarial System 63
      2. Germany: An Inquisitorial System 64
   III. Modifying the Normal Proof Rules to Assist the Patient? 67
      1. Establishing the Primary Facts 67
         (a) England: Inferences from the Information Available 68
         (b) Germany: Presumptions in Cases of Missing Records 68
      2. Inferring Malpractice from the Occurrence of Injury 70
         (a) England: Res Ipsa Loquitur 70
         (b) The Position in Germany 73
            (i) Anscheinsbeweis 73
            (ii) Fully Masterable Risks 74
      3. Dealing with Problems of Causal Uncertainty 76
         (a) The Position in England 77
            (i) Keeping the Burden on the Patient 77
            (ii) The Rejection of Claims for ‘Loss of Chance’ 79
         (b) The Position in Germany 84
            (i) Proof Relaxations in Cases of ‘Secondary Harm’ 84
            (ii) Proof Relaxations in Misdiagnosis Cases 86
            (iii) Reversals of Proof in Cases of ‘Gross’ Treatment Errors 87
IV. Comparative Assessment 92

IV. Disclosure Malpractice 95
   I. Introduction 95
   II. Consent and the Disclosure of Treatment Information 96
      1. England: Battery vs. Negligence 97
      2. Germany: A Unitary Approach 100
   III. The Required Standard of Disclosure 102
      1. England: From Accepted Practice to Informed Consent 102
      2. Germany: Beyond Informed Consent 107
   IV. Causation of Damage 113
      1. The Position in England 113
Table of Contents

(a) Factual causation 113
(b) Legal Causation 115

2. The Position in Germany
   (a) Legal Causation *(Schutzzweck der Norm)* 118
   (b) The Defence of Hypothetical Consent 120

V. Proof Issues 122
1. England: Parallels with Treatment Malpractice 122
2. Germany: A Distinct Framework 124

VI. Comparative Assessment 126

5. Reforming Medical Negligence Law 129

I. Introduction 129
II. Dissatisfaction with Private Law in Medical Injury Claims 130
   1. Criticisms of the Fault-Based Approach 130
   2. The No-Fault Option—the New Zealand and Swedish Models 133

III. Reform Initiatives in England and Germany 136
   1. Developments in England 136
      (a) Pearson and the General Rejection of No-Fault 136
      (b) Developments in the 1980s and 90s 139
      (c) Making Amends and the NHS Redress Act 2006 141
   2. Developments in Germany 144
      (a) The General Rejection of No-Fault 144
      (b) The System of Medical Arbitration Boards 146
      (c) Current Initiatives 148

IV. Comparative Assessment 150

6. Conclusions 155

Deutsche Zusammenfassung (German Summary) 165
Bibliography 171
Index 179